

Board of Control Chambers,
City Hall,

April 17th, 1914.

The Board of Control met this morning at 11.30 o'clock. Present His Worship the Mayor, and Controllers Harris, Hoben and Scanlan.

Walnut Street straightening
A delegation from the Halifax Properties, Ltd.

Engineer
appeared before the Board, asking that the City take steps for exchange of properties, whereby Walnut St. may be straightened. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Inspection of Drains

Engineer
Robert Daw appeared before the Board complaining of delay by the officials of the City Engineer's Department in the inspection of drains. The City Engineer claimed that persons opening drains should give at least a couple of hour's warning before they required drains inspected. Mr. Daw was informed that the Department would do all possible to expedite inspection.

Drainway Carrying Officials Free.

At the suggestion of the City Engineer, Controller Harris submits the following clause to be added to the memorandum to be submitted by the City to the Public Utilities Commission:

Council
12. Carrying certain civic officials (such as inspectors of drains, plumbing and electric wiring) free of charge on street cars when furnished with badge, and under same privileges as police and firemen when in uniform.

Market Building Stone

X Engineer
H. W. Cameron asked permission to take about twenty loads of stone from the material excavated from the site of the new market building. Permission

903 *Logos*

April 17th, 1914.

is granted.

Moving Barn Quinpool Road.

Read report City Engineer recommending that

I. C. Harrison be permitted to move a small barn from 125 Quinpool Road to 52 Preston St., provided he agrees that the building shall be used only as a barn after it is moved, and that he first obtain permission from the City Health Board. Approved.

Bliss Street Repairs

Read report City Engineer re Bliss St. repairs. Approved.

City Engineer's Office Staff

Read report City Engineer re City Engineer's office staff, as follows:-

City Engineer's Office,
Halifax, N. S.
Apr. 17th, 1914

CITY ENGINEER'S OFFICE STAFF?

His Worship the Mayor,
Sir:

I beg to report on the application from Mr. Wm. J. DeWolfe for employment on my staff. I do not require any additional assistance at present, and I do not expect to require an inspector to look after the City's interest on the new terminal works.

The indications are that we shall have a very busy year in the Department, and it is quite possible that we shall require additional assistance at some time during the summer, although not required in the winter.

I would respectfully ask again that this urgent need be recognized, and repeat a paragraph made in my report of Sept. 15th, 1913.

"It is the custom of other cities, especially in those which are growing rapidly, to employ an extra engineering staff during the summer, and discharge them when the work is completed at the end of the season. There is no difficulty in obtaining

904 6203

*Engineer
Sudby Health Board*

Engineer

April 17th, 1914

such men. I donot want to increase the engineering staff permanently by engaging more men than we can employ to advantage all the year round, but I would recommend that the Engineer have authority as in other cities, to employ such engineering assistance as he may need during the summer working season, at a rate not exceeding Five Dollars per day, no man employed under such authority to be continued on the work for more than nine months in any one calendar year. Such a system would prevent a permanent increase of the staff, and would leave permanent appointments in the hands of the Board of Control and City Council as at present. At the beginning of the season there are always applicants for employment - engineers who would be qualified for positions as assistants. Such system would be the same as we carry out now in the construction of a sewer or sidewalk, the foreman employing or discharging men as he requires."

F. W. W. Doane,

City Engineer.

The report is adopted, the City Engineer to report to the Controller in charge of the Works Department after every appointment made by him.

Building Moves Damaging Trees.

Read report City Engineer re damage to street trees by persons moving buildings. Referred to the City Solicitor to institute prosecutions if the City has a legal action.

Lower Water Street Light.

Read report City Engineer re electric light Lower Water St., between Morris and Fawson Streets.

Filed.

Ocean Terminals - Quinpool Road.

Read report City Engineer, Apr. 17th, 1914, re temporary diversion of Quinpool Road. (See minutes Board of Control, Mar. 23rd, 1914 re report City Engineer Mar. 21st, 1914.)

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Harris that the temporary diversion of Quinpool Rd. as proposed, be acquiesced in. Motion passed.

905 1904

Accounts

April 17th, 1914.

Read report Commissioners of Halifax Common recommending for payment accounts amounting to \$184.64, and report City Health Board, recommending for payment accounts amounting to \$373.94. Said accounts are passed for payment.

Council

S. J. Harrivel

Read letter S. J. Harrivel asking for certain information in respect to tax collections and a contingent fund. Referred to Controller Hoben, Acting Controller of Finance, for report.

Cont. Hoben

Police Motor Cycle

Controller Harris submits tenders for a motor-cycle for the Police Department. Said tenders being opened, are as follows:-

T. L. Connolly, "Pope Twin", Model L 14, \$325.00

Morton & Cragg, Harley Davidson, twin cycle, two speeds, \$350.00, without "two speeds", \$325.00

Hendee Manufacturing Co., "Indian", \$335.00

Chief of Police

The tenders are referred to the Chief of Police for report at Monday's meeting.

Works Dept - Cart - wheels.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Scanlan, that the Works Department purchase from Robinson Bros. one set of patent cart wheels. Motion passed.

Engineer

changing civic year financing City works in Spring - street funds.

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller Scanlan, that the matter of making arrangements for the providing of funds to carry on various Works Department services in the months of March and April be referred to Controller Scanlan, the City Engineer and the City Solicitor for report at Monday's meeting of the Board. Motion passed.

Scanlan
Engineer
Solicitor

Accounts

April 17th, 1914.

Controller Harris submits account John White & Co. against the City Prison, for grate bars, \$39. Said account is passed for payment.

SCHEDULE OF ACCOUNTS.

City Health Board

Maritime Tel. Co.	Phones, Mch.	\$10.37
Halifax Electric Tram.	Light for Hospital	11.13
Patrick Dowd	Repairs to Ambulance	2.00
R. E. Gannon	Truckage	1.50
E. Crease & Son	Groceries	1.00
Melvin & Co.	Hardware	2.72
T.C. Allen & Co.	Stationery	1.25
Kelley & Glassey	Brandy for Hospital	1.50
W. R. Nicholson	Drugs	2.00
J. F. Dempster	Board of Patients	65.70
T. H. Francis	Bedding for Hospital	50.40
Chas. R. Rosborough	Repairs at Infections Hospital	163.62
J. Howard	Conveyance of patients, Jan., Feb. & Mch.	60.75
		<u>\$373.94</u>

Public Gardens Commission

F. A. Shaw	Fodder	54.85
Wm. Robertson & Son	Hardware	2.60
Baldwin & Co.	Flower Pots	6.25
Halifax Electric Tram.	Light	29.61
R.B. Adams & Co.	Cabbages	4.60
T.C. Allen & Co.	Stationery	5.60
James Umlah	Posts	18.00
Longard Bros.	Plumbing	10.50
John McInnis & Son	Lumber	24.58
Kelly's Ltd.	Saddlery	12.40
Glenn & Brown	Tobacco Stems	2.79
Jas. D. Walsh	Alcohol, etc.	.70
Steele Briggs Seed Co.	Seeds	.90
M. F. Burns,	Plumbing	11.26
		<u>\$184.64</u>

The Board adjourned.

W. P. Powell
Deputy MAYOR
Powell

L. J. Monaghan
CITY CLERK

CITY PRISON INVESTIGATION.

City Hall.

Halifax, April 14, 1914.

Present: Messrs. Harris, Hoben, Hines, Powell,
Davison, Wier, Scanlan, and
The Mayor.

W. H. Handsley, examined.

In answer to the Mayor;

I have been a keeper at the prison for 11 months on the 21st of this month; I went there last May. I was there a very short time during the Murphy girl's time. I saw her two or three times. I think she went in July. I do not know anything about it at all.

Q. Do you know anything about young Grant's habits in the prison? A. Of course, he is in the prison some times. Brewer left before I went there. I have never seen Mac Donald guilty of any impropriety with the female prisoners. I worked with him 11 months and never saw anything wrong; he was my partner. I have never seen young Grant in the cookhouse all the time I have been there. He is pretty late coming home at night, he has a key. He comes home to tea I think about 5 or 6 o'clock; when we are getting the mens suppers ready. He goes out again about 7; he is in a couple of hours. I never heard of him getting in over the fence. I have never known of anyone getting over the fence since I have been there. I have let him in at the back gate between 5 and 6.

Q. Have you known him to get in by any other way except he comes in the front door. A. He comes in the front door with the big key; he can come in by the yard by the keepers unlocking the gate and letting him in. Young Grant has had no conversation with me about this case. Q. Does he make himself on friendly terms with the keepers. A. He generally passes the time of day and that is all. He does not make it a habit of chatting with the keepers in the prison. He has very little to say to the keepers. I have never seen him in the cookhouse since I have been there. He has his own bedroom opposite to where I sleep, on the other side of the landing. The biggest part of his time he is there. There are locks on the female corridor, and bolts and locks on the cells. Some of the locks have not been very good. They are getting worn out. They have been putting new locks around now. The place is all locked up so far as I know. I go the general round about 9 pm. sometimes before 9; and all is locked then.

Q. As far as you are aware, from your knowledge, is it possible for one of you underkeepers, or any of the Governor's family, or any male official in the building or any of his family, to have access to any of the female prisoners without it coming to the knowledge of the Governor. A. Well, of course, the keepers could get to the wards because we have the keys, until recently when new locks were put on and our keys won't fit these locks on the corridor doors. They have been changed and they could not easily be undone without the key.

Q. It has been said by Brewer and Mac Donald, it may be before your time, as you were not there during

APR 14 1914

Brewer's time, that these locks were no use, and could be very easily operated and opened without trouble. A. They were very bad entering the ward. One lock was all right. The keys were worn out. My key would not lock one. I had to get Mrs. Grant's. The locks were all right. It was the key that was wrong. I have a good key now; one that locks all. I knew it was wrong because my key would not lock it. Other keys would lock it and mine would not.

In answer to Controller Hoben.

I am sure the corridor doors leading to the womens cells have been locked every night since I have been there. Only one night I saw them unlocked. It was at 8.30, too early to go the round, and I saw they were not locked. The women are locked in at 6 o'clock unless they are working in the kitchen. The locks are put on the corridor doors at 6 and they should be locked then. Q. Why was it too early at 8.30? A. Because two women were working in the kitchen. That is not frequent; only at odd times. Sometimes all the women are not locked up. Mrs. Grant has women working in the kitchen after 6. This night at 8.30 I knew women were in the kitchen. She does not have them always; sometimes she has these women. They work until about 8.30; sometimes not so late. Q. Until these women go to their cells I suppose the corridor door is not locked? A. Not that night. They have always been locked at 9. I would not be around to see they were before that. That is, between 6 and 9. Q. Can you tell me what time Mrs. Grant comes on duty; what time she appears? A. About 7 o'clock. Q. And what time are the women unlocked? A. We don't unbolt the women until she does it at 7 o'clock; not as far as I know; at 7 o'clock, or not as early as that. Q. You mean to say the woman are locked in the cells from 6 at night until 7 in the morning? A. I do not go on the woman's side, not now. When I first went I rang the women up at 6; she would be around at 6.30; after she had time to get dressed. She came out after I rang the women. That was changed a good long time since; it has existed since the present governor came there; I do not know who was instrumental in making the change. The Governor told us not to unbolt; it must be nearly a year; about 9 months. I have been there nearly 11 months. This practically went on while the Murphy girl was there until after she left. I heard rumours of the Murphy girl being in the family way; I had reasonable grounds to believe she was in trouble. There was nothing said about it; MacDonald passed a remark in the room; that was all. Q. Was the general feeling about the time she left that she got in that way in the prison? A. No, Sir. I did not hear any talk about it. Q. Did you ever have any improper relations with the girl up there? A. No; I have been bit once. I am a married man, respectable and was with Dr. Silver's in Morris Street. Q. Were you ever down the furnace room with your arm around a girl. A. No, Sir. Q. There was a rumour which made you resign? A. Riley passed a remark about two girls and I felt cross and reported it to the Governor; I said, I may just as well hand in my keys, I have tried to do my duty straight forward and have not misconducted myself except the two girls. Young Grant comes in late at night sometimes; I could not say what time because we go to bed when on night duty; when I am not on duty I stay with my wife.

Sometimes it is 10.30 when we go to bed; never as late as 12. We have to get up at 5; I never got up to let Grant in by the back way. I have no knowledge of his coming in the back way. I don't see him to know what time he comes in; I never see him. He never wakes me up any time coming in. He sleeps on the opposite side of the same ~~walk~~ flat; I used to sleep right at the top at first.

Q. Is the next boy around a good deal? A. At odd times he would meet me and I have a key; that is the next boy. There are only two keys and the keepers have one; I would make arrangements to meet the boy and he goes home with me and we go straight to our rooms and to bed. Q. Did you ever hear the boys say they would like to have a piece of the Murphy girl? A. I have never heard them. I never heard Walter Grant make any reference to the Murphy girl. I have never heard him speak about it. I noticed that she had gone, that was all I knew of it. I was only there a month. I did not see her more than two or three times. I do not know who took her away. I remember seeing her dressed on the stairs. I think she went out the front way. I open the gate for all who come the back way. I do not know who drove her to the station. I do not think it was the prison team. I have seen no misconduct around the prison. The prison is properly run as far as I know. I do not know about anything except the Murphy girl. There is no chance of familiarity between the men and women. There are too many about. You could not do anything like that around there. I am satisfied that nothing like that could happen around there. I don't know whether the Murphy girl's happened there or not. If it happened there must be opportunity but I don't know.

In reply to Chairman Harris;

Walter Grant has a key of the front door; the family entrance. To get to that door you don't have to go through the yard. When he comes in the gate you have. When you open the back door you have to go through the hallway in the mens side into the round house and the back door has to be opened. He never comes in at night that way; in the day time. Those locks were no good that were on the corridor; those were the locks my keys would not fit; but those locks are not on there now. Q. You never went to the womens corridor between 6 and 8 to see if all right? A. Not until 9 o'clock; I was there at 8.30 one night, I was tired and went around early; but 9 o'clock is the time.

~~As in the case of the witness who told us that a girl told him that Handsley had connections with her in the prison?~~

Q. A witness here told us that a girl told him that Handsley had connections with her in the prison?

A. I know May Greene by name; I have seen her too.

Q. That is the name referred to in that man's evidence. A. Is he a prisoner?

The furnace room is next to the laundry; I believe she worked in the laundry; to get to the coal house in those days we would have to go through the laundry where those women worked.

Q. Do you remember an occasion when Greene was working there with Devaney down in the laundry; it would be

APR 14 1914

a very short time after you came ; two or three months after. You went down and Greene followed you out into the furnace room. A. When I first went Greene asked me for some tobacco; I said, No, I dare not give you tobacco; I said, I dare not do it. She never made any improper suggestions to me. I did not know then that she had been sent there for prostitution but I did know after. She never attempted to be familiar to my knowledge. She simply asked for tobacco. I should have reported that, of course. She never came out into the furnace room; she stood at the door. Any statement that we were whispering is false; I dare not have stayed there. I have tried to do my duty; I made one mistake but I have tried to walk a straight line. I have been boarding in the prison, I do not whether it is against the rules. The governor told me that I would most likely have to go outside if I was reinstated. I pay \$3.50 a week. Yeadon and I board there. It was awkward about the food; my wife is willing to work; I could support my wife, but a man wants to save if he can; she is living with Dr Silver on Morris Street. I am getting about \$50 per month and I understand I should get a rise in May; I would like to go back, I like the work. I was cross when I resigned. A prisoner had made a charge; he told another prisoner and this other prisoner told me; it did not come personally but through another. It is not much use taking notice of a prisoner, I know. If a man does his duty they are always after him. I used to give tobacco at odd times until I caught on. But I have not given any for a long time now. I do not think the governor told me when I went that I should not do it. Since the rules have been there we have stood right by them; or if we don't we know the consequences.

In answer to Controller Hoben:

A. Did any of the controllers ask you to resign?
A. No, I resigned on my own account, I was cross. I sent my resignation to the Governor. I believe I addressed it to the chairman and gave it to the governor unsealed. I told the governor. The next day I said I was sorry. He said possibly I could get it withdrawn; I said I would like to get reinstated. When I told the governor about my resigning he did not say anything to me; I put my reasons on it.

In answer to Alderman Hines;

The charge referred to against me was about two girls. They had asked me to take a note; I did not receive the note so I did not take it. Mrs. Grant found the note which was put for me to take to a party, but I did not take it.

APR 14 1914

Miss Hines, examined:

In answer to Mr. Davison.

I know Walter Grant ; he is a friend of mine. I see him on Sunday afternoons; he is very nearly always in Sunday School and if he is not I meet him afterwards. He does not leave me before 5.30 if he goes home to supper; but sometimes he goes home with me. This has been ever since the Sunday Christmas 1912, up until I went away on my vacation 28th July last Summer. I was away five Sundays. He still continued the same as before after that. I go to Sunday School. He goes to the same Sunday School; some Sundays he has not been there but, if not, he meets me after Sunday School, about 4.30; He never leaves me until 5.30; since December 1912.

In answer to Chairman Harris;

Neither in January, February or March 1913 did he miss a Sunday afternoon. At no time at 5 o'clock was he at the prison. At 5 o'clock he was with me every Sunday, until 5.30.

In answer to Controller Hoben;

I live at 61, Longard Road; about 20 minutes walk from the prison. He was with me every evening, seven days of the week. Ever since Christmas 1912; and every Sunday evening. Every evening and every Sunday; except the five Sundays I was away out of the City. 7 days a week; until 10.30 pm except if we were out anywhere; if we were not out it would be anywhere about 10.30. That has been since Christmas 1912; a week before 1913; the past 16 or 17 months. He generally comes about 7.30 or 8. If we were going anywhere he would be there early.

In answer to Alderman Hines.

I belong to Halifax. I was born here. my mother is living in Sydney. I have always lived with my grandmother. My grandfather is living too. I work in town at Freeman and Co's on Gottingen Street. My grandfather's name is Rasley. My people came from Halifax.

In answer to the Mayor;

I will swear positively that Mr. Grant was with me during January, February, and March a year ago every Sunday from 3.30 until 5.30 and then after church until 10.30. Grove Presbyterian Church and Sunday School. We both attend the same. They have registers in the Sunday School; I am not saying that he was in Sunday School every Sunday. Some Sundays he was not there and then he came to meet me afterwards. What impresses it on my mind and what makes me so sure is that he is so regular; that is why it is. He has only missed last Summer when I was away; and I was away this Winter. He was with me every Sunday from 3.30 to 5.30 . I can swear positively he was in my presence every Sunday during that time. We have been going together ever since June 30th, 1912.

APR 14 1914

I am certain that it would not be possible for me to be mistaken on one Sunday during that period; nor for any night. He has never stayed home on account of tooth ache; They keep a register at the Sunday School, I suppose they keep one at every Sunday school; they call a roll. I am there every Sunday. But I don't know about Walter. I do not know whether he is because his class is not with ours; I cannot say; I have met him afterwards; I meet him at the door after. I cannot say whether he is there; our class is not in with theirs. Their class is upstairs. He is with me from 3.30 to 5.30. I am in the choir. So is he. He has been a regular attendant. Not since the 1st January this year; there has been a change since then; but before that he was a regular attendant. We are always together and could very well see him. Q. I understand there was some bet? A. That was a bet we made from Christmas singing to Easter singing; it was a bet which one would miss the first Sunday and neither missed; We were not at our own church on Easter Sunday; we went to St. Pauls'x It was a bet as to who would miss the first during that period. We won the bet together.

In reply to Controller Hoben.

Walter Grant has not been regular this year in the choir. I was away four Sundays this year; I was in Sydney; I was out of the choir those Sundays and for two after I came back. With those exceptions I have been in the choir. If Walter Grant's father were to say that sometimes Walter spent an evening at home I would say it is not correct; not since Christmas, 1912 he has not been at home. He has not spent an evening at home except when I was away; I was away five weeks last year, 1913. He began to come every night after Christmas 1912; I went away July 28th and I was away five weeks. Until 1st September. I went away on the 20th February this year and came back on the 13th March. I can swear that with these exceptions he has been with me every night. I am certain of it. I was in Cape Breton for my vacation. I did not write every day but every other day. When he first started to go with me he smoked cigarettes but not after July 1912; I persuaded him to give it up. I am not exactly engaged to him.

913

APR 14 1914

The following statement by Mr. Wier was then read; Gentlemen;

Acting in the capacity of lady chaplain at the City Prison, as the representative of the Evangelical Alliance you can readily understand that visiting the institution every week and coming in contact with the officials and prisoners I have had many opportunities of helping the latter to get a start in life again by first ascertaining the merit of each case that appeals to me, and, if found worthy, providing for their material needs in the way of clothing, lodging and employment.

For upwards of six years I have voluntarily given much time and money to help in the uplift of this unfortunate class.

With regard to the Murphy girl's case which is now occupying your attention, I first saw her in our Sunday afternoon service, January 26th 1913, and in reply to Controller Scanlan's question "As to what authority the person had who sent this Catholic girl to a protestant Home in Montreal while there were Catholic institutions in Halifax in which this girl who is a Roman Catholic could have been placed" I may say:

First. That in the Winter of 1913 when this girl's case came to my attention and I learned that she was a Roman Catholic, I, without delay, called upon a clergyman of that faith in this City and to him I gave all the information I then had and requested him to visit her at the prison, which he did on more than one occasion.

Second. I also wrote to her father giving him full particulars regarding her as far as I knew at that time, a copy of which letter I have. I also persuaded the girl herself to write to her father, which she did, but no reply was received to either her or my letter.

Third. I knew that when this girl had been sent to the Monastery of the Good Shepherd by the magistrate they declined to have anything to do with her, regarding her as an incorrigible.

Fourth. At the time of this girl's transfer to Montreal there was not, and I am creditably informed that there is not now in this City a Roman Catholic institution where a penniless, pregnant abandoned girl will be taken care of. Therefore, when she appealed to me I did, as I informed Controller Scanlan in the first instance, "the best I could" which best was that she being discharged from custody by the Minister of Justice, and she being free to choose, I had her sent to a home in Montreal where she has since been under proper restraint and influence. It was her own choice, not mine, she expressing the desire to leave Halifax and her Halifax associates.

With regard to a memo produced at the Thursday afternoon session (19th inst) of this investigation, I may explain that I went out to the City Prison on the 16th inst in connection with my prison gate work, and while there prisoner James Wilson asked me if I could provide him with a pair of shoes when he came out in May. Upon investigating this case he told me that he had parted with a pair of new tan button boots, worth \$6.00, to one of the underkeepers (whom he named). I then and there called Governor Grant's attention to this man's statement, which he repeated in the presence of us both. He also said that one Robert Reilly had for half a fig of ~~tobacco~~ Black Jack tobacco parted with a gold ring and other articles, the

914

APR 14 1914

particulars of which are found in the sworn statements of these men.

I may state that Controller Harris was informed by me with regard to the Murphy case from the time it first attracted my attention, and in July last on his own responsibility made an investigation which satisfied all concerned that as far as could then be ascertained, there was no wrong doing within the prison, and just here I desire to express my appreciation of his assistance in all matters pertaining to City Prison reform since the retirement of Alderman Hawkins as chairman of the City Prison in April, 1912, and further that all matters that I have brought to the attention of Mr. Harris have been promptly dealt with.

I desire to place on record my approval of the thoroughness and care with which this unfortunate array of circumstances which I have brought to the attention of your board has been handled, and that Mr. Harris has needed no urging in the matter of prison reform. As before stated I have given much time to the City Prison work and where wrong doing came to my notice in connection with this institution it has been, and will continue to be, my practice to place the information in the hands of the proper authorities.

I most respectfully urge that in view of the serious nature of the scandal and the various issues involved the evidence taken in this inquiry which is more concerned with the administrative side than the criminal side, be handed over to the Attorney General for further investigation. In my belief the ultimate results will lead to a better and more efficient administration along reformative lines at our City Prison.

With regard to Governor Grant. I regard Mr. Grant as a man of unquestionable integrity, and his long years of service at the City Prison has given him an experience that should not be lightly thrown aside. I am also of the opinion that he has been seriously handicapped in the assistance furnished him by the City, in the selection of which he has had no voice and should not, therefore, be held responsible for their indecencies or immoralities.

With regard to the matron, Mrs. Grant; I doubt if it is possible for the City to obtain the services of a woman possessing her qualities for the position; she is intelligent, fearless and considerate.

With regard to underkeeper Yeadon. My knowledge of him is limited but what I have heard and seen leads me to the conclusion that he is today unquestionably a sober, honest and clean man, and well qualified for his duties.

With regard to underkeeper Hensley: Since his appointment he has been before your Board once for dereliction of duty. Since that time he has been careful and painstaking and has given no cause for complaint and is now discharging his duties satisfactorily.

With regard to underkeeper MacDonald. My observations of this underkeeper when in the discharge of his official duties have impressed me favourably but in view of the many reprimands and cautions

915

APR 14 1914

which have had no apparent effect and a charge yet to be determined I hesitate to express my opinion further.

With regard to underkeeper Nickerson. A recent appointment, gives every promise of being a highly satisfactory official.

With regard to suggested reforms. Until we can have a Provincial Prison Farm I would strongly urge that without further delay modern cell doors be installed. The use of cast off military clothing should be abolished. That cots be provided That not more than ten hours labor be exacted from the prisoners labouring on the farm or stone breaking and that the practise heretofore obtaining of working the prisoners bwteen the hours of six and eight am without breakfast be discontinued.

I am not a user of tobacco and, therefore, fail to fully appreciate the horrible craving for it that some of these people experience when deprived of it, but I believe that if a limited quantity was supplied it would prevent, in many cases, these people going to excess when liberated, and also eliminate many of the temptations that are offered in order to pprocure same within the prison.

I fail to see why any other than the matron should be possessed of the key of the corridor doors occupied by the female prisoners. I further fail to see any good reason why Mr. and Mrs. Grant's children should at any time be allowed in the prison yard, stables or that portion of the building occupied by the prisoners.

You will also permit me to suggest that wheel barrows be used instead of hand barrows in remaving broken stone from the stone shed to the stone pile in the yard.

As undesirable characters have heretofore been provided with passes to visit inmates and the influence of those visitors morally is bad, I would suggest that hereafter no passes be issued except by the chairman.

I do not think that we should compel healthy clean prisoners to occupy the same quarters as those who are diseased.

There are at times cases sent to the City Prison that should be sent to the hospital I would most respectfully urge that in future the C.M.O. examine at the Police Station all prisoners before they are sent out to the prison and if found necessary that a hospital ward be set apart at the prison.

(signed) H.V.Wier.

Halifax, N.S.

April 8, 1914.

Mr. Wier; I swear to that statement as far as the facts are concerned.

Controller Scanlan; He makes reference there to a question I asked him when you placed this matter before the Board of Control; he says there is no Catholic Institution for girls in the condition in which this girl was. There is a

916

APR 14 1914

ward in the City Home non sectarian for such cases. She was a Catholic girl and when she gave birth to the child she was the mother of a Catholic child and she should be left in a non sectarian institution and the child cared for by the denomination to which she belongs and I think I am perfectly right in saying there was wrong done in sending her to Montreal unknown.

Controller Hoben; She says the father is a Presbyterian.

Controller Scanlan; Not at that time. You have said who the guilty party is.

Controller Hoben; She has said so.

Mr. Wier; I am not prepared to say who the father is. When I found out about the girl and what I

learned in regard to her case, I went out of my way to visit certain gentlemen whose name I gave you. He can tell you best a few things it is not wise to discuss here.

Controller Scanlan; I have nothing to hide; I do not think that should be referred to in your letter if it going to the press. I did not think in your statement to the Board of Control you would make that reference. I accepted your explanation and I agreed with you more or less.

Mr. Wier. Your statement against me went.

Con; Scanlan; because it happened to appear in the press. Now, since that appears in the press I am going to ~~say~~ tell you right now you exceeded your duty and I am prepared to stand behind it and I do not think it should have been done without the information of Chairman Harris. I think Con. Harris and yourself did great wrong taking and sending that girl to a protestant Institution in Montreal and we as members of the Board of Control were not aware of the fact that a prisoner at the City prison had been switched off to Montreal Unbeknowns to any one.

Mr. Wier; This girl was not a prisoner when she was discharged from custody; she was just as free as you are now to do as she pleases; and in her freedom she came to me and I did the best I could.

Con Scanlan; and you sent her to a Protestant Institution knowing the girl was a Catholic.

Mr. Wier; I did it simply because the girl wanted to get far away from the associations of this town and people and further, there was no institution in this town under the control of her church that would take her in. The Monastery of the Good Shepherd had thrown her out as incorrigible. I made arrangements with an institution in this town where women of all faiths are housed and she preferred to go elsewhere.

Con. Scanlan; When the matter came before the Board of Control I asked why a Catholic girl was sent to Montreal to a Protestant Institution; I had a feeling it was my duty to do it for information. I was told the reason and the explanation was thoroughly satisfactory to me and I never expected to hear anything more about it but when Mr. Wier is giving evidence in writing I want to go on record as a member of this Committee that he did what was wrong.

Com. Harris: I have known of probably only two persons leave on ticket of leave; there ha-ve been quite a number discharged on ticket of leave and I was not aware of it; it did not come through me.

917

APR 14 1914

The matter rests with the governor.

The Myor ; When did you first notice her condition; that she was in the family way ?

Mr. Wier; She told me in February or March.

The Mayor: Who did she tell you was the father; or did she tell you ? **A.** She told me whom she thought was the father; someone outside of the prison.

Q. You have subsequently come to the conclusion that was not correct ? **A.** I am perfectly satisfied it was not correct from physical reasons.

Q. Have you come to any conclusion on the subject.?

A. I have formed an opinion on the matter. But I should not care to give expression to it. I have an opinion but I would rather not express it; I have no evidence to pass it on.

Q. Can you throw any light on the question of the accessibility of these women for the purpose of illicit intercourse with the keepers or the Governor's family ?

A. To be frank I think opportunities have existed if the people were so inclined; it simply depends on the people.

Controller Hoben: You have made certain suggestions in regard to prison reform; do you think grown up boys should be in the prison.

Mr. Wier; If I was the father of that family and governor of the institution they would be controlled in that institution different from what they have. There is a separate entrance on the north side and Grant's accommodation is a separate part of the prison; and naturally he would want the family under parental control.

Controller Hoben; I do not think any of the boys from 10 up should be in the institution. At what time was this child sworn on Walter Grant. ?

Mr. Wier; That was probably last December, I should say December 1913 ; the child was born in November and it was subsequent to that I got the information from Montreal.

Q. Did you get information that this Murphy girl's child was probably the off spring of somebody in the prison; when did you get information to that effect.?

A. I wrote to Mrs. Virtue to give the date of this girl's child; I got the information in December last year.

Q. When did you communicate that information to Mr. Harris ?

A. If I had the correspondence you would have the letters with accurate dates. I got a letter in December and one in January. I gave Mr. Harris the information they contained. He and I have been on a par as far as information is concerned in regard to this case since last July.

Controller Hoben: And since last December Controller Harris has had reason to believe the child was the offspring of someone in the prison. It was brought to Controller Harris' attention last December and he brought it to this Board a few weeks ago, and you have no complaint to make with the way he has dealt with the matter; if you have no complaint to make about him, have you any about me. Don't you think we have gone along as well as we could in view of the circumstances. **Mr. Wier.** Yes.

APR 14 1914

Controller Hoben: Then about this story of trying to block it? A. I have no comment to make about that.

Q. Someone is criticising the Board and someone says it is you. I am inclined to think that is right. I have heard it emanated from Mr. Wier, and from the chairman. We have ~~a~~ good many things to do.

Mr. Powell; You attended there every Sunday and held a religious service. Did you ever see Walter Grant?

Mr. Wier; If I did it has left no impression on my memory. I have seen him, but always before the meetings. I have no recollection of seeing Grant after the meetings ever. They usually began at 3 and closed at 4.15. I have no recollection of ever seeing him after the close of the meetings; not even once. I might have, but I have no recollection. I have recollections of seeing him before, and met him and spoke to him.

In answer to Controller Harris;

The service on January 26th was from 3 to 4.15; on February 16th the W.C.T.U. were there: Richardson was there; it closed at 3.15; I was not there. On March 9th I conducted the meeting.

Con; Harris; These dates I am asking are the dates MacDonald said he and Brewer were on duty on the Sunday afternoon.

Mr. Wier: On February 9th the meeting closed about 4.15. On March 30th it was an Army meeting; I was not present, but it was held from 2 to 2.50.

Mr. Harris; Mac Donald and Brewer both stated they were on duty on the Sunday afternoon Mr. Wier was at the prison and the service was not out until 4.45; that they saw the Murphy girl coming out of Walter Grant's room; MacDonald and ~~Frank~~ Brewer said they were both present and saw this girl coming out of Walter Grant's room, and that Mr. Wier was there that afternoon. These four dates are the only four Sundays they were there together and Mr. Wier was there two and two he was not.

Mr. Wier; 4.20 is our latest hour. The meetings I have conducted have closed at about 15 or 20 minutes past 4; beginning at three. After the meeting some fellow wants this or the other thing and then we go. The meeting after the fire three weeks ago was later in consequence of the fire.

Con; Scanlan; Didn't I understand you to say during the investigation in the early stages there was one particular Sunday afternoon when you had a special service which was a little longer than usual in January or February? Mr. Wier; That was the New Year service, yes. Mr. Scanlan; Would it not

be possible this was the Sunday Mc Donald had reference to? MacDonald was not positive as to its being 4.45 or 10 to 5; in the vicinity of that time. One could easily be mistaken in a $\frac{1}{4}$ of an hour.

Mr. Wier; Supper would be ready to serve; the New Year's service might have been kept in a little later.

Mr. Powell; You became aware of the girl's condition in February or March; at that time you had no knowledge that anybody in the prison was responsible?

Mr. Wier; It never occurred to me. Mr. Powell; Had

919

APR 14 1914

you any knowledge who the father was when the girl left in July? Mr. Wier; I still thought the father was an outsider. It was after the natural date had gone by that my suspicions were aroused.

Q. Mrs Grant says she brought Drs Harrison and Trenaman to examine her and both said she was five months in the family way. A. They said three months; therefore, she must have got in that condition in the prison if the statement of the doctors is correct. I think it was in May or June they were ~~here~~. Controller Harris; April 14th and 19th.

Q. Were you aware of that? A. I knew the doctors had been there; Mrs. Grant had told me that the City Medical Officer had been and that she was going to send for her own doctor. I don't think she told me the girl was pregnant. The girl herself told me she was in the family way; the only knowledge I would have would be her appearance. I don't think Mrs. Grant told me first. The girl had been there a couple of months when she told me; it would be the latter part of February or early in March. I did not judge from her appearance she was in the family way.

Mr. Powell; When this girl left in July, judging from her appearance how far advanced did you consider she was when she left in July. Mr. Wier; She was certainly heavy with child when she left in July. I should say six or seven months. Q. Did it occur to you she must have got in child in the City Prison? A. I was fully persuaded it was an outsider even up to the date she went away. Q. You heard nothing of the doctors diagnosis? A. I knew the doctors had been to examine her but they did not discuss the details with me. I have no recollections if I heard it from Mrs. Grant or the Governor. I knew the girl was in the family way. I would take notice if I thought it had occurred in the City Prison.

Controller Harris; Mrs. Grant says she called in Dr. Harrison and he says from what the girl told him I judge she is three or four months along. Mr. Powell Q. What did the City Medical Officer say? A. I have not got it. Q. If this girl was three months in April, why was she allowed to be taken out in July and at this late date we are asked to hold this investigation; why come back six months later and hold investigation?

By Controller Hoben; You got notice of it last December. Controller Harris; You make the charge and I will answer it. The Mayor; I do not say the slightest bit of blame is attachable to the chairman but it little behooves him to say we are delaying it when for four months no investigation was asked for. I objected to any report for Thursday because I want more time; I want one month after the evidence is taken to study and look into it and frame a report. Rock Head is all right for a while.

Controller Scanlan; Mr. Wier is a gentleman who is thoroughly conversant with the workings of the prison and he had no knowledge of this thing going on - men and women cohabiting. Mr. Wier; No, I did not know, until this information came from Montreal I was absolutely in the dark about it. Con; Scanlan; The affidavit she made in May or July placing the blame on some party outside of the prison; it would ~~cause~~ cause Controller Harris or Mr. Wier to have no suspicions on anyone at the prison.

920

APR 14 1914

Mr. Powell: If the evidence of Mrs Grant is to be taken we ought to have it here; if I recollect her statement she brought Dr Harrison to satisfy herself; The City Medical Officer had said she was three months pregnant. If in April, it must have been apparent to anyone she became pregnant there. If such was the case why was it allowed to drift to July?

Controller Harris: She was admitted to the institution January 17th or 18th, and the statement was made in April she was three months in the family way; that would be just about the time she came in.

Mr. Powell: I would like to have the City Medical officers statement; Harrison made no examination.

Controller Hoben: Mrs Virtue wrote a letter from Montreal and in that letter there is a sentence saying this girl had told Mrs. Virtue that Mrs. Grant put an extra dress on her to make her look well advanced in the family way when she left.

Mr. Wier: I have no knowledge of that; if she was as she says it must have been done with the intention of deceiving somebody. The letters should be before this Board.

Mrs. Grant, recalled;

Controller Hoben: I will not go on until the chairman produces the letters; he has no business to have them away. Con; Harris: Mrs. Virtue's letters to Mr. Wier had nothing to do with the case.

Con Hoben: In a letter Mrs. Virtue wrote to Mr. Wier this girl states Mrs. Grant told her the day she left the prison to put on extra clothes around her in order to make her appear somewhat further advanced in the family way. Con. Harris: There is no truth in the statement.

The Mayor: The point is did Mrs. Virtue write this?

Con. Harris: Certainly, I have got that.

Mrs. Grant: I did nothing of the kind; I put no extra clothes on her. She had a new skirt which two ladies bought and brought and gave to her. She had a striped silk blouse of mine which I gave her, and she had the usual under clothes a woman wears and nothing extra; she had a long black coat I gave her.

The Mayor: I am inclined to believe this adds nothing to it. Mrs. Virtue writes a letter that the girl says she did have this on. We have to weigh the testimony.

Con. Hoben: I would like Mrs. Grant to see the letter and say whether it is true. I think Mrs. Grant ought to see the letter. Con Harris: It is a mere accident they were left at home; I thought they were at the office.

Mr. Davison: Do you remember the night of the 21st January, 1913, when your husband went for the nurse for you. Mrs. Grant: Yes. Brewer put the horse in for Mr. Grant and I heard Mr. Grant telling him not to disturb the prisoners. I heard him come back and go into his own room.

Q. Did you see him again that night? A. Yes. Not very long after. The same night he snapped the corridor door before Mr. Grant came back; a very few minutes after.

Q. He said he remained in the gate house. A. It is not true. He was in his own room. I heard him ~~go up~~ come up and go to his own room. He did not hear me; I looked down and saw Brewer locking the corridor door; he had his boots on when he came upstairs. I distinctly heard him coming up from the ward. He took his boots off and I saw him coming from the corridor door in his stocking feet. There was just the bathroom between his room and mine. I was walking around the room.

Q. Did you ever see the Murphy girl speaking to the plumbers? A. Yes, I put her in the ward. It was the

pipe fitter

APR 14 1914

the man who put the heating in. She was on the rooms. I put her off and said she was to remain on the corridors. I put Martha Green on the rooms. I do not know how long she was talking to him. I just came out and caught her. MacDonald said he did not like Martha Green and what was the reason I had taken the Murphy girl off. Brewer went so far as to turn Martha Green off the rooms and put a man in the rooms. I cannot remember the man at all. But when I went up to the rooms this man was on them and I asked him what he was doing there; he said, Brewer told him to go up there. I asked Brewer and he said he did not want Martha Green; there had been a decent girl on the rooms and why did I not leave her there. I said, it is my own business.

Q. In the evidence given it was stated a meal was left over belonging to one of the women?

A. Sometimes there will be three over; I have seen three not very long ago; just a few weeks ago two suppers were left over; ~~is that~~, Mac Donald said, there are two suppers over; I said, Oh, is there; the two must be up in walter's room. That is just exactly what he said about the Murphy girl; those two were in the corridor and did not want it; it was just sarcasm and he deserved it.

Q. You got around three weeks after your illness. Did you go out driving after that? A. Three months after.

Controller Hoben; Was this Murphy girl working alone? A. No, not at that time. I took her off and put Martha Green on. I put Edna Boutilier right in the kitchen. Martha Green was alone.

Q. Was that a wise thing? A. I am through the house myself; I was never out of the house.

Q. You were apparently not able to watch the Murphy girl. A. Not likely when the corridor door was opened at midnight.

Q. Would you be surprised if the plumber came and said he was with her 15 minutes in the keeper's room?

A. I would be surprised; he was not with her 15 minutes.

Mr. Powell; Do you remember the month that Dr. Harrison was up there? A. I could not tell you the date, I think it was April.

Q. Was the City Medical Officer up after? A. A few days after. He said arrangements would be made at the City Home; she was three months advanced.

Q. Did it strike you she might have been made pregnant in the City Prison? A. Other men acknowledged their guilt. Q. You are aware the Boutilier girl thought she was made pregnant in the City Prison. A. Not until she came back this time. None of the medical men thought that she was made pregnant in the City Prison. When the Boutilier girl came back to the prison I became aware of it.

Controller Harris; Have you any suggestions as to improving conditions? A. I would suggest that there is a door leading from the furnace room to the laundry and I would make a suggestion it should be closed; as it is now, they have to go through that door and the laundry to the furnace. Another door out from the furnace into the cellar would prevent them going through the laundry. I think the keepers should not have anything more to do with those corridors.

APR 14 1914

Mrs. Grant; No children but the little one is in the yard; he will be four in June. I allow him to go around the yard. The others do not go through the yard but through the front; only for the pond in the front the little one would go too. They are not about the stables. They are in the yard sometimes after the prisoners are locked up in the summer evenings.

Mr. Wier. I am sorry to contradict you; I have seen the children in the yard. I have frequently spoken about it myself.

Controller Harris. What time do you get up in the morning. A. In Winter 6.30 ; in Summer 5.30.

Q. What time do you unlock the women ? A. The Bell rings at 6.30 generally; about a quarter or ten to seven.

Q. Have you always unlocked them ? A. No, I have not. Q. Who rings the bell ? A. The Keepers. In the back Hall. It was rung in the corridor when I went there first. We changed that after I got the women to the house. When the help came we had it locked then she came in April, Mrs. Brown, and that would be a couple of months after that we changed it.

She drew the bolts and the keepers had no more to do with it. Q. Did you say that during the last year the keepers did not draw the bolt ? A. No; since the first part of last June. Previous to that the keepers went into the corridors and drew the bolts. Two keepers would do that; always two.

Q. Have you ever heard of Mr. Wier complaining to Mr. Grant about the children playing in the yard.

A. Yes he did complain when we first went there.

They have not been in the yard for quite a while, only in the evenings. It is only natural they would be around the yard. Q. I understood you to say they were never in the yard ? A. Only when I told

you, after all were locked up; then we would let them out. On Saturdays and Sundays they go out the front way and they cannot get in until we let them in.

Controller Harris; Mr. Wier, there has been some criticism of my delay in getting to work on this investigation; what have you to say.

Mr. Wier; I brought to your attention everything pertaining to the case as it came to me and you and I, as far as I have ~~known~~ knowledge, I would say this, in view of the circumstances you have pushed it along as rapidly as possible.

Q. Was it a wise thing to delay a week and go to Montreal and take her statement ? Do you think we should have held the Investigation before she left ?

A. At that time circumstances would not warrant it. You held an investigation of a private nature. I was perfectly satisfied at the time. After developments put a different light on it.

Q. After October and she was not delivered, you began to be suspicious and communicated them to me. We decided to wait until we had the date of the child's birth. Then correspondence followed with Mrs Virtue in order to get her to name the person. You got the address of the home sometime before I went to Montreal and after I returned I told you what the Murphy girl told me and I immediately asked for an investigation.

Mr. Wier; You asked for the facts in the form of a letter.

Controller Harris; Did I delay it for a day at any

923

APR 14 1914

time. Mr. Wier; I should not say improperly delayed. Com; Harris. There is a suggestion on the part of Controller Hoben that I have been guilty of dereliction.

The Mayor; I would like to ask a question; In fact, you said I had been trying to delay this investigation. You had January, February and March; if I were in your I don't say I would not have kept it six months longer if in my wisdom I thought it right; on the face of it, it looks far more like delay not to tell the Board when you had evidence of this letter, that this girl had got in the family way in the prison, and yet never tell us. You had the knowledge and I want to say you are far more to blame than I am in delaying the report for two or three weeks. You knew of this letter when for three months this girl had got in the family way, if the charge is correct.

Controller Scanlan: The finding is going to take much longer, and the summing up of the evidence; than the investigation has taken. We have been four or five afternoons and personally I feel the loss of the time and cannot afford to lose any more.

Controller Hoben to Mr. Wier; Perhaps you will remember you said to me that Mr. Harris had been pretty dilatory. Do you recall that; near the Police station door since this investigation?

Mr. Wier; I have no recollection of that statement.

Controller Hoben; Did you not bring it to my attention yourself; didn't you remind me of the fact that you had written a letter in which you said, I have again; You wanted me to understand it was the first time you had urged Harris; you should not say one thing to me and another to him.

Controller Harris; Assuming you did, was I dilatory? What did you mean?

924

Board of Control Chambers,

City Hall,

April 20th, 1914.

The Board of Control met this morning at 11.30 o'clock. Present Deputy Mayor Powell, Vice Chairman, and Controllers Harris, Hoben and Scanlan.

Arbitrators - Legislation
A number of citizens appeared before the Board, protesting against the proposal for amendments to the City Charter in respect to arbitration in expropriation proceedings.

The Board is addressed by Hector McInnes, George Ritchie, Roderick MacDonald, George A. Burbidge and John W. Regan.

Mr. McInnes, on behalf of his clients objected to the suggestion of the appointment by the Supreme Court of a single referee in place of the present system whereby three arbitrators are selected. He suggested that if any amendments to the present system are deemed advisable, the adoption of the principle operated in the case of the expropriation of the right-of-way for the Halifax and South Western Railway. (Chap. 2 of the Acts of 1902)

Mr. MacDonald claimed the inherent right of each individual property owner to select his own representative on the Arbitration Board.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Scanlan, that a public hearing be given in this matter, and that the City Clerk advertise in the newspapers that the Board will meet at 11 o'clock on Wednesday morning, to hear the views of persons interested.

*Chronicle
and
Recorder.*

April 20th, 1914.

Motion passed.

Locomotive Engineers Convention
Mr. McLellan, representing the Convention

*E. G. Saunders,
Sec. Commercial
Committee.*

Committee of the Brotherhood of Railway Engineers, asked that the City assist the Committee by advertising the Convention in a souvenir number of the Railway Men's Journal, about to be issued. Referred to the Commercial Committee for report.

The Chairman submits a letter from the Secretary of the Board of Trade, stating that no quorum appeared at a meeting of the Commercial Committee called for this morning. Filed.

Form of Tax Bills.

*Caretaker
Hoban.*

Read letter S. J. Harrivel, urging the Board to promptly consider the matter of better form of tax receipts. Mr. Harrivel, being present, was informed that the subject is now engaging the attention of a sub-committee of the Board, and his letter is referred to said Committee.

Caretaker Fleming Park.

Read application Michael Cochrane for re-appointment as Caretaker of Flemming Park. Filed.

Council

South Street Sidewalk

Read report City Engineer re South Street sidewalk. Approved.

Council

South Park Street Sidewalk

Read report City Engineer re permanent sidewalk curb and gutter on the west side of South Park Street from Spring Garden Road to Sackville Street. Approved.

Inspection of Drains

Read report City Engineer re inspection of drains.

Council

Filed. *South Park Street Sidewalk*

Read report City Engineer re construction of a concrete sidewalk west side of South Park Street, be-

April 20th, 1914.

tween Victoria Road and Ingles Street. Approved.

Changing Civic Year - Streets Funds

Read report Controller Scanlan submitted at a meeting of the Board, April 8th, in re changing the civic year, or in the alternative, creating of funds for streets and internal health services, to be used exclusively between January 1st and May 1st each year.

City Solicitor

Moved by Controller Scanlan, seconded by Controller Hoben that the City Solicitor be instructed to draft legislation, and submit the same to this Board at its meeting on Wednesday next, providing for funds totalling \$8,000.00, for the purposes stated. Motion passed unanimously.

Water Street Cleaning

Engineer

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Harris that teams be placed at work today, cleaning up Water Street, and that an expenditure for the purpose not exceeding \$300 be authorized.

Motion passed.

Alex Locke Superannuation Assessments

City Treasurer

Controller Scanlan submits application Alexander Locke for refund from Firemen's Superannuation Fund. Referred to the Trustees of the Firemen's Superannuation Fund for report at Wednesday's meeting.

Bill Boards

E. L. Ruddy Co.

The City Clerk is instructed to notify the E. L. Ruddy Co., now doing business as bill-posters in Halifax, that the new Bill Board Ordinance comes into effect on May 1st, 1914.

The Board adjourned.

A. P. B. High

L. Fred Monaghan

Mayor

-927-

City Clerk.

Board of Control Chambers,

City Hall,

April 22nd, 1914.

The Board of Control met this morning at 11 o'clock. Present Deputy Mayor Powell, Chairman, and Controllers Harris, Hoben and Scanlan.

Read reports ^{S. J. Harrivel} Controller Hoben and City Solicitor on application of S. J. Harrivel for certain information. Said reports are adopted, and copies ordered to be furnished to Mr. Harrivel.

Read application ^{Water Meter Reader} C. A. Edmonds for position of water meter reader. Filed, and the City Engineer ordered to be notified of the application.

A number of citizens were in attendance in response to the following notice advertised in the Chronicle and Recorder:

PUBLIC NOTICE.

Office of the City Clerk, Halifax.
April 20th, 1914.

The Board of Control will meet on Wednesday morning at 11 o'clock for the purpose of considering amendments to the law with respect to appointment of arbitrators in cases of expropriation of property by the City of Halifax.

All persons interested will be heard.

L. Fred Monaghan,
City Clerk.

The Board is addressed by the City Solicitor, Roderick MacDonald and John W. Regan.

Mr. MacDonald was opposed to any amendments to the present law relating to expropriation of property

928

April 22nd, 1914.

by the City.

Mr. Regan was in favor of the existing law, but would not oppose in the case of proposed expropriation of right-of-way for the North West Arm Trunk sewer, that the property owners should be restricted to a choice of any one of five persons nominated as arbitrators by all the property owners. Further consideration of the matter is deferred.

Rev. Mr. McKinnon complained that the Contractors at the Ocean Terminals were temporarily cutting off Bower Road from communication with the City, and urged that this would be a serious matter in case of fire. The City Engineer was instructed to write to Mr. McGregor, the Superintending Engineer, requesting that sufficient room would be left open for the passage of fire apparatus and other traffic.

Engineer

Official Plan - Street Lines
Capt. Hicks appeared before the Board, protesting against street lines through private property being laid down on the official plan without compensation to the owner. The City Engineer informed Captain Hicks that no lines laid down on the official plan affected any property of his in any way.

Engineer

College Street Sidewalk
Mr. Edgar Kaulbach desired to know when the proposed sidewalk, College Street, would be constructed. The City Engineer stated that this sidewalk would probably be reached in its turn in the month of June.

Engineer

Sidewalks Ordered
Controller Hoben requested that the City Clerk prepare a list of sidewalks ordered from the date of

April 22nd, 1914.

the last schedule furnished to the present time.

Gasoline Tank Doyle Street

Read application Robinson's Stables for permission

to instal an underground gasolice tank, Doyle Street.

Referred to the City Engineer and the Chief of the Fire

Department, with authority to grant a permit if they

have no objection to the issuing of the same.

Widening Green St - Brookfield Property

The City Engineer submits a report from James A.

Rogers

Marshall, W. S. ~~Rogan~~ and R. T. MacIlreith, appraisers

appointed to value property of S. M. Brookfield, re-

quired for the widening of Green Street.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller

Harris that the report of the majority of the arbitrat-

ors be adopted, and Mr. Brookfield offered the sum of

\$1268.75 for his land, when legislation authorizing

the borrowing of the amount is secured. Motion passed.

South Street Sidewalk

Phillip Ring appeared before the Board, and asked

that the concrete sidewalk proposed to be laid on South

Street between Davis Street and Oakland Road be con-

tinued from Davis Street to LeMarchant Street. Approved.

Town Planning Convention

Read report Commercial Committee, recommending

the appointment of a delegate to represent the City

of Halifax at the proposed City Planning Convention

and Exhibition to be held at Toronto, May 25th-27th,

1914, under the auspices of the Dominion Government.

Deferred.

Superannuation John M. Donald

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller

Scanlan, that this Board recommend to the City Council

the superannuation of John MacDonald, Superintendent

of Streets and Sewers, at \$600 a year. Motion passed.

James Downie Foreman of Streets

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller

Asst. City Clerk.

*Engineers Chief
Fire Department*

*Council
City Solicitor*

*Engineer
Council*

*Council
Solicitor*

April 22nd, 1914.

Scanlan that James Downey be appointed Superintendent of Streets and Sewers in place of John MacDonald from May 1st, 1914, at \$1200 per year.

Engineer
Clerk & Works
James Downey
Council

Alex Locke Superannuation Assessments
Read letter City Treasurer recommending a re-

fund out of the Firemen's Superannuation Fund of \$40.56 to Alexander Locke, who has resigned his position as a driver in the Fire Department.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Scanlan that the recommendation of the Trustees of the Firemen's Superannuation Fund be approved. Motion passed.

Council

Tramway Legislation

R. E. Finn, M. P. P., appeared before the Board, requesting that he be furnished with certified copies of any data in the possess^{ion} of the City in respect to the agreement to any arrangements made in 1895 between the City and the Halifax Electric Tramway Company, in relation to the Charter of said Company, Referred to the City Clerk and the City Engineer to furnish the information required.

Engineer

City vs NS Car Works - Bell to go to England.

It is unanimously agreed to recommend that the City Solicitor be authorized to proceed to England in July next on behalf of the City in connection with the appeal to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council in the case of the litigation between the City of Halifax and the Nova Scotia Car Works, Limited, Mr. Bell to make arrangements providing for the appointment of an acting City Solicitor in his place during his absence.

Solicitor
Council

Salary City Clerk.

April 22nd, 1914.

The City Clerk calls attention of the Board to the minutes of a meeting of the Board held December 16th, 1913 (page 596) at the time his salary was under consideration during the preparation of the City yearly estimates, and submits the following draft acts for the consideration of the Board:

Section 113 is amended by adding thereto the following sub-section:

(3). The City Clerk shall be paid a salary of not less than \$2500.00 a year.

Sub-section (3) of Section 65 of Chapter 2 of the Acts of 1910 is amended by striking therefrom all the words after the word "Board" in the fourth line of said sub-section.

To be added to the schedule on page 10 of the printed draft acts for 1914:

To pay in one payment to the Secretary of the Board of Control for the civic year 1913-14 the sum of..... \$850.

To pay to the City Clerk for the civic year 1914-15 as compensation for additional duties as Secretary of the Board of Control and also in lieu of various sums formerly received by him for sundry services the sum of..... \$850.

Moved by Controller Scanlan, seconded by the Deputy Mayor that this Board recommend to the Council that the duties of the City Clerk be defined to include the duties of Secretary of the Board of Control, and that the City Solicitor be authorized to prepare legislation fixing the salary of the City Clerk at a sum not less than \$2500.00 per year, also for amending sub-section (3) of section 65 of Chapter 2 of the acts of 1910, by striking therefrom the provisions

April 22nd, 1914.

for extra pay to the City Clerk and also providing for the borrowing of a sum sufficient to meet the difference between the present salary paid to the City Clerk and the amount proposed herein. Motion put and passed, Controllers Harris and Scanlan and the Deputy Mayor voting for same, and Controller Hoben against. Controller Harris stated that the resolution did not provide for any back pay.

The Board adjourned.

Council

Wm. P. Powell
Deputy MAYOR.
Powell

L. J. McLaughlin
CITY CLERK.

Board of Control Chambers,

City Hall,

April 22nd, 1914.

The Board of Control met this afternoon at 4 o'clock. Present Deputy Mayor Powell, Vice Chairman, and Controllers Harris Hoben and Scanlan.

Dalhousie College - Morris Street
Read report City Engineer re Morris Street

Boulevard and Dalhousie College.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Scanlan that a copy of the City Engineer's report be forwarded to President MacKenzie of Dalhousie College, with the request that representatives of the College appear before the Board for a conference as to matters referred to in the Engineer's report; also that the Council be recommended to add a clause to the schedule on page 2 of the printed draft acts, providing for the borrowing of a sum not to exceed \$5,500 for the acquisition of property required to give a right-of-way on Morris Street, from Seymour Street to the College property. Motion passed.

Tenders for Trenching Sewers & Water

Read report City Engineer recommending that tenders be invited for trenching for sewers and water construction.

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller Hoben that the City Engineer's report be adopted and forwarded to the City Council for concurrence. Motion passed. *Underkeeper City Prison*

Read letter John M. Coates re his position as acting Underkeeper at the City Prison. Consideration of

*Council
Engineer
Solicitor
President
MacKenzie*

Council

April 22nd, 1914.

said letter is deferred.

Police Telegraph System.

Read extract minutes of City Council meeting April 9th, referring back to this Board draft act proposing the borrowing of \$7,500 for the installation of a police telegraph system.

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller Scanlan that this bill be again recommended to the favorable consideration of the Council. Motion passed., Controller Hoben dissenting.

Alterations City Hall. meeting

Read extract minutes City Council/ April 9th, referring back to this Board proposed bill for the borrowing of \$3,000 for alterations and improvements, City Hall. After discussion it is decided to withdraw this bill.

Loan for Fire Department

Read extract minutes meeting of City Council April 9th, re proposed borrowing of \$15,000 for the purchase of additional fire apparatus. Controller Scanlan stated that as it was evident the City Council was not disposed to provide the \$15,000 asked for improvements in the Fire Department, he would not at this stage further press it.

Controller Scanlan submits letters from carriage-makers A. J. McNutt and Stroud & Everleigh, re condition of hose waggons at present in service in the Fire Department, and asked that the Board recommend to Council the borrowing of \$3,000 for the purchase of four hose-waggons and winter runners to replace four of those now in use. After discussion, it is moved by Controller Scanlan, seconded by Controller Hoben that the

April 22nd, 1914.

Board recommend to the Council the borrowing of a sum not to exceed \$2,000 for the purchase of hose waggons and sleigh-runners for the Fire Department. Motion passed unanimously.

Council

Streets Funds.

Read draft act submitted by the City Solicitor, providing for a fund of \$3500 for streets and \$4500 for internal health, to be used between the 1st day January and the 1st day of May.

Council

Moved by Controller Scanlan, seconded by Controller Hoben that said draft act be adopted, and forwarded to the City Council for approval. Motion passed.

Arbitrators - Legislation

The Board unanimously decided to withdraw the draft act now before the City Council relating to arbitration in respect to expropriation of properties, and to recommend to the Council that the Board be authorized to give further consideration to this matter, with permission to draft and submit to the legislature such amendments to the present law relating to arbitration in expropriation proceedings as the Board may deem advisable.

Council
Solicitor

Town Planning Convention

Moved by Controller Scanlan, seconded by Controller Harris that the Board recommend to the Council that the City Engineer be appointed a delegate to represent the City of Halifax at the City Planning Convention to be held at Toronto, under the auspices

Council

April 22nd, 1914

of the Dominion Government, May 25th - 27th, 1914.

Motion passed unanimously.

Robie and Willow Streets Crossing

On motion of Controller Harris, the City Engineer is requested to place a single street crossing on Robie Street at the north side of Willow Street.

The Board adjourned.

Engineer

W. R. Powell
Deputy

MAYOR.

Powell

L. Fred Monaghan
CITY CLERK.

CITY PRISON INVESTIGATION.

City Hall.

Saturday, April 18th, 1914.

Present: Messrs. Harris, Hines, Wier, Davison, Powell,
Scanlan, The Mayor.

Dr. Trenaman, examined.

In answer to Chairman Harris;

I am City Medical Officer and as such visit the City Prison whenever I am asked to go there. I remember going there about March or April; I am up there every month; I have a record of the dates I went there, but not for any special purpose. I ran over my regular visiting book which I keep at home this morning and looked up the dates on which I was at the prison :- March 3, 11, 21, 24, 30. April 3, 11, 18, 24. I do not remember on what particular day out of these dates it was on which I saw Mary Murphy first. I did not go specially to see her; I was just making my ordinary visit and while there Mrs. Grant told me she had one of the girls there who was pregnant and asked me if I would see her. The girl was brought in and I questioned her about herself and I just intimated to Mrs. Grant that we would have to provide before the time of the girl's confinement and arrange for her being removed to the City Home lying in ward. I did not anticipate any special date other than I said we would arrange beforehand and see that she was not confined in the prison for her own sake as well as the Child's.

I did not make any physical examination; I took it for granted it had happened outside; there have been similar cases of prisoners becoming pregnant and they have gone out before their time of pregnancy had expired. I assumed it had taken place outside of the prison and from all intimations I believed it. I heard there of an outside party who was specially interested in this girl who had been there three or four times to see her and was making enquiries about her and making arrangements to provide for her if she could be released from the prison. That led me to believe this was an outside matter entirely. It was not until long afterwards that I knew the girl had left the prison. I may have seen her probably only twice. I may have seen her with the other prisoners when I was making my regular visits but I have no recollection; another time I saw her in reference to some trouble about her breasts. It was not until long afterwards that Mrs. Grant, in speaking of this matter, when some discussion had arisen with reference to it, told me she had called Dr. Harrison in at Mr. Wier's request, before I had seen her at all, and she felt she had made a mistake in doing so.

Mr. Wier: Did you say at my request? Are you quite satisfied at my request?

Dr. Trenaman; Mrs. Grant told me it was at Mr. Wier's request or suggestion that Dr. Harrison should be called in rather than me.

The Mayor: You had no later examinations whereby you became convinced she became pregnant by someone inside the prison? Dr. Trenaman: The next I heard she was out-side the prison.

APR 18 1914

I visited the prison in May on the 2nd, 9th, 18th and 25th. I heard outside parties names mentioned.

Mr. Powell; When you are the City Medical Officer and in the City, is it customary to call in another official to visit the institution? A. It is most unusual. Q. It is rather unusual for another official to go and examine an inmate? A. It never occurs and should not occur. Q. Would it make you think someone was particularly interested, the fact of calling an outside official? A. I did not think very much about it at the time. Mrs. Grant said she called in Dr; Harrison because perhaps he would pay more attention to her case than I would. I don't know why she should think so. Dr. Harrison is the Grant's family physician. Mrs. Grant made that statement to me.

Mr. Wier; Has there been any other occasion when another physician has been called in to a prisoner at the City prison? A. I do not know of any other occasion at the City prison or any other institution to which I am attached, when I am in the City.

Mr. Wier; There was a statement in writing over my signature in connection with a prisoner at that institution, where Dr. Trenaman visited the prisoner and the Governor at his own instigation brought in the family physician and made a report. It never came before the public, the letter was sent to the members of your Committee and we have heard no more about it; I can produce a copy of the letter. There was a case of one of the male prisoners at one time; I don't know what was the trouble; Mr. Grant sent for Dr; Harrison and he came late at night.

Dr. Trenaman: I know nothing about it. It may have happened many times but I have heard nothing of it. I only say that Mrs. Grant told me, as her excuse for Dr; Harrison being called; she wanted to excuse herself for having called another Doctor.

939

APR 18 1914

Governor Grant, MacDonald and Brewer, called:

Controller Harris to Brewer; You said the other day in your evidence that Walter Grant crawled over the fence ?

A. Not only Walter Grant, but George Grant and underkeeper Yeadon have crawled over all hours of the night.

Q. After the gates have been closed for the night ?

A. At 11, 12 and 1 o'clock.

Q. If he crawled over the fence would not the underkeeper on duty have to let him in to the main building?

MacDonald says the back door was shut, locked and bolted on the inside.

A. Never when I was on duty.

Q. Mac Donald says it is the regular practice.

A. It may be since I left, it was never done when I was there.

That is the main door where you come in by Mrs. Grant's kitchen.

Q. If Mr. Grant states that, he is not telling the truth ?

A. No, he is not. It was always left open when I was underkeeper; the only time I remember the door being locked, they had a woman prisoner, a big stout woman; she worked in the kitchen, came up for six months, Edna Boutilier; for two or three nights they just locked the door until she was put in her cell. I was the only underkeeper on duty. The others may have locked the door. I never did.

I don't know what they did. I never locked it.

Q. You said there were no locks on the women's corridor .

A. I didn't state no locks .

(Controller Harris read from his evidence)

"To my knowledge there was no lock on the women's ward".

Brewer; No, not in good repair.

"Only the cells were supposed to be locked with padlocks but they were in a bad state".

Brewer; To my knowledge there was never a lock on the women's ward. There was a lock on the women's corridor but it was never locked.

Controller Harris: You state there were no locks on the women's corridor .

A. The locks were in a very bad state. I said the women's corridor was never locked ; it was never locked.

Q. If Yeadon, Mr. and Mrs. Grant and Handsley say say it was locked they said what was not true ? They say it was locked every night.

A. Handsley was not there when I was there. When I was on duty the women's corridor was never locked; we would just push the door to and Mrs. Grant would say, That is all right.

Q. You spoke of a conversation with Mr. Mac Donald when Murphy was seen coming out of Walter Grant's room. Can you fix the date of that ?

A. No, I have no idea; I know it was on Sunday afternoon.

MacDonald; I have no idea; it was in the Winter time.

Brewer; Just before I left in March. The latter part of March.

Mr. Powell; Was it the month previous to your leaving you saw the Murphy girl coming out of Walter Grant's room; ?

A. I would not be positive to the fine point on that.

The Mayor; We want to try to get at the absolute truth if we can in this particular case, The public press said something about Mr. Brewer and I want to clear it up. As far as Mr. Brewer's appointment was concerned, I never heard any objection from Mr. Grant; I did not vote for Mr. Brewer, I don't say I would not have done so if it was a tie.

APR 13 1914

The Chairman voted for him; there was no objection; I had no objection from Mr. Grant; if we had I would have considered it. That is ~~is~~ as far as that is concerned. It is all bunkum such talk as that I was forcing him in. There was nothing against Brewer's character; I knew nothing against it; only Dr. Hawkins made allegation and charge but that had nothing to do with it. Brewer went there and acted as underkeeper for a certain period and I want to say I am perfectly independent; I have my own views about it and they will come out later. We want to get at the truth.

I don't know whether MacDonald or Brewer or either said they knew whether young Grant was in the habit of going into the cookhouse; he said he never did. Brewer; I said he did, and brought witnesses. MacDonald; I have seen him go in.

Controller Scanlan; Did you ever see young Grant getting over the fence? at night?

Brewer; No one ever seen him but he told us.

The Mayor; Two male prisoners said he did. Mr. Brewer and Mr. MacDonald say they have seen him in the cookhouse. About getting over the fence, we must take that for what it is worth. Let us know a little more about conditions while you were there, Mr. Brewer. About the accessibility of you underkeepers, or anyone else, or Mr. Grant's family, to the female prisoners. At certain times of the day was there opportunity for the underkeepers or any of the staff to have intimacy with the female prisoners. A. Yes.

The Mayor; Mr. Brewer has been asked about the chances of the staff or the governor's family or anyone to have intimacy with the female prisoners without the governor's knowledge; he answered before that there was; and now he says "Yes" again. I want Mr. Grant to ask how.

Mr. Grant; Do I understand you to say you insist that there was. Brewer; I do. The governor's sons George and Walter Grant could be around talking to the women more so than the underkeepers; an underkeeper could not steal more than a minute at a time; he had the yard to look after and the Governor would want to know what he was doing there.

The Mayor; It has been stated in evidence, I think, that only on one Saturday afternoon during January, February or March, when this pregnancy might have taken place, was he at home.

Brewer. Only once?

Q. What have you to say about that? He was with his girl every day. A. But not every morning and Saturday afternoon and Sunday morning, and that girl was around his room every morning of the week. He used to go to work about 9 o'clock. Governor Grant can deny that; he knows.

Governor Grant; Will you tell me it is not my orders to see those doors locked every night?

A. You never did. Governor Grant: I say it is untrue.

Governor Grant to Mac Donald; What were my orders to you and Yeadon regarding the gates and the back door; the little gate going out and the back door? A. Well, the back door was not locked because there was nobody to interfere. It has been bolted on the inside. I made it a practice of bolting it on the inside; there was no lock on it at all. It was your orders to bolt it.

Governor Grant to Brewer: I want to ask you,

941

APR 13 1914

How do you know Walter Grant was around.

Brewer; I used to see him around the prison. Whenever I would go in for anything around the prison; lots of times, on Saturday afternoons especially when we were carrying up coal with the prisoners.

Q. Will you say you saw him in the mornings ?

A. Every morning. I don't say I saw him every morning, but he was there every morning. While I was at the prison he never went out until a $\frac{1}{4}$ to 9 every morning to go to work. I know every morning when he was going out; in the stone shed I could see.

Q. When you were on the sewer drainage ? A. No.

Q. How long were you ~~on~~ the sewer drainage ?

A. A Week at a time. Q. How long was it being done ? A. I don't know, whether it was one or two weeks.

Q. You are prepared to say that girl went to Walter's room the first thing in the morning.?

A. Yes. I don't know he ever locked his door.

Mr. Grant ; I am aware he did. A. I have my doubts.

Controller Harris; Between 8 and a $\frac{1}{4}$ to 9, did you ever see Walter Grant around the prison building in that three quarters of an hour ? A. Yes, around the prison; he would go down for his breakfast.

(Mr.G.) Q. How do you know he went to Walter's room first ?

A. How do you know she didn't ? Q. How do you know it ? A. It was her duty.

Q. Her duty was the keepers first and the other rooms when they were empty. A. There were lots of times we went up to our dinners and the keepers room was hardly done up.

Mc Donald; I have seen that.

Q. There was no report to the matron or me ?

A. We did not have to report. I think it was the matron's place to see to that. Q. If the room was not right you should have reported that.

Controller Harris; If it did not come to her knowledge would it be the matron's duty to report it ?

A. She should find out if the woman did her duty.

Q. If you had knowledge and the matron not, whose duty would it be to report ? A. I suppose the keepers. Q. How would you know the matron had knowledge.?

A. She should have knowledge.

Q. Was it not your duty to report ? A. No, not our duty. Q. I should suppose it would be ? A. We

never used to report on the womens work.

Q. You made reports on the womens work from time to time, didn't you ? A. No, we never made reports on the womens work as I remember. I have never made reports on the womens work.

Q. When you had a bowl over at supper, or if you were a meal over you would investigate it ?

A. Certainly. Q. And if you found the locks on the womens corridor broken ? A. Certainly we would. We were sick and tired of doing that; Governor Grant knew about the locks and there was no good reporting it every night. We did report it.

Q. And when you reported "All correct" ? A. It meant nothing wrong. We reported that every night.

Q. But that was not so if the locks were out of order. A. No, not so; but the governor knew the

locks were out of order. Q. If you report all correct and they are not correct that is not a true report. A. No, in a way it was not .

In answer to Mr. Davison;

Q. You say you locked the back door every night you were on duty ; locked or bolted . A. Which

back door ? Q. Leading to the yard from the mens side. A. No I never bolted or locked it ; just pushed it to and left it like that for the night.

APR 13 1914

Q. Were you not required to bolt that door as part of your duty? A. I never had no instructions.
Q. don't you know the other keepers always did? A. I don't know whether they did or not.
Q. When you gave the report "All right" the back door was not fastened in any way at all? A. No, that is what I say.
Q. You said something about the womens corrdor never locked? A. It was never locked. I think there was a lock but I never locked it. I had a key.
Q. Why didn't you lock it? A. When we used to go with Mrs. Grant to lock up the women prisoners a woman would be kept out to do work in the kitchen and perhaps she would be out two hours after the others would be locked up and she used to put that woman in the cell herself; After we were through our duty. Q. The last person at that door was Mrs. Grant? A. Yes. Q. After she put the female prisoners in she locked them up? A. No, it was never locked. I say it was never locked.
Q. How do you know if Mrs. Grant was the last person there? A. Because when we went in the morning the door was always open. Q. What time did you get there in the morning? A. This would be in the Winter time when I would be on duty all night it was my duty to unlock in the morning. Q. I want to know what time Mrs. Grant put this woman in the corridor? A. I could not say exactly at what time; some nights perhaps it would be one hour and some times it would be two. Q. What time do you leave the prison on day duty? A. When it was my night home $\frac{1}{2}$ past 5; then I would go home and stay home all night and come back in the morning, if early morning at 6 or 6.30. Q. What time were the women released from the cells in the morning? A. I have been away a long time. Q. I am asking you what time you got back and the cells were unlocked? When the keeper came on duty in the morning at 6.30 we came on duty and we unlocked the men.
Q. What time did the keeper on duty all night unlock the women? A. You can't force anything out of me to say things I don't know. Q. I will explain; when the keeper came on morning duty he got the men out first and then came over and unlocked the women? Before you got there the women were unlocked were they not? A. No. Q. What time did you unlock the women when On night duty? A. After we got the men out. By Mr. Davison; Every keeper came on duty at the same time 6.30 and the women were never unlocked until the other man to be on day duty came on duty; that was right, that was always the case and you never found the womens corridor locked when you came therein the morning. what was the matter with the locks on the womens corridor? A. They were out of repair; some would lock and some would not. Q. They would never lock? A. No. I reported it to the Governor several times and knew they were out of shape. I have no dates or days; if I knew this case was coming on I might have kept a memorandum. Q. Are you referring to the locks of the cells or the corridor door. A. On the cells.
Q. The locks on the corridor were all right? A. I told you the corridor was never locked.
Q. Were there no locks on the corridor door? A. I have said that two or three times; I say there was a lock there but it was never locked. It was a good one, I think. Q. Why was it never used? A. for the simple reason that Mrs. Grant used to put

943

APR 18 1914

this woman in in the night. She could not have locked the door or it would have been locked in the morning. Q. Will you swear she did not lock the door when she put the woman in? A. I don't think she ever did lock it; I would swear she never did.

I will swear it here and in a court house. It should be held in a court house and not here.

Mr. Davison; I will only be too glad to have it adjourned to a County Court judge.

Brewer; I have committed no crime and I am prepared to go anywhere. I have told you a dozen times Mrs Grant did not lock that door.

Q. About Walter Grant getting over the fence. A. I never saw him but he has told us himself. There was nothing in climbing the fence; he climbed it so that his father should not know what time he got in. Q. And if he climbed the fence? A. He would come right in the prison; the door was never locked or bolted; not when I was on duty.

Q. Would it be necessary to climb the fence if he had a key of the door? A. I understand he had a key after I left there. I told you that. Q. And if he had a key of the front door it would not be necessary to climb over the fence?

Mr. Grant; Did you ever know him get in by way of the front door while I was there. A. I saw him several times by the front door; the Governor let him in. Walter Grant to my knowledge was out frequently at night. Q. How many times do you know of his climbing the fence? A. Several times; Just what he told me, that is all. Mr. G.- He denies it. A. Underkeeper Yeadon and George Grant say they climbed the fence. Q. Yeadon did not say he climbed the fence.

Mr. Davison; Yeadon gave most excellent evidence that would commend itself to any court in this country. You say the Sunday you saw the Murphy girl come out of Walter Grant's room was just before you left? A. Yes. I would not be positive; it is over a year ago. May be a fortnight or three weeks

Q. In fact you cannot fix a date at all? A. No. I don't know whether Mr. Wier can give any dates. Perhaps I can get a date from him.

Q. What you say now is it was sometime in the Winter but you cannot tell when; is that all you can give? A. Yes.

The Grant boys were about the institution a great deal of the time on week days. Walter Grant would be home sick occasionally; not for long. I do not know just on how many occasions; once or twice. On Sunday mornings he would be at the gate house with the keepers; On Saturday afternoons and Sunday afternoons he would be there; I don't say all Sunday afternoons; I see by the evidence he was out with his girl on Sunday afternoons. I have seen him there lots of times on Sunday afternoons; not all afternoons; he would be there about 2 o'clock and around 5 o'clock. I could not positively say I have seen him there between 2 and 5.

Q. On Sunday afternoons a lot of people are around the institution are there not? Service is being held and there are people from the outside; and people are moving about all the time? A. Not much moving about during the service. Q. As a matter of fact are there not a lot of people moving about on Sunday afternoons? A. No. The prisoners are in church generally an hour or perhaps a little more. Mr. Wier used to go around 3; the Salvation Army around 2. Mr. Wier used to be over about 3.30 or 4, somewhere around that.

944

APR 18 1914

Q. After that there would be a lot of people moving about ? A. No, not after they got out of the gate.

Q. I mean people in connection with the institution.

A. No, I did not see any people.

Mr. and Mrs Grant might be in their room. She is not working around on Sunday afternoons. If you mean week days, I have known Mrs. Grant after she has finished work in the kitchen to go to her room to dress and the governor to be in the room too; this was across from Walter Grant's room.

Q. And any person from the rotunda can see ? A. Yes.

Q. A person moving about can see people coming in and out of Walter Grant's room. A. Yes.

Q. If Mr. and Mrs. Grant were frequently in their room would not Walter Grant be taking big chances under those circumstances to have the Murphy girl in his room on Sunday afternoons.? A. I don't know Walter Grant's mind. Q. Would he not be taking big chances ? A. Yes, but I don't know Walter Grant's mind.

Q. That was the only occasion on which you saw this girl ~~xxxx~~ go into Walter Grant's room ? A. I did not see her going into his room, I saw her coming out on Sunday afternoon.

Q. That was the only occasion you saw her was it ? A. I saw her several times when working around. I have seen her coming out of the keepers room too; all the rooms.

Q. And you think it especially suspicious because she was coming out of Walter Grant's room ? A. Yes. This Sunday afternoon looked very suspicious. I have never seen her come out of a keepers room.

Q. This night January 21st you say you stayed with Crust in the gate house; why did you not go to the institution ? A. I didn't have to. I stayed in the gate house and made a little fire and stayed until the governor came back.

Q. Were you in the habit of staying in the gate house at night ? A. No, but that night I did on account of the Governor waking me up.

Q. Did you ever spend a night before ? A. That was the first night because I was called up specially, the night Mrs. Grant took sick and that is the night it is referred to as I was in the womens corridor and I got a statement from this man and when I went to bed the governor and George Grant were in the kitchen making a fire while the doctor was there, if my memory serves me right; that was the only night I ever spent in the gate house.

Q. You say the Grant boys were around talking to the female prisoners in Mrs. Grant's kitchen at all hours of the day ? A. Walter Grant was not; but the other children were when they were not at school.

Q. What female prisoners would Walter Grant be talking to ? A. Mary Murphy, Edna Boutilier and those kind of people; we never had time to go and talk to those girls; people could not stay in that prison many minutes; just get in and out.

Q. You say every night you reported "All correct" knowing doors were left unlocked; and also the back door leading to the yard, and you believed you were doing your duty when you made that report ?

A. I do.

Q By Mr. Harris; What keys do you carry ? A. 4

A key of the gate; key of the mens brass locks on their cells and two more keys ; they had three kinds of locks ; locks on the womens cells and one

945

APR 18 1914

time some of the men had a special lock. The key of the main gate and three keys to fit three different kinds of locks. Four keys would fit all the locks in the prison. I had a key of the store house when I first went there but the Governor took it away. The same kind of lock was on the cookhouse as on the mens corrdor. There were two doors to the cookhouse, one leading into the womens corridor and the other into the yard. I think they had the same kind of lock. Only underkeepers had keys. The Governor took the key of the store house away. All underkeepers had keys of the cookhouse. Walter Grant got in the cookhouse without a key because we always used to leave the door open. The prisoners are not always locked in.

In answer to Mr. Grant;

The lock on the door leading to the womens corridor was never locked.

- Q. Was the door of the cookhouse leading into the yard ever locked? A. There was a lock an it but you could pull it open. Q. The cookhouse door leading into the yard next the blacksmith's shop, was that door ever locked? A. Not all the time; not in the day time. Any Saturday afternoon it was always open. It was open the best part of the day time. Q. Would you not think by the locks being there that it was meant to be locked? A. Meant to be but it was not just the same. I nver reported to the governor the cookhouse was unlocked. I did not think it my duty. I think it would have been up to us if the men got away. We were not running risks. Q. When you had Walsh there for 23 months you were running risks. A. He had been there too long and I had too much confidence in him.
- Controller Harris; My correct full name is Stephen George Brewer. I am from England. From Ludgershall in Hants; I was born at Penton in Hants; I joined the Royal Berkshire Regt in 1891. I ~~did~~ do not have to tell my age when I joined to you; it might be used for something else. I do not think I am forced to tell it. Q. Were you 18 years and 7 months. A. I do not think I was. I know what I gave my age as. Q. Were you 18 years and 7 months old when you joined? A. That is my business. I was not that old. I was not older. I was younger. Q. How much? A. I want to know the reason. Q. When you were appointed in June 1912 you said you were 35 years old. In 1891 how old were you? A. I know how old I was when I joined the regiment. I am not going to tell you all this. Q. Why conceal you age? A. I have good reasons. Q. You applied for Life Insurance when you joined the R.C.R. ? A. You don't have to apply for Life Insurance; it is a different thing altogether. Q. You made your application as 18 years when you joined. A. I don't remember. Q. Well you did; will you say you did not? A. I won't say I did or did not. Q. When you joined the R.C.R. they put you in the insurance and you had to make a statement as to age; A. I dnn't know, I made some kind of statements. I tell you I don't say I did or did not. Q. Had you say you were 30 years old? A. I know how old I am. I am not 40. I don't have to say all that. Q. It is as good if you don't. Q. Did Mr. Grant ever speak to you of your duties in connection with the women? A. He was always telling me something about my duties. Q. In connec-

APR 18 1914

-tion with women? A. Yes, that is the reason I left the prison. Q. Did you say you wanted to get clear of the women? A. I did not. Q. You said, "I never entered the womens corridors alone." Q. I want to know whether you adhere to that statement and if Martha Green and the other woman are telling untruths? A. I never said I never entered the womens corridor alone; I don't think I made that statement here. I never made that statement. Q. Have you ever entered the womens corridor alone? A. Yes, I have. Q. On what occasions? A. In the morning when I went to ring the women out. Q. Have you ever known the church service in the afternoon to be as late as 4.30. A. Yes, once. Q. On the occasion when Mac Donald ~~saw~~ and Mr. Wier---- A. You had all that before. Q. Mr. Wier gave evidence on that afternoon it was over by 3.30 or 3.45; then he is not telling the truth in spite of the fact he made a note at the time? A. He did not make a note. Mac Donald knows as well as I do that is not the truth. Q. You will say that Mr. Wier's statement is incorrect? A. It is incorrect; he has made a mistake. Q. Mr. Wier said; March 9th, 2.45 to 4 pm; I made a note at the time. A. One Sunday afternoon they were very late. Q. And if Mr. Wier has notes to the contrary they are incorrect? A. They are, Yes. Q. Did you keep a copy of the letter you sent to Crust? A. No. I never suggested to him, I simply asked him if he would write to me and say where I was that evening. Q. From the records, January 6; Feby 16; March 9 and 30; MacDonald and you were on duty on Sunday afternoon. On March 30th you had left the prison. You had left the 24th; and you said a fortnight or so before you left? A. Somewhere about that time. Q. March 9th or February 16th, either one date or the other? A. Somewhere around there; I don't remember. Q. Were you ever at the prison on Sunday afternoon when you did not have to be on duty? A. No. The Mayor; This Sunday afternoon you refer to that you saw this girl come out of Walter Grant's room; what brings that to your memory. How do you remember it? A. On account of having a supper over and Mac Donald saying there was one to come yet. Q. How long before you left? A. I have no days or date I don't remember the date; it was a Sunday afternoon. Mac Donald said there was a woman to come. (Brewer to Mac Donald; Do you remember it? MacDonald; I remember the Sunday afternoon this girl coming out of one of the rooms supposed to be Walter Grant's room. Q. About what hour was this? A. It was about five to five, I suppose, when I rang the bell to give the women their supper and I found one over. In answer to Mr. Davison; Did I understand you to say when I was examining you before that two men always went to the womens corridor in the morning. A. In late times; there were after a while two men; in certain times only one man. Just before I left two men always opened the womens corridor. Q. Did you state one man alone would open the corridor door? A. Yes, there has been. Q. It was not the universal practice for two men? A. No. Q. During that Winter when the Murphy girl was there? A. I don't remember only one keeper. While she was there two keepers always went.

947

APR 18 1914

Q. Then your former statement that one man always went is not correct? A. I told you there was a change made; I don't know just when. At one time one keeper rang the bell and unlocked the women and came right back; and then they doubled up the keepers; one keeper upstairs and another down; the change was made about a month before I left; I don't exactly know.

The Mayor; Mr Wier said that he frequently stayed around a while after the service and that may have confused the witnesses and make them think it was five o'clock.

Mr. Wier; There might be some confusion but it only my practice to be delayed 10, 15 or 30 minutes after the service; I talk with the prisoners quietly and try to ascertain what I may do for them. It may possibly have confused the witnesses as to the hour.

Controller Hoben; When Brewer's name came up, I voted against Brewer's appointment. Mr Harris never showed me a letter from the Governor to him opposing the appointment and yet there was a rumour that Brewer was not a very good man for the job and I voted against it and moved reconsideration; I was shown a honorable discharge from the military; a statement from the I.C.R. that he had left because there was no work and other evidence that his character was irreproachable and I did not vote against him on the reconsideration because I felt I would do the man an injustice in view of the recommendations shown me. His appointment was a bad one but there is no one who ought to bear the onus as the chairman because he had documentary evidence which other members of the Council did not have.

Mr. Powell to Brewer; You are under the impression that you are coming down here wasting time. You should get that idea out of your head; you are as much interested as the governor because you have been named as the guilty party and for that reason you are interested. You should come before the Committee whenever you are asked because it is alleged you are the guilty party and it is up to you to clear yourself; you should assist in every possible way.

Brewer; I have committed no crime.

Mr. Grant to Brewer; Do you remember the conversations you and I had on the farm when you came and told me they gave you a hard name and that you wanted to show the people you could carry this out and become straight, and I said, I objected to your appointment myself but as far as you have gone I don't see but what you have been wronged. A. I don't remember anything like that.

Q. Do you remember me taking you to one side about the month of October and telling you I had heard some talk from the matron and female prisoners I did not altogether like and was bound I would stop it.

A. You never called me on one side.

Q. You don't remember it? Do you remember telling MacDonald the governor is going to bring the matter up when Jane Devaney came back, but he had not done it yet? A. I do not remember it.

Q. Do you remember my coming out of my room just after the charge was instituted on 8th February, and said you had been seen to go into the kitchen with a female prisoner to put light wood into the oven of the stove.

A. I think one time I did. Q. Do you remember what you told me? A. I went one time just to put wood in the stove to be drying for morning. Q. I told

948

APR 18 1914

you then not to have anything to ~~in with~~ say to the female prisoners, to say it to the matron, that I had already warned you of the consequences, and you said, I wish I could be taken off woman.

A. I never said any such thing.

Q. I said, I will do that right gladly Mr. Brewer, and then you said, Well, I don't want to be ridiculed by the other officers; they will wonder why I am taken off. I said, I am quite willing to stand by you; you are a married man and I don't want you shown up before people. You said, I should think not with a lot of prostitutes. I said, I have talked to those women and told them the officers must not be the subject of talk. You said, I heard all about it outside. I said, Mr. Brewer, would you allow one of those prostitutes to approach you on the public streets of Halifax and talk to you; it is nothing more than that to listen to them inside. If I took their evidence you would not be here today.

A. It is not the truth Governor Grant. I do not remember Governor Grant saying that to me.

Q. I will go further; I told Mr. Brewer myself I knew nothing in regards to the talk of the female prisoners; I said that it was all hearsay; and he said he took exception to it. At last I ordered you away from the women; were you removed or not? A. You told me my duties must cease and I quit right away.

Q. You were very sinister to Mrs. Grant. A. I never was.

That's a good made up yarn, Mr. Grant. Q. Do you remember when you took the man upstairs and ordered the woman Mrs Grant had put on the rooms away and put the man on the rooms; you objected to the woman on the rooms. Martha Kelly was the woman. A. Yes, I think I did object to Martha Kelly being in our room; who was going to have a dirty old black thing like her around; I think it was our business to object. We never ordered her away. We spoke because we would not eat out of the dishes. Q. Why did you not report it to the matron? A. We reported it to you. Q. You did not. A. We did.

Controller Harris to Mac Donald;

Q. We did not ask you about the locks on the cookhouse door; if it was always locked?

A. It just depends on the underkeepers; if they go along all right the underkeeper is in the yard and he would leave the door open for fresh air. In the Winter time they would be getting out ashes and would leave the door open for an hour. If we went into the house, clear of the yard, our orders were to lock the cookhouse door. They were my orders, I don't know about anybody else. I did not generally lock the door when I was in the yard. If I was going to be in the yard for an hour or two I would leave it open.

Q. Was the back door leading from the main building to the yard open? A. It is a question about that door; I know it has been bolted. When the locks first went on I locked it; it was when we got those soldiers up for 6 and 9 months; the orders then were to see that it was locked. That was at that time; we had no instructions before.

Q. If Walter Grant got over the fence, assuming

949

APR 18 1914

he did, he could not get into the main building except by passing through that door? A. While I was on duty during the last two or three years ~~it~~ I do not think he could without my knowing it.

The Mayor; You have heard Brewer's statement in its main features; is there anything you can point out in which he has misrepresented the case?

There is a charge about the cookhouse and young Grant going in there; that he has been seen going in there on Saturday afternoons and other times, have you ever seen him go in the cookhouse?

MacDonald; Yes.

Q. Had he access to the women's quarters in any way, as much as you keepers? A. Well, I could not say that. Q. Had he any access; where the bolts and locks in such a condition that at certain times he could get in the female quarters? A. Unless he had his mother's keys; that is the only way I know

Q. About this particular Sunday; I understood you to say you were looking up and noticed this girl coming out of his room; do you still say that is correct after reflection; is that statement correct?

A. That she came out of Walter Grant's room about supper time; that is correct. It was supposed to be Walter Grant's room. Of course, the children's rooms are altogether.

Q. Do you know if he was there that afternoon. A. Walter Grant came out shortly after; I won't swear whether it was his room, but he came out of the same room. I have seen him smoking cigarettes.

Q. Did he ever give any to the underkeepers or prisoners; or do you know if he did? A. I have seen young Grant smoke on different occasions; he may have passed some cigarettes to the prisoners.

Q. Do you remember in January, February and March; it has been said in testimony by a witness that young Mr. Grant every Sunday during these three months could not possibly have been in the prison because he was in company of this witness from a certain hour until 5.30. ~~and then after that he would be out after 5.~~ This Sunday - was it during January, February or March? A. Yes, I think it was. Walter Grant used to go over on Sunday mornings generally. I don't remember the correct time; I never paid much attention to the two bigger boys; they went back and forth to the cookhouse.

Q. This is a particular case of the testimony of an independent witness, that young Grant was in the company with this witness every Sunday afternoon until 5.30 from 3.30; he never was in the prison at all during those hours; he was off the premises.

A. I would not like to swear to it; I have seen him in the afternoons; I won't say what time.

Q. This particular day when the church service was late because Mr. Wier was late, was that during January, February or March? A. It was either the last of February or the first of March. I won't say he was always out or in; I didn't keep the run; he would be around the house on Sunday mornings. He would sit down and smoke.

Mr. Powell; The afternoon the one meal was over do you remember seeing Walter Grant around about 5?

A. Yes, about 5 o'clock. Mr. Wier was standing at the hall stove; I don't remember exactly what time church was over.

Mr. Davison; How do you fix the time of the year of that particular Sunday you speak of? A. I have no dates at all; I have no way of fixing the time, of the day of the month. It might be got at.

950

APR 18 1914

I don't know whether it was January, February or March now. It was late in February or in March; I would not swear to anything I do not know.

Q. You have no way of fixing the time at all ?

A. Not outside those two months, February or March; it was Winter time and snow around.

Q. In order to get into the womens corridor Walter Grant would have to have his mother's key ? A. He would have to have a key, that is to say if the corridor was locked all night; I have found it unlocked in the morning.

Q. Why did you not report it ? A. I didn't think it necessary because the locks sometimes would lock and at other times they would not.

Q. What was the matter ? A. They would just tip over and would lock; and tip back and would not; they were a poor form ; a lot of old locks. They were out of commission. I told the matron on many occasions that the locks were not fit for there.

Q. Was it your duty to see they were locked or report it ? A. Sometimes Mrs. Grant locked up herself;

she put her woman away generally; I didn't go right up because she locked the door herself. The next morning I found it open. It was my duty to go round at 9 o'clock to see they were locked; Some time ago, I won't say how long back, I found the door unlocked; during Mrs. Grant's time; I don't know whether I reported it or not; generally all the locks were bad; they used to shift the locks back and forth off the men and womens corridors. When the underkeepers were bolting the door she would be with us.

Q. It was your duty to go round later and report all right and you went around at 9 o'clock and reported they were locked when they were not.

A. The matron was the last to lock up the door.

Q. Did you go to the door and see if it was locked after the female prisoner was put in ? A. I have gone right up to the door and thought it was locked and found it open the next morning.

Q. Ever find it open at night on your rounds ?

A. I don't know as I did. I have no recollection of finding the door open and not reporting it to the Governor. It was the usual practice to find the door locked in the morning.

Q. Did you ever report to the Governor you found the door unlocked at 9 o'clock. A. I always reported all correct. There was times when the women were shifted back and forth I have seen duplicate lock out on the ward up there; I never had a key to fit that. Generally when I was around Mrs. Grant was with me. But not on my last round at night. ~~I~~

Q. On your last round at night you never found the door unlocked ? A. I won't say that; if I did I locked it or tried to . The least turn of the locks out of commission would lock them and the least turn would unlock them. I am pretty sure that I suggested to the Governor it was advisable to get new locks. More than once I told him he ought to get new locks. I could not say exactly on how many occasions I saw Walter Grant in the cookhouse. I Have seen him there frequently on Sunday morning when I was on duty.

Q. How did he get in ? A. We have been in the yard and the door would be open. The cookhouse was heated with a stove. The prisoners would not have a chance to escape if we were in the yard; there was generally more than one there on Sunday morning. It was not particularly on Sunday mornings that the door was left open. We would not leave it open all day.

951

May be half an hour; perhaps an hour, perhaps not that long. Q. Why leave it open? A. There would be the ashes to be carried out and the coal to be carried in; and the kindling wood too; and the men wanted fresh air. It was the cook's duty to take out the ashes. They would go out in the yard with the ashes; the keeper would be in the yard. That work was the prisoners and it was done under the eye of the keeper and it would be done at any convenient time; some times in the morning; sometimes near dinner time; not often in the afternoon; usually in the morning whenever they got the chance. The ashes would usually be taken out in the morning.

Q. I have a note taken during your previous examination in regard to the cookhouse; you said Walter Grant was in the cookhouse once when he first came there. ~~It~~ On more than one occasion. It was after they came there awhile, I don't remember; I saw him once or more; is that statement correct?

A. Once is correct, but I don't know how often.

Q. Is your statement made at the previous examination correct? Did you make that statement, you saw Walter Grant in the cookhouse when they first came there? A. Perhaps I did make the statement.

I have seen him more than once.

Q. On one afternoon two prisoners said he came in and saw he would like to have something to do with the girl and afterwards he said he had accomplished his object. Was it possible for him to get in there on an afternoon? How many times did you see Walter Grant there? A. I could not say. Q. Would it be possible to get in there on Saturday afternoon?

A. Yes. Q. While the cooks were engaged? A. Yes.

Q. With regard to this back door, were you in the habit of seeing it was locked when on night duty?

A. I don't remember the order I got; I just don't know how long ago those three prisoners came. I have always bolted it pretty much I think from the time I took over the job. Q. No person could get into the prison without the assistance of someone inside?

A. Not inside a certain period. Q. Besides being bolted the door was also locked at night? A. Just after a certain time. I always bolted it after those three soldiers came up for 9, 6 & 6 months; the Governor ordered us to put a lock on the back door and one on the front door; last year. I always made it my duty to see it was locked at night.

Controller Hoben; Did you ever try to make the Murphy girl say Brewer was in her cell? A. No, Sir.

Q. Did Mrs. Grant ever try to find out from you who the guilty person was? A. No, Sir.

Q. I want to ask you point blank, did you ever have improper relations with Mary? A. No, Sir.

Q. Did you ever have a conversation with her as to who the guilty person was? A. No, Sir.

Q. Did you know anything of an extra dress around the girl? A. The girl was away some time before I knew anything of it; I did not see her when she was going.

Mr. Grant to Mac Donald. What were the orders I gave to you, Keating and Yeaton? A. I cannot say as to the orders. Q. My orders to the three were to look the little gate on the outside and bolt and lock both doors. A. I won't say as to the back door; I won't say as to that.

Q. And the cookhouse door was to be locked at all times? A. I have asked you on one or two occasions if I could leave the cookhouse door open to give them some fresh air and you have said, it is up to you. Q. You remember that

barred door I got made before you left the prison; it is in the carpenters shop now; What was that for?

APR 18 1914

A. In order that the cooks could get fresh air .
Q. Then why was the place left open when that gate was there ? I have warned the officers not to take risks with the cookhouse door. A. You have told me once. Q. I think I have told them all. In regards to seeing my boys in the cookhouse; you know that was against my orders and why did you not report it. You knew I forbid it and would never have them going there; why didn't you report the matter to me ? I make no concessions to my son any more than to an underkeeper or a prisoner and I would not have it. A. It is likely you gave your boys orders not to go in the cookhouse and if they would not take an order from you they would not take it from me. Q. If you had reported it once that is all that would have been needed; you or any of the officers. A. And get on the wrong side of the boys and then there would be friction elsewhere; it might not be with you, Governor Grant. Q. You have never seen me stand between the children and the officers; it was your duty to report it and I would have immediately stopped it; if the officers had done their duty the boys would not have had the chance to be there.

Controller Harris to Mac Donald; The other day a question was asked about Wilson's boots; you said it was incorrect. A. It was mentioned to me Riley's boots. Q. Wilson's boots; you said you did not take any boots. A. I took boots from Wilson. I did not wear them a couple of times. I gave him some tobacco for them and a pair of fairly good boots. I saw the statement in the paper. Part is correct. He got more tobacco than he says he got. Q. About Riley's statement ? A. I admit that as well. Q. Have you been in the habit of giving tobacco to the prisoners ? A. I have given prisoners a chew of tobacco; they would almost give their life for it. I could not afford to give them much.

Mr. Powell; Do I understand you that Walter Grant told you he had had intercourse with Mary Murphy ? A. I never made that statement, Sir. I knew Mary Murphy was pregnant. I did not hear who was responsible for her condition. I did not get it direct from anybody who was responsible; I heard she was in trouble.

Mr. Grant; This would be about March that you saw Mary coming out of Walter's room ? A. I have no dates; February or March; I came to miss Mary because I had a supper over. I rang the bell and waited; I knew Mrs. Grant was not well. Q. She was around. Walter did not move his bed upstairs until his mother was around.

Mr. Davison; I understand you to say you saw Mary coming out of a room upstairs supposed to be Walter Grant's ? A. Yes. Q. Rooms of other members of the family were in the same place and you were not sure it was Walter Grant's ? A. I saw her coming out of the room but I don't know whose room it was. He came out of the same room.

Mr. Powell; Did he have all his clothing on ? A. Yes. I came in off the womens side into the main hall and met Brewer there and looked upstairs and Brewer said there is a supper over and Mary came out of this room. That Winter Mrs. Grant was not well at all

953

APR 18 1914

times and generally trusted the officers very much.
Mr. Grant; After she got around she was never absent;
she got around the 14 or 15 February; I don't think
she was very much in her room after that.

MacDonald; I have often gone out and Mrs. Grant has
said, Mac Donald, go and get your dinners girls; Mac
Donald is out there.

Controller Hoben to Mac Donald; What time does Mrs
Grant come on duty in the mornings? A. In the
Winter time 6.30 is the time for ringing the women;
as soon as we have rung the men we go back and ring
the women; a few minutes afterwards.

Q. Would Mrs. Grant always be on duty at 6.30 in
Winter? A. No, Sir. Q. What time do you think
she would? A. At different periods she has been
on duty but in fact we have unbolted the cells and
let the women out ourselves at times. Q. In your
opinion what time did Mrs. Grant come on duty?
So far as you could judge? Would it be some time
after six thirty? A. Yes. Q. You generally got through
with the men at 7 o'clock? A. Yes, after 7. We
would let the women out of the cells and then leave
the corridor outside door bolted. Sometimes we did
not lock the door because Mrs. Grant would be down.
We generally locked the door; the corridor door.
We would come out of the corridor and bolt the door
on the outside; and sometimes we locked it and at
others we did not. There was no occasion to have
it locked the few minutes we were away; I have left
it unlocked for Mrs. Grant. In the Summer time we
rang the bell for the women at 6 o'clock.

Q. You rang the Bell and then unbolted the door
and they would walk out? A. That would be about 5.30.

Q. Is Mrs Grant on duty at that hour? A. Yes, it
is likely she is; we did not go near after we unbolted
the doors; we have done it in the Summer time; Two
underkeepers would when Mrs. Grant was not there.

Q. Did anyone around the prison tell you Brewer was
the father of the child? A. I cannot say they
ever did. Q. Did anyone ever tell you Walter Grant

was the father of the child? A. No, I cannot say;
the remarks of the prisoners were not worth paying
attention to; no definite information came to me.

Q. Any you any reason at times to believe Brewer
went into the cell? A. No, Sir. Q. Had you any
reason to believe that during any period of time
Brewer went into any girls cell? A. No, Sir.

Q. Had you any reason to believe Handsley went into
a girls cell and had connections. A. I had not reason
to believe it. I always found Handsley a good officer
and did his duty well. Q. Was there any friction at
the City prison between the underkeepers while you
were there? A. I think things went smoothly.

Q. Any friction between Mrs. Grant and the underkeepers?
A. Between Mrs Grant and myself there seemed to be
some friction. I was accused on or about the 2nd
last July of taking notes, carrying a pocket book
and of carrying stories to the controllers of doings
in the City prison. I want to know if any controller
ever got notes? I have never carried notes out of
the prison or done anything to injure governor or
Mrs. Grant. Q. There was not a very friendly feeling
between you and Mrs Grant? A. At times there was not

between Mrs. Grant and I; a coolness would come on.
I was there twenty odd years.

954

APR 18 1914

The Mayor; About this fence; you never knew personally about young Grant getting over the fence? Ther is no doubt he could do it? Yeadon or anyone else? A. I don't care to say.

Controller Hoben; Did you ever know Walter Grant to spend an evening at home during the last 18 months. From positive knowledge, between 8 and 10? A. I have seen him nearly three weeks when his young lady's father died, he might have been out twice a week then. Q. Did you ever know him to be home any other times between then and a year from that? A. I cannot recollect. He might have a cold for a few days.

Q. Do you know what time Walter Grant got home at night? Early or late? A. He would be as late as 11.30 or 12. Q. Do you know for a fact he would be coming home as late as 12. A. I certainly do; one night I am positive it was 12.

Mr. Davison; What time of the year was it Walter Grant was home for three weeks? A. A month or so Ago. About six weeks perhaps.

Mr. Grant; In regard to this friction, I don't know whether it is advisable to bring this matter up or not; it is not just in connection with this. We can bring it up or not. Mac Donald just said he was accused of taking stuff down to the controllers. Q. What controller? A. I do not know. Did he ever hear Mrs. Grant complain he had taken information down to the controllers? In connection with the matter of the Murphy girl, there was a certain gentleman that she named; two, in fact; that would be about this time last year; before this I expect. Of course we did not then think this would transpire this way. This gentleman came to the prison and asked to be admitted to see this girl and I refused to admit him according to the ordinance and he said he was permitted by an alderman. He came back about a fortnight later and I still refused and he asked me if I would take a box of chocolates and I said I would. My wife was in bed; it was shortly after the girl was admitted. Then I went to see the Alderman and conversed with him and we talked the matter over. Mr. Scanlan is the one. I said it would be better to keep the like of these people away, better for the girl, and send in Catholic ladies to talk to her which would be very much better; and he agreed and in support of this ~~was asked if it would be better~~ I said I would see a clergyman at St Josephs, which I did and he came there.

Controller Scanlan; In fairness to myself; when that young man came to me and asked for a pass into the city prison I told him to go to the prison and tell the governor I had sent him. I was perfectly innocent and was not aware of this girl's condition and I called you up the second time you did not admit him and wanted to know the reason why, and you came to my store and told me, and I said you did absolutely right.

Mr. Grant; You did not know she was that way then.

Con. Scanlan; You told me the man and made a statement.

Mr. Grant; He gave you the information; I did not give you any such information. I reported it to Mr Harris first.

Bon. Scanlan; Don't stand there and lie to me. If

955

APR 18 1914

you are on oath you are stating absolute falsehoods; I am as confident as you are.

Mr. Grant; I never told you. I told Mr. Harris.

It was in January and she was admitted on the 17th, and he came the first Sunday, and then he came a week or fortnight after; I have it marked down.

Mr. Scanlan; When I telephoned you on the Sunday night I asked you why you did not carry out instructions and you said I will see you tomorrow and you came down to my store about 9 o'clock and told me this girl was in the family way.

Mr. Grant; I did nothing of the sort; She was not in the family way.

Mr. Scanlan; You said she makes a statement and blames two young men; she blames it on a merchant doing business in the city and I said you did what was absolutely right.

Mr. Grant; I did not know she was pregnant.

Mr. Scanlan; What object would I have?

Mr. Grant; I will give you the full story.

Mr. Scanlan; I am not lying; I can prove it.

Mr. Grant; I told Mr. Harris about this girl being pregnant some time after Mac Donald came back and said it was my son Walter; that this gentleman had come back with a charge against Walter Grant. He reported after I had reported to Mr. Harris, long after I saw Mr. Scanlan. It was in April I found she was in trouble.

Mr. Hoben; Why did you not let Mr. Scanlan's friend see her? A. Because it was Sunday. Then I thought it better for the men not to come to see the girl. Then this young man came to the prison; he came to the door and Mrs. Grant went for him and said she believed Alderman Scanlan had understood this charge was made; he said, I know you don't believe me Mrs Grant, but if I never see you again, I heard of that, but he never made any charge that Walter Grant was guilty. I know you don't believe me. I never mentioned it to another soul but Mr. Harris.

The Mayor; Controller Hoben asked Mac Donald cause of friction and he said there had been between the Governor's wife and himself; he was charged with carrying news to Controllers; it is good to clear up one thing. I never saw Mac Donald in my life but once; the second time was in this room.

Mr. Grant; MacDonald and Brewer were at sore points all the time. I have no knowledge of his doing it. If I did I would put it to him.

Mr. Powell; Do you remember him being at the institution to see the Murphy girl? ~~Were~~ one or both there? Mr. Grant; They were both there. Both came there two Sundays; one of them came back on the Wednesday; Mrs. Grant spoke to him; he came back on another Sunday; I saw him on the two Sundays I refused. Controller Scanlan told Mrs Harris would allow them in and she did.

Controller Scanlan; Do you mean to tell me they went to the City Prison a third time; the first time they were refused; the second time they were refused; did they go a third, fourth and fifth time on orders from me? Mr. Grant; I don't know if they went

a fourth time; the last time Mrs. Grant called you on the phone and you said it was all right to let them in on the Sunday and they were let in.

Mr. Scanlan; After you telling me the relationship?

Mr. Grant; I never told you.

Mr. Scanlan; Didn't I tell you you had done your

APR 18 1914

duty in refusing? Why did I tell you that?
Why was it you had done your duty?

Mr. Grant; You remember a remark you made to me?

Mr. Scanlan; I ask you to tell. I never said anything I would not take back. You can't place me in any false position.

Mr. Grant; I admitted them on Controller Scanlan's order; you remember what you said? -- If that came to certain Aldermens ears; -Hoben and Whitman - it would kill you.

Mr. Scanlan; You are lying.

Mr. Grant; You said, Mr. Grant I shall not forget you for that.

Mr. Scanlan; But I don't know what you mean by that. I don't know anything about it. Why were you so timid about repeating it?

Mr. Grant; You said it would kill you.

The following letter was put in;

Halifax, April 17, 1914

Mr. H.V.Wier,
Halifax.
Dear Mr. Wier,

In answer to your inquiry as to Miss Mary Hines attendance at the Sunday School I stated that I considered her attendance perfect. Since then I have consulted the Superintendent, Mr. Wilson Creelman, and he tells me that according to the records of the school the first Sunday she missed during the early part of 1913 was on May 18th. As you mentioned the early months of the year I presume this is the record you want.

As to the second matter of her companionship with Mr. Grant we considered it quite usual for her to be with him on Sundays. Further than this I cannot say. Personally I have implicit confidence in her word. If, however, you wish further evidence I would suggest that you ring up or call on Mr. Arch Rasley one of our elders with whom Miss Hines lives.

I trust this is the information you wish.

Yours very sincerely,

(signed) C.J.Crowdis

Pastor of Grove Church.

Archibald Rasley, called;

In answer to Mr. Davison;

I live on Longard Road. Miss Hines lives with me. Her Christian name is Mary. She has been with me since she was 18 months old. She has lived with me continuously. She attends Grove Church Sunday School. She keeps company with Walter Grant, the Governor's son. She sees him frequently. Every night. Except when she was away on vacation. He is at the house every night. He leaves there generally about 10.30 or 11. He is there every Sunday afternoon until about 5.30 if he goes to tea; at other times he stays to tea. She never misses going to Sunday School. He meets her there and stays until 5.30. That has been going on since 1912. I have never known him to miss a Sunday when she was in the City; or an evening, to my knowledge. She was away for a month or so in Sydney; she had a month's ticket. She went to see her mother; I don't know whether it was in August. I think part of July or part of August.

957

APR 18 1914

That is the only occasion when he was not at the house in the evening or on Sunday afternoon. He was there every Sunday night; they were both in the choir. I am her uncle. She lives with me. I am home every night unless I am at prayer meeting.

958.

Board of Control Chambers,

City Hall,

April 24th, 1914.

The Board of Control met this morning at 11.30 o'clock. Present Deputy Mayor Powell, Chairman, and Controllers Harris, Hoben and Scanlan.

George Street Widening at Cragg Corner
F. J. Cragg, and W. A. Henry, his counsel, appeared

before the Board, claiming that when Mr. Cragg was erecting his new building at the corner of Barrington and George Streets, the City compelled him to place said building back from the street line, causing him to lose a strip some seven inches deep by about forty-five feet in length, for which compensation is claimed. Referred to the City Engineer for an early report.

Robie Street Boulevard

Read report City Engineer recommending that the boulevarding of Robie Street be continued north as far as Jubilee Road. Approved, and ordered to be forwarded to the Council for concurrence.

Bill Boards Ordinance

Read notification from Provincial Secretary of the confirmation of the ordinance relating to bill boards recently passed by the City Council, ordered to be forwarded to the City Council for its information.

Young Avenue

Read letter F. G. Zwicker re Young Avenue. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Loan for Widening Streets

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Harris that the recommendation recently submitted to the City Council for authority to borrow yearly a sum not to exceed \$1,000 for the acquisition of land for the widening of sidewalks be amended by increasing said amount to \$5000. Motion passed.

Underground Electric Wires

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller

Engineer

Council

Council

Engineer

Council

April 24th, 1914.

Hoben that the recommendation for legislation in re requiring the placing of electric wires underground, be withdrawn, and the following recommended to the City Council in its place:

PLACING WIRES UNDERGROUND.

That the City Council ask the Legislature of Nova Scotia to amend the Public Utilities Act so that an application may be made by any municipality to the Public Utilities Commission for an order to compel any public utility to place its wires in underground conduits in any streets of such municipality.

Motion passed.

Gasoline Street Pumps.

It is decided to recommend to Council amendments to the clause relating to gasoline street pumps, providing that the installation of same shall be subject to the favorable recommendation of the Chief of the Fire Department and the City Engineer.

Information re Transfers of Property

In respect to the draft act relating to the furnishing of information to the Assessors relating to property transfers, referred back to this Board with recommendation for amendments, it is decided to withdraw said bill, the Board to consider suggestions for the obtaining of such information without the necessity for legislation.

Gattinger and Young Sheds - Hennessey Property

The resolution of Council amending the proposed legislation in re purchase of property from Gerald B. Terman, fixing the amount of expenditure at \$3,500.00 is agreed to.

Plumbing in Dwellings

Read communication from City Health Board reporting that E. J. Fenton, owner of premises #76 Cornwallis Street, had been notified under the provisions of the

April 24th, 1914.

by-laws of the City Health Board to remove the privy building, empty, disinfect and close up the vault in yard of said premises, and construct a proper water-closet connected with the sewer, and had failed to comply with the orders of the Board in that behalf, and requesting that the Board of Control would do said work under authority of section 664 of the Halifax City Charter.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Harris that the request of the City Health Board be complied with, and the work done accordingly.

Engineer
~~Further~~ Therefore resolved that the City Engineer prepare specifications of the proposed work, and be directed to obtain tenders for same, and to report the same to the Board.

Also read letter City Health Board, calling attention to the fact that plumbing work referred to the Board as follows, has not yet been attended to;

Premises 62 Seymour Street, July 17th, 1913.

49-51 Bilby Street, Mrs. M. McLaughlin, July 31st 1913.

16 Grafton Street, 25 Or Creighton St., Alex. Baxter, 17 Albemarle St., Wm. Tuck, August 22nd 1913.

346 Maynard Street, Mrs. J. Fader, November 18th, 1913.

28 West Street, James Meagher, January 8th, 1914.

Engineer
Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Harris that the request of the City Health Board be complied with, and the work done accordingly.

~~Further~~ Therefore resolved that the City Engineer prepare specifications of the proposed work and be directed to obtain tenders for the same, and report the same to

April 24th, 1914.

the Board

Police Motor Cycle

The tenders for motor-cycle for the Police Department are again considered.

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller Scanlan that the tender of T. L. Connolly, \$325.00, be recommended to the City Council for acceptance. Motion passed unanimously.

Council

Policeman Boyle Hack Inspector Salary.

Read report Chief of Police, recommending that Policeman Phillip Boyle, now performing special duty as hack inspector, be given \$50.00 per year for said extra duty while so employed.

Chief of Police

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller Scanlan that the Chief's recommendation be concurred in. Motion passed unanimously.

Preston Street Water

H. S. Horn appeared before the Board in connection with proposed water extension, Preston Street. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Engineer

Oxford Street Sewer and Water

Alderman Murphy requested that the water service be extended along Oxford Street at the same time the sewer is being constructed there. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Engineer

Underkeeper City Prison

Read application J. P. O'Freddy for position of Underkeeper at the City Prison. Filed.

North West Arm Sewer

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller Hoben that the Board recommend to Council that the Board be authorized to instruct the City Solicitor to prepare legislation in re acquisition of right of way for the North West Arm trunk sewer, and submit same to the Legislature, providing that the owners of property in

Council

April 24th, 1914.

line of said right of way shall be restricted in the appointment of arbitrators in their behalf to the total of five persons for the whole right of way, any one of which five persons may be finally selected by any property owner as arbitrator in his behalf, in connection with the expropriation of his particular property.

And also a clause enabling the City to determine after the valuations placed upon the properties are disclosed, whether or not the City shall acquire the rights in said property, and also whether the City will take property in fee simple, or only rights as a right of way. Motion passed.

The Board adjourned.

Council

W. R. Powell

Deputy MAYOR.

Powell

L. D. Moraghan

CITY CLERK.

Board of Control Chambers,

City Hall,

April 27th, 1914.

The Board of Control met this morning at 11.30 o'clock. Present Deputy Mayor Powell, Chairman, and Controllers Hoben, O'Connor, Harris and Scanlan. *Newfoundland Sealing Disaster* Prime
Read letter Hon. John R. Bennett, Acting/Minister of Newfoundland, thanking the City of Halifax for the resolution of sympathy in connection with the late sealing disaster, for proposed donation of \$1,000.

Filed.

De Wolf's Wharf Sewer Outlet
Read letters Hon. Senator Roche to the City Health Board, and to Controller Hoben, relating to the condition of Water Street, and of the sewer cut-fall at the Mackay-Bennett wharf. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Refunds of Liquor License Deposits
Read application J. E. Donohoe and Charles AuCoin for refunds of liquor license deposits. It is decided to recommend a refund of \$8.00 in each case.

Francklyn Street Drains
Read letter Presbyterian College re surface water west side Francklyn Street. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Moving Picture Theatre License
Read application R. L. Wamboldt for license for moving picture show, at St. Patrick's Hall. The Secretary is instructed to notify Mr. Wamboldt that application must be made by the owner of the building/

Robie Street Light
Alderman Brown asked that an electric light be placed on Robie Street, south of South Street. Referred

April 27th, 1914.

to the City Engineer for report.

Ocean Terminals Inspection

Read letter Robert W. Hunt & Co., Montreal,

offering services for inspection and testing of structural steel, pipe and cement. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Winter Port - British Mails

Read letter Board of Trade, requesting the

City to appoint a delegate to visit Montreal and Toronto and ask the support of the Boards of Trade there, and to accompany a delegation from the Board of Trade of Halifax to Ottawa for the purpose of endeavoring to have the Federal Government name Halifax as the winter/port in the contract being arranged with the different steam lines interested.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Harris that the request of the Board of Trade be complied with, and that Deputy Mayor Powell be appointed as such delegate. Motion passed unanimously.

City Charter

Read application John A. Macdougall, Glace Bay, for a copy of the Halifax City Charter. The City Clerk is instructed to send a copy to Mr. Macdougall.

Dumping of Rubbish on Streets

Read letter Merchants' Bank of Canada, complain-

ing of the dumping of street rubbish opposite the Bank building. Referred to the City Engineer to remedy.

Vulcanizing works Rottenburg St -

Read letter D. C. Gillis for M. E. Gillis, owner 31 Birmingham Street, objecting to the erecting of a vulcanizing establishment, 8½ Rottenburg Street.

The City Clerk is instructed to advertise a

Engineer

Ja Macdougall

Engineer

Chronicle Recorder

April 27th, 1914.

notification in the newspapers that the Board will hear persons interested in the matter at Friday's meeting, at 11.30 o'clock.

Childrens Protection Act - Fees.

The City Clerk lays upon the table a copy of House of Assembly Bill No. 159 entitled "An Act to Amend Chapter 4 of Acts of 1912", Childrens' Protection Act, under which the fees payable by the City are proposed to be increased to \$150. Filed.

Salary of Clavey Collector's Office

Read application Robert Clancey, a sub-collector in the City Collector's office, for the continuance of the annual payment to him of \$100 for the inspection of water fillings.

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Scanlan that the application be complied with. Motion passed.

Premises not Metered

Controller Harris called attention to premises Herbert Burgess, Robie and North Street, and Hugh Brown, McCully and Robie Street, stating he had been informed that the stables there have not been metered. Referred to the Clerk of Works for attention and for report.

Cunard Street Widening

Moved by Controller Hoben that the City Engineer at once notify Dr. A. C. Hawkins that he will on Wednesday, the 29th inst., begin the work of removing from Cunard Street the obstruction caused thereby the south end of Dr. Hawkins's house, unless Dr. Hawkins, previous thereto, commences the work himself, and satisfactorily proceeds with the same. Motion seconded by Controller Harris, and passed unanimously.

Staff Collector's Office

Read letter City Collector, recommending the

*Clerk of Works
Engineer
Auditor*

Clerk of Works.

Engineer

April 27th, 1914.

appointment of Miss Eva Wrayton, at \$700 per year, to the vacancy caused by the death of Louis R. Kaye, and of J. N. Monaghan, at \$500 per year, to take Miss Wrayton's place; and also recommending the appointment of a temporary clerk to open books for the present year. *Deferred.*

Dalhousie College - Morris Street

Moved by Controller Hoben, seconded by Controller Harris that the City Council be requested to authorize the Board to submit to the Legislature an act enabling the City to expropriate for the extension of Morris Street, properties of Mrs. R. M. Taple, of the Estate of W. M. Harrington and of Harry Murphy, and to borrow the sum necessary therefor.

S. J. Harrivel.

Moved by Controller O'Connor, seconded by Controller Scanlan, that the letter handed in by S. J. Harrivel, and which has been perused by the members of the Board, and which has not been read in open meeting, be retained by the City Clerk in his possession for future inspection if desired. *Motion passed unanimously.*

Expenditure Balance Fire Dept Appropriation

Moved by Controller Scanlan, seconded by Controller Hoben, that the Fire Department be authorized to deviate to Fire Department expenditure already agreed upon, for replacing horses, improvements West Street and Grafton Street Houses, purchase of supplies and equipment, etc., up to the limit of the appropriations for that service. *Motion passed.*

*Auditor
Chief Fire Dept*

City Council Meeting

April 27th, 1914.

The Deputy Mayor submits a requisition signed by Aldermen Gastonguay, Covert and Hines, and Contrd- lers Hoben, O'Connor and Scahlan, for the postpone- ment of the adjourned meeting proposed to be held on Tuesday evening, and for the summoning of a special meeting for Thursday evening, the 30th inst. Agreed to, and the City Clerk instructed to cancel Tuesday night's meeting, and call a special meeting for Thursday night.

Tenders for Printing &c.

The tenders for printing blank books, stationery, and advertising are opened;

Newspaper Advertising.

Acadian Recorder,	1st insertion, per square,	\$0.75
" "	each continuance, "	.40
Morning Herald,	1st insertion, "	1.25
" "	subsequent insertions, "	.42

Referred to the City Clerk to endeavor to obtain from all the daily papers tenders passed upon the total amount of advertising done yearly by the City and report.

Printing Annual Civic Report, 1913-14.

Imperial Pub. Co. Ltd.	per page	\$1.85
T. C. Allen & Co.	" "	1.68

It was decided to recommend that the tender of T. C. Allen & Co., being the lowest, be accepted.

Blank Books.

A. & W. McKinlay, Ltd.,	as per schedule.
T. C. Allen & Co.,	" " "

Referred to City Clerk to figure out which is the lower tender, and report.

April 27th, 1914.

Stationery

T. C. Allen & Co., according to specification, as per schedule.

Soulis Typewriting Co., Ltd., for typewriting supplies only, according to specification, as per schedule.

Referred to the City Clerk to figure out which is the lower for typewriting supplies and report.

Salary Hack Inspector
Controller Harris informs the Board that the City Solicitor had advised that the Board of Control had no jurisdiction to increase the pay of Policeman Boyle for performing special duty as hack examiner.

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller Scanlan that the City Solicitor prepare legislation empowering the City to pay Phillip Boyle \$50.00 per year for special duty as hack inspector, while so employed, and to borrow the sum of \$50.00 for said purpose for the year 1914-15, and repay the sum from the assessment, 1914-15.

The Board adjourned.

J. P. Boyle
MAYOR.

L. J. McLaughlin
CITY CLERK.

-968-9

Board of Control Chambers.

City Hall,

April 21st, 1914.

The Board of Control met this afternoon at 3.30 o'clock. Present Controllers Harris, Chairman, Scanlan and Hoben, and Alderman Powell.

City Prison Investigation.
The investigation into the affairs of the City Prison was continued.

John J. Power, K. C., interrogated, said,

I know Stephen George Brewer, an ex-keeper of the City Prison. He brought an action against Dr. A. C. Hawkins. The writ was issued July 15th, 1912, appearance filed July 22nd, claim delivered August 19th, defence delivered September 26th, reply delivered September 30th, notice of trial October 2nd. On March 13th, 1913, notice of trial was served. The trial came off in due course 15th April, 1913. The action was dismissed because Brewer did not appear. Brewer's counsel told witness that Brewer had gone to Boston 14th April, and that he (Brewer's counsel) had notified Brewer on April 12th or 13th that the trial would come off on the 15th. Costs of the action were taxed at seventy five dollars odd against Brewer. Brewer had gone away without the knowledge of his solicitor. Brewer remained away until July, 1913. When he returned on the 17th July 1913, an order was made in the Supreme Court by a commissioner against Brewer to pay Dr. Hawkins the cost of the action. Asked if he knew why Brewer came back to Halifax, witness said Brewer claimed he could not get work in Boston. Brewer is, or was, paying on the order granted against him. Brewer in his defence did not plead justification. Brewer on his return to the City could have applied for an order opening up judgment, but he did not do so.

W. H. Handsley, City Prison Keeper, recalled.

I never found the locks of the women's corridors unlocked in the mornings on going to let the prisoners out. Mrs. Grant is the last to lock the doors of the women's corridors at night. On going my rounds at 9 o'clock at night, I never found the doors of the women's corridors unlocked except on one occasion, but that night I found one of the corridor doors unlocked because the kitchen girl had not yet been locked up by Mrs. Grant. Never heard of the locks

~~925~~ 970

April 21st, 1914.

being in bad condition. Ever since I have been there the orders have been to have the back doors of the prison locked, and they have always been locked so far as I know. The doors of the men's corridors on the lower floor have always been locked, but not the men's corridor doors on the upper floor. The long-term prisoners are kept in the corridors on the lower floor. Never saw the Grant boys in the cook-house. I have been just ten months keeper at the City Prison today. My evidence, of course, only applies to the last ten months.

George Yeadon, Keeper City Prison, recalled.

The locks on the women's corridors are always locked. I always found them locked, and never found anything wrong with the locks. I was appointed an underkeeper three days after Brewer was appointed an underkeeper, and was there with him all the time he was in the employ. One mornign out of three I would be with Brewer opening the doors of the women's corridors and cells. The back door of the prison was always bolted, and afterwards, by the Governor's orders, they were both bolted and locked. When women were working in the kitchen, the keepers would not lock the women's corridor doors, Mrs Grant would do that when she was locking up the women who worked in the kitchen, and we would find the corridor doors locked when making our rounds at 9 o'clock. I have often locked the women's corridor doors when Mrs. Grant was putting the kitchen women in for the night. Mrs. Grant was the last to lock the women up. I have been there as keeper for a year and nine months. During all that time I never unlocked the doors of the women's corridor in the morning alone, there was always someone else with me when doing so. I never locked the women's corridor doors alone, Mrs. Grant or Mrs. Brown were always with me. Do not know how long Mrs. Brown was there with Mrs. Grant - she was there over three months. in the mornings another keeper was always with me when opening the doors, I never went alone. Never found the padlock off the door in the morning. Never saw improper or suspicious conduct at the prison. Never saw any quarrelling between Keepers Brewer and MacDonald except once, when they were disputing as to whose right it was to a certain holiday. Never saw women prisoners making advances to the keepers, or keepers to the women prisoners. I never climbed the prison fence to get in at night. Do not know whether Walter Grant had a key to the front door of the prison or not. He was out practically every night. I generally go to bed about 9.30. When I was in town at night, I often walked home with Walter Grant. Generally made arrangements to meet him on the way home at the corner of Gottingen and Duffus Streets.

~~929~~ 971

April 21st, 1914.

about 11 o'clock. When Governor Grant gave orders that the back door of the prison should be locked he said it was so that the women working in the kitchen could not get out. Previous to that the back door was only bolted. If the back door was bolted, any person could get into the prison from the back.

~~970~~

972

APR 21 1914

(L.F.M.)

Mrs. Martha Grant, recalled;

I remember gentlemen visitors going to the City Prison to see Mary Murphy in April last. On one Sunday, I think the first Sunday in April, two young men came to see her. They were not allowed to see her; they were told Sunday was not a visiting day at the prison.

Shortly after that they did see her having been admitted on an order from Controller Scanlan. They were to the prison twice to see her but were refused admittance. The third time they came they saw her. They were Thomas Brown and Jack Travis. They were under the influence of drink. I was present during all the time of this conversation with Mary Murphy. They called Mary "Susie". There was some talk about the payment of money for her keep if she was put in an institution on account of the condition she was in. There was talk about the condition she was in. One of them said, "Well Susie, if our names don't come out will pay all all expenses, no matter where you are put". They said she could not get them into trouble anyway because there were half a dozen other fellows besides them. She replied she had not received money from any one. Brown said, but Mrs. Coles did, - you saw me give her \$13.00 once. Mary said, Yes, but that's not me. They said they were perfectly willing to pay \$115 (\$150) for her keep in the Salvation Army Home or any other home - Infants Home - so long as their names did not get out. She said she would not go to any Roman Catholic Home. Speaking of the payment of the money for her keep at the Salvation Army Home, I said he could take it over to Miss Clarke at the Salvation Army Home on Tower Road and pay her. He said, Oh, No, I would not do that; I would not go near Miss Clarke. I will see the rest of these fellows and see if we can make it up and if so I will call you up and say, All right, come down; or otherwise I will say, No, I cannot do it. Then, he said, you can give it to Mr. Wier and he can pay it. I said, All right. There is the conversation between Mr. Brown and I. He never phoned me at all; I never heard anything more of it.

(R.E.)

Mr. Powell; Did you ask, How much money are you going to pay ?

Mrs. Grant; No, they told me \$150 at the home. I didn't ask them what they were going to pay; it was immaterial to me. I never said anything about money. They asked me, are you going to contribute anything to it; and I said, No.

On the next Wednesday after the Sunday he came to the prison and said he wanted to see Susie; I said, No. Then this counter charge came in against my son; I said, I don't care for Controller Scanlan or all the controllers in Halifax you won't see her. Then I went to the store. That would be in June last year; I think last June. June she got her ticket.

Con: Scanlan: When was he there after the 3rd April. A. On the following Wednesday. He came in April to see Mary on a Sunday, and he came the next Wednesday after.

Q. Was it in the month of June that these two men went there and you refused them admission and said you would not allow them to see her ?

973

A. I never saw Brown or Travis from April until I went in June to the store. I think it was June. After April I never saw anything more of him until June; the ticket was written for. sometimes we write four or five months before. The following Wednesday after the Sunday they returned but I would not allow them to see her; I did not care for Controller Scanlan. He said, I know Mrs. Grant what is the trouble now; you blame me for that charge; I know nothing of it Mrs. Grant. I said, Brown, it is a funny thing if the charge was put in and you know nothing of it. He said, if I never see you again, I know nothing; it has all come from Mr. MacDonald; I know nothing of it.

The Sunday afternoon when Mary's condition was discussed Mary was there all the time when Mr. Wier was there. They brought chocolates and lime juice on the Wednesday I would not allow them in. I did not go to Brown's store until the following June, two months after.

Mr. Powell; Did any discussion take place about money; did you ask him how much money he was going to contribute? A. He asked me what I was going to contribute, and I said, I am not going to contribute; why should I?

Q. Did you suggest he should contribute to this girl's medical attendance; and that she should go to the Salvation Army Home? A. I said Mr. Wier had partly made arrangements for her to go there and he said he would not go and pay Miss Clarke.

Q. Did you ever make application or discuss the matter down there? A. Never; I only discussed it with Mr. Harris, Brown and Mr. Wier. I never asked them to contribute and if they say so they are saying something that is not true.

In answer to Controller Hoben; I went to Brown's store in June; I went according to promise; I promised him I would go and let him know; he promised to pay money when we got the ticket of leave. I went according to promise Mr. Wier partly made arrangements in the Salvation Army Home for her. I expected him to go to Miss Clarke and pay according to his own words.

Q. You went in June and suggested he should take some money over to Miss Clarke? A. I never mentioned Money matters at all; he told me to make arrangements with Miss Clarke. He said he would see this other man and see what they could make up and give it to me to give to Mr. Wier; he was to say, All right, Yes or No; and he never said another word.

Q. You say Brown never told you he would not give money. A. No, he never did.

Q. I want to ask you if you ever saw a bundle of letters in Mr. Wier's possession written by Mrs. Virtue? A. No, I wrote to Mrs. Virtue and told her about being to Mr. Brown. I had three or four letters from Mary; I have them home. I have no objection to the Committee seeing them; not a particle. I wrote Mary and told her Brown would do nothing for her. I told her that because he had not done so; he was to say, Yes or No, and if I did not get that word he would do nothing.

Mr. Harris; After the conversation with Mr. Brown you came and told me what had taken place? A. Yes, and I went and told Mr. Wier too.

Mr. Harris; The story she gives here now is exactly the same story she gave to me.

Mrs. Grant; Mary wrote to me and told me she was going to write to Tom Brown for money and I told her in one of my letters I would not do it. He would not do anything for her because he was to telephone and say if he would do anything.

Con. Hoben; There is a letter here written by Mrs. Virtue on January 11th to Mr. Wier.

(Letter read)

Con. Hoben; If Walter Grant is to blame we don't want to blame anybody else.

Mrs. Grant; I don't know anything about those letters.

Con; Hoben; There is another letter here; this is a statement of Mrs. Virtue.

(Letter read)

Mrs. Grant; The morning she went away Mac Donald did not come on duty until eight o'clock; he was not there at all; she was on the train at eight o'clock. Are you prepared to believe that statement of Mary ?

Con; Hoben; She has convinced Mrs. Virtue of the truthfulness and Mrs. Virtue says she thinks she was telling the truth. You did not know about those letters &

Mrs. Grant; I did not know of them before they were read now. Mary is a prostitute and a perfect one at that; are you going to believe her evidence against me and my son ?

If these prostitutes are to be believed then there are a good many aristocrats whose names are put up to me who could have their names carried a great deal further than they would care to have them.

Con. Hoben; These prostitutes you speak of were called into the City Prison to give evidence .

Mrs. Grant; I did not give that (snapping her fingers) for one of their words.

Con. Hoben; We have Walter Grant's word on the one hand --- Mrs. Grant; It would be a funny thing if my son was in the house and I did not know what he was doing. I do not know his doings outside but while he is in I have my eye on what he is doing.

In reply to Con; Scanlan; The first visit of these two men to the Prison was on a Sunday afternoon two or three days after she came there; I don't know on whose instructions they came there. The second visit they were refused admission; they went on your orders they said. Con; Scanlan; That is correct. The next visit was in April at my orders. The third visit you say was in April ? A. Yes, along in April.

Con. Scanlan; The second and third when both were refused was at my orders; the first visit they went at nobody's orders; I can prove that; if that is questioned I will have those two men here. It is material to this extent, that the information I got about the condition of the City Prison I got from Mr. Grant; he denies that.

Mrs. Grant; It was after the second visit that Mr. Grant telephoned you and he went to your store. ~~Subsequently~~ After the second visit on your orders.

Mr. Powell to Mr. Wier; ~~xxxx~~ Do you remember the Sunday afternoon you were called in with these two men there ? A. I remember it. I remember the conversation about money matters. I gave the Controller of the prison the following Monday morning a memo of that. I would like to see it and refresh my memory.

(Read by Mr. Harris, dated May 12th)

APR 21 1914

Mr. Wier; On the Sunday afternoon I called in there I found in the private parlor of the governor, Mrs Grant, Mary and this gentleman mentioned here. The conversation that took place during the time I was in as far as I remember I made a note of it, ~~and~~ when I arrived home that evening. The next morning I reported to Mr. Harris; I thought him the proper man to have the information and in substance that paper contains the conversation.

Mr. Powell; Did they ask Mrs. Grant how much she was going to pay or contribute? A. No, I do not remember that. That was asked in his own store.

Mr. Harris; There was a conversation on April 26th Sunday and Mrs. Grant was present when that conversation took place but Brown and Travis were not there. ~~Mrs. Grant;~~ Mr. Wier; The conversation I had in April, it was then Mary first told me her condition; I did not know anything of it until April.

(Controller Hoben read letter dated September 3rd, 1913, signed "Johnny".

Mrs. Grant; I had nothing to do with getting her there. Mr. Wier was top, bottom and all. I had nothing to do with it.

Controller Hoben; This letter was intercepted and it was never intended to reach an investigating court.

Mrs. Grant; I did not know anything about it. The only thing I can tell you is that both these men acknowledged their guilt.

Controller Hoben; But they were not the father of the child. Mrs. Grant; I have a great doubt in my mind.

Mr. Davison; Under what circumstances was Dr Harrison called to make an examination?

Mrs. Grant; He was attending myself for six months attending to a hurt I got from wrestling with a woman in the ward; Dr. Harrison came and I told him; he was not summoned to see the girl; he came to see me and I told him of the girl and he said, well, do you wish me to see her; and I said, Yes. she was then doing up the keepers room and we went upstairs. I did not bring Dr. Harrison there to see her; he told me just the time he thought she was; I was not present when he examined her. I had no special reason for wanting him to examine her only that I felt I could talk to him; he was our family physician; anyway I would not feel like talking to Dr. Trenaman. The reason Dr. Harrison Made the examination was because he was on the spot. Dr. Trenaman saw her on two occasions; I don't remember the months; shortly before she went away; she was suffering terribly from pain and I sent for him and he did not come when I sent. I telephoned the infectious hospital if Dr. Trenaman went there to send him in and he came and spoke to her in the Committee Room and made plans to send her to the City Home. I do not know the date. I first learned of her pregnancy about the first part of April. I told Mr. Harris. About the first of April. The girl according to her own story had a bad reputation. She had been refused at some institutions; she was twice out at the Monastery of the Good Shepherd; When she was 14 they sent her back home to Sydney. She came from there in the first place; from Cape Breton. The first part of her life she was with a clergyman there, Father Mc Dougall, from the time she was a mere child, 8 or 9 years old.

APR 21 1914

She lived there until he sent her to New York and she would not stay there. This is her story, and I simply don't believe it but I am giving it as she gave it to me. You really cannot believe these prostitutes stories. She told me she had had a child when she was 14 years of age; she wrote letters mentioning little Harry and asking that he should be looked after. She had it at Sydney. She told me this story in the prison when she first came there. The child is down with her mother in Sydney. I do not know who is supporting the child. Her father sent her up here; she went to the Monastery committed from Sydney and they sent her back as they could not control her; she was incorrigible and they sent her back. Then they sent her back here again to the Monastery and they could not control her there again and they sent her to us; her and another girl escaped and went to a road house on the St. Margaret's Bay road. She told me she was there three or four weeks; I would not be sure. She was recaptured and put back in the Monastery and they would not keep her and the sisters telephoned me several times to know how she was doing. They sent her to the City prison as the only place to put her and the responsibility was put on me. She told me they took her one time and clothes and all put her into a cold water bath.

Mr. Wier; There is not a man in connection with this investigation but knows this girl is a liar and a prostitute.

Mr. Davison; I want to ask you about locking the women's corridor. A. The Corridor that the kitchen woman was in I locked every night after I put her in provided she was not in before. Mary was not in that corridor for a while, during the time the pipe fitters were there. Q. During January, February and March they would be all in the same ward and you say you locked that every night? A. Not every night; some nights the keeper locked up. After the kitchen girl was put in I locked it. The locks worked all right; I never had any trouble in the world with the locks. And I am sure I locked it every night after I put the girl in. Q. Brewer says it was never locked. A. I know different to that and if it was not locked they came after him. There was once or twice they went around before I locked the kitchen woman in. It was house cleaning time and we wanted to get it done and they went their rounds before the kitchen woman went in. When that kitchen girl was put in every night I locked the corridor and Brewer's statement is positively false. Q. There was a statement made, I think in your former evidence, that Mac Donald had been seen taking hold of one of the girls in the kitchen? A. I saw it myself. Fanny Newcombe, he took her by the leg. He did not see me I was in the pantry; he just grabbed her by the leg. I have brought the locks with me. These were the locks on the women's corridor during the time Mary was there. They are in use now, one on the tool house and one on the cell the women's clothes are in.

(The locks were examined and Brewer's keys were used and tested).

Mr. Davison; It would be pretty hard to force that. Brewer said these locks could be easily forced.

Mrs. Grant; we have new locks now. I took them off

APR 21 1914

because the keepers all had keys and now no one has the keys of the corridor except my husband and myself. This is the diary kept by my husband and the entries are all in his hand writing. Mary came there on January 17th.

Mr. Davison; I have gone through this diary and find the same report during those three months, January, February and March. You will see the same thing; - Underkeeper MacDonald on night duty, reports all correct; the same with Brewer; there is not a single exception.

Mr. Harris; There is a variation of the hours of reporting all correct; have they a regular hour.

Mrs. Grant; Yes; that is all in Mr. Grant's handwriting.

Mr. Davison; Did you ever know of MacDonald going to the corridor when he was there? A. I have gone there in the day time and seen him coming out. His duties ought not to take him there. On one occasion he told me he was looking for me and thought I was there. It happened twice only I think. I was in once and once I went there and found him there. He had nothing to do with the female prisoners in the day time. He rang the bell and drew the bolts in the morning and came with me and gave them their meals and came with me at night and locked them up.

Mr. Davison; It was believed by Mary that these men were the men who had got her into trouble

Mrs. Grant; There was an investigation and Mr. Harris was up and took her statement; in regard to those two men, at that investigation it was believed they were the men and the matter went no further because it was believed did not get into trouble while in prison. She made an affidavit to that effect.

Controller Hoben to Mr. Wier; You remember on January 27th, 1913, you wrote a letter to the Minister of Justice after the girl was in prison; she had not been there very long. You had seen her once or twice and had investigated her character pretty well; You spoke of her being a liar and a prostitute; you knew that when you wrote that letter?

A. No; I am speaking now in the light of later knowledge. When I wrote that letter I considered her more sinned against than sinning. That was before I knew she was in the family way.

She has been proved to be immoral since that letter was written. I wrote that letter in the light of a girl of 19 who had never had a chance to become decent and respectable and I thought under proper influences she could be made a proper member of society. That was very shortly after I saw her. The day after I saw her. I got data before I wrote the letter. She has told a good many falsehoods since then.

Mr. Harris; The statements given in Montreal are a tissue of falsehoods. I brought that to her attention and she still stuck to her story.

Mr. Wier; One fact sticks in my crop. She made a sworn statement and in the light of events over which she had no control it has shown the statements were false. Someone in the prison got her in the family way.

Mr. Davison; You said she had never had a chance.

Mr. Wier; I refer to the girl's career from the time she was a child. I know her career fairly well from the time she was 7 or 8 years old. I consider she never had any chance; it is an unfortunate chain of circumstances.

Mr. Davison; There was some criticism by one of the members of the Committee as to your havinf sent her to a home in Montreal. Had you any reason ?

Mr. Wier; Yes. I found a difficulty in placing her in an institution here; one did not want her and another would take her if I found it impossible to place her elsewhere. One institution did not know very much about her but I had to tell them plainly.

Mr. Davison; Did she express any desire to be sent to this particular home ?

Mr. Wier; Yes; she wanted to get away from this City into a strange place where nobody knew her. She was very anxious if I could do anything to get her away.

Mr. Harris; After examining her evidence and her statement I say she is a liar, prostitute and everything else.

Mr. Hoben; That girl's father and mother are living not far away and it is a hard thing to throw that into the parents face, but they had not proper control over their child apparently.

Mr. Davison; Why was she not living with her parents.

Mr. Wier; With their consent she left home and went elsewhere; that is her statement to me; afterwards confirmed.

I am at the basis of this investigation and I realise the responsibility when I wrote that letter and brought on the investigation. I ask this question; as I understand it, you are investigating along the lines as a civic Committee; under civic control; that will deal with the administrative side of the institution and to my mind I would like to see it deal with the responsibility of the parentage of the child which is now in the hands of the public as well as the mother. The girl was an inmate or a ward of the City of Halifax when it took place; she was in one of our institutions and the responsibility is there somewhere. I do not know whether it is the intention to touch that side of it; there are two sides; she is entitled to protection. What is going to become of the girl.

Mr. Powell; Would you be prepared to sign a report naming the person who is guilty after hearing this evidence; to name the father of the child ?

Mr. Wier; No, I would not go that far; I would go this far; I would send that evidence to the Attorney General and ask him to investigate the criminal side of it. From the evidence you have there you have material to put it in a certain channel.

Mr. Hoben; Prggnancy took place in the City Prison and it took place while the City was in charge of her.

Mr. Scanlan; The management of the City prison, as it should be; that is my idea of what we are investigating. When that letter was laid on the table we were not sure this girl got into this condition in the prison. Now we are all fully convinced it did occur in the prison. Finding that positive assurance we are to deal with the management of the City prison as it should be; we are not here to decide who is the guilty party.

Mr. Wier; My contention is this; I ask the chairman and I urge upon this Board that they hand the evidence to the Attorney General and he should take that evidence and fasten the guilt on the right party.

Mr. Scanlan; I agree with you there.

Mr. Hoben;

APR 21 1914

Mr. Hoben; If we are going to fasten the guilt on an individual the only way is through the statement of the girl.

MR. Scanlan; She made an affidavit in the City Prison in the atmosphere of the Governor, Matron and the prison surroundings. You can say what you like, that declaration at the City Prison and the one in Montreal; I have much more faith with the one in Montreal; But Mr. Wier must remember she was under the influence of the Governor and matron and they could treat here a little different; I don't want to think they did extend to her favours the others did not get. When she was in Montreal she was in charge of a lady who was treating her as a mother does a child; In Montreal when she made this affidavit accusing the young man as father of the child she was away from their influence and anyone connected with the prison and being spoken to only by the matron of the institution counselling her to mend her ways and turn over a new leaf and the probabilities are the girl has told what is absolutely true. I don't say ~~any~~ one man had connections with her in the prison.

Mr. Harris; After she had been released I went to get the statutory declaration; she was under no restraint; Mrs. Grant was not present.

Mr Davison; I want to refer to some of the principal points of the evidence brought out in the investigation. In the first place, as I stated at the outset of the examination, it would be very unsatisfactory owing to the fact that the evidence could not be taken under oath, and that it ~~was~~ was probable very contradictory evidence would be given, and it would be difficult to weigh carefully, and the investigation, I thought, should have been referred to the County Court Judge in the first case. There is provision in the Charter for the case to be heard by him. My objection was met by the statement that this was merely an investigation into the administration of the prison generally and it was not the intention of the Committee to ascertain by the evidence to be given, who was the person who had committed the offence by which this girl had got into trouble. But since the evidence has been given it is now necessary to deal with it as taken. In the first place, I should say with regard to Mr. Grant, the Governor of the prison, in my own opinion there is not the slightest evidence brought out in this investigation to show anything in the nature of wrong doing or neglect of duty on his part. There was some evidence to the effect that some laxity existed in regard to the locking of the corridors and the back door and I think, Mr. Chairman and gentlemen, you are well satisfied from subsequent evidence there is absolutely nothing in that evidence. It was given by Brewer, who was underkeeper at the prison for sometime, but the Committee found it necessary to discharge him because of unfaithfulness to his duties and during the course of this investigation he has been examined on several occasions and shows himself an exceedingly poor witness. He has contradicted himself in a number

APR 21 1914

of particulars, and besides that, contradicted by a great many other witnesses who have been called, on very material points. Then there was the further evidence of Mac Donald in regard to the women's corridor being left open at night, but he was not nearly so emphatic as Brewer, who went so far as to say it would be possible for any person to get from the yard into the female corridors at any hour of the night if he chose to do so. He explained that by saying there were no locks on the corridors or on the back door, or if there were they were so bad they would not hold and that it would be a very easy matter to force the locks and walk right in. We have had these very locks here and the keys, and Mr. Controller Hoben tested these locks and I think every one here is quite satisfied that these locks are as good as any that could be procured, and that Mr. Brewer's evidence with regard to that is as false as other evidence he has given on this investigation. This also implicates Mac Donald who gave some evidence as to the condition of these locks, but I think that is a matter very clearly settled by the evidence of Mrs Grant who said that she locked the corridor every night after the kitchen girl was put in, and also by the evidence of Handsley and Yeadon, two reliable, faithful, underkeepers now in the employ of the City, one of whom, Handsley, has been reinstated by this Committee, temporarily at all events, showing they certainly place considerable reliance on him or they would not reinstate him even for a temporary period. And I have to say with regard to that phase of the evidence the laxity is admitted to be shown in regard to the locking of the corridor and the back door.

Next is the Mary Murphy case. I judge from the remarks made by some members of the Committee that possibly Mr. Grant is to be blamed for that occurrence but I submit there is very clear evidence here to show that this act was committed by an underkeeper appointed by the City Prison Committee or Commission of the City Council over the protest - over the strong protest - of Mr. Grant. Mr. Grant cannot carry out the duties of his position unless he has reliable underkeepers in whom he can trust. He stated in his evidence; give me men of integrity as underkeepers and I will run that institution as it should be run. Mr. Grant has no say in the appointment of these underkeepers; he is obliged to take and use whatever men are sent there by the City Council or the Board of Control. A lot of the evidence has been given with a view of implicating Walter Grant, the Governor's son. I submit there is no evidence here of any reliability against Walter Grant. It first starts out with a sworn affidavit made by the girl before she went to Montreal in which she states under oath he had nothing to do with it. Then she goes to Montreal and Controller Harris has an interview with her in which she says Walter Grant was the man responsible for the act. She has told different stories to different witnesses on many occasions in regard to this matter and I submit that her character is of the worst possible; going back to her earliest

APR 21 1914

days we find this girl became a prostitute at the early age of 14; was sent here to Halifax; she went to the Monastery of the Good Shepherd; they could do nothing there and had to send her back to Sydney; They sent her back here again to the Monastery of the Good Shepherd, they could do nothing with her at Sydney; she escaped from there and the next place we find her is in a house of prostitution on the road. Being recaptured she is attempted to be put in the Monastery but the girl's character was so absolutely bad they would not take the responsibility of keeping her at all. They would not take her there, and there was only one place in Halifax where she could be put, that is in the City Prison; and the Governor and the Matron have no option, as they had at the Monastery, but they are compelled to take her in and assume the responsibility no one else will assume; and they are not only compelled to keep her there but required to put her to work about the institution; if they could take that girl and lock her up in the corridor she would be perfectly safe but according to the rules laid down for the management of the City prison she is to be kept at work, and the only work to do is the house work; she has got to be about the house. Mrs. Grant found the work best fitted for her was the bedrooms; she had to do the rooms of the Governor Matron, Underkeepers and the Grant boys; the work of a servant, as in any other house except that Mrs. Grant kept a watchful eye on her and was as strict as she possibly could be. On one occasion she saw her talking to a plumber; she did not see anything however, nothing but mere conversation took place between this pipe fitter and this Murphy girl, but thinking it a suspicious circumstance she to see she was kept from any fear of intercourse with any many about the institution she took and locked her up and kept her there as long as the men were employed about there, and put another woman to do the work that this girl had been doing; showing that Mrs. Grant was taking every possible precaution to guard this girl against having intercourse with men in the institution. So much for the character of this girl. Besides the false statements she has made; besides her generally bad character; an accomplice of the man who committed this crime - and it is a very well known rule of evidence, known to the legal gentlemen of this Committee - the evidence of an accomplice is never considered sufficient by the courts to convict the other party; it is considered very lightly indeed; Now, this girl has been shown to have sworn falsely, to have told various statements about this matter at different times, and an accomplice whose evidence is of the weakest possible character. That is the evidence against Walter Grant. You may say there is every evidence; Mrs. Virtue's letter and a postscript written by one of the men first mentioned, Brown; the evidence is not independent and comes from some tainted source as evidence given by this girl simply founded on her statement which is now no better than the other statements she has made about this matter.

Now we come to the evidence of the Sunday afternoon when Brewer and Mac Donald say they saw this girl coming out of Walter Grant's room.

APR 21 1914

I want to ask you to consider this in regard to Brewer's evidence; he is an interested party; anxious to shift these suspicious circumstances from himself to the first person on whom he can fix it to clear himself. He was interested in giving that evidence; the interest was to clear himself. Mac Donald also states that he saw this girl coming out of Walter Grant's room on the same Sunday afternoon; neither of these men could fix any dates at all, one says it might have been before, during or after Mrs. Grant's illness; "I simply cannot fix the date." The other man says I have no way of fixing the time at all. Mr. Wier's evidence will throw some light as to what Sunday it was. It appears there was only one Sunday they were late getting out of church and his evidence shows that that Sunday was New Year's Sunday; the first one after New Year's Day; before the Murphy girl went to the institution at all. She did not go until the 17th January and this particular Sunday in which they were kept late in church was about the 1st of January. That, I think, clearly disposes of the evidence of both these men so far as that particular Sunday is concerned. But we have further evidence; we have the evidence of Miss Hines who gave her evidence in a frank, convincing manner to the effect that Walter Grant was with her every Sunday afternoon from 3.30 to 5.30, leaving her at her house at that hour; never before 5.30; after that he would walk home which would take about 20 minutes or half an hour; that is to say, Walter Grant could not possibly have got to the institution before 10 to 6 or 6 o'clock on any Sunday night from December 1912 up to the time that girl went away to Sydney in August last. There was some comment made on the evidence to the effect that it was the most damaging evidence ever given against Mr. Grant and his son. I was unable to see at the time where the damaging evidence was and so expressed myself, but the matter did not go any further. In order to clear that I brought Mr. Rasley, who fully corroborated what Miss Hines had said and we also have in evidence a certificate from the Grove Sunday School showing that she did not miss a single Sunday from Sunday School from December 1912 until the time she went away to Sydney. I submit that that evidence given by these two discredited ~~the~~ underkeepers that they saw her coming out of Walter Grant's room on the Sunday afternoon is completely answered by fixing the date when the church was kept in late and also by the evidence of Miss Hines, the church register and the evidence of Mr. Rasley. I think that the true explanation of that evidence given by Mac Donald and Brewer is that it was the same afternoon Mrs. Grant says she sent that girl up to do something in connection with the fire. They mention only one time that this girl was seen coming out of Walter Grant's room; except at other times when they said he was not there; on this particular occasion they say he was there, but I say the evidence shows he could not have been there but it must have been on Saturday afternoon and MacDonald was there standing with his hand on his chin when she sent her up to Walter Grant's room. That is the possible explanation of the evidence given by these two men. It is very reasonable. There has been some evidence given by

983

APR 21 1914

Walsh and Cokely, two ex-convicts, one a bigamist and the other a thief, long term men, that Walter Grant was in the cookhouse on Saturday afternoon and told him in the baldest way he had had connection with Mary Murphy; in cross examination he was asked if Walter Grant had mentioned anything else and he had not; he just came in and blurted it out. I think that evidence is of the weakest possible kind. Consider those convicts giving evidence against this boy and which is open to the gravest suspicion because of the bald character of it. Now, Brewer says that Walter Grant told him he had had connection with the Murphy girl. Walsh states here, he told me what Walter Grant had told him, pretty near the same he told me. On looking through Brewer's evidence Brewer says Walter never told me anything of the kind. With regard to the evidence of the other man Cokely, he says he is not sure whether Walter Grant was in the cookhouse on Saturday afternoon or Sunday morning but the other man says definitely it was on Saturday afternoon. With regard to the evidence of these two men we have the evidence of a number of witnesses to the effect that Walter Grant could not get in the cookhouse; it was always locked; we have the evidence of Handsley who says it was always locked; and Yeadon says the same thing. Mr. Grant says the same and James Wilson says the same thing. Yeadon says Walter Grant could not have got in the cookhouse unless he had a key and we have further evidence to show he never had a key. Also, these other underkeepers now in the employ of the City have both said emphatically they never saw Walter Grant about the cookhouse at any time; they said they never saw him there. He says himself he was not in the habit of going to the cookhouse; he was never there. With regard to this conversation detailed by Walsh and Cokely; Walter Grant denies this in to-to; he says he never made any such statement to those men. Are you going to take the evidence of two ex-convicts in preference to the evidence of this young man? And when you look at all the evidence given against him you will see in the first place it consists of the evidence of this girl whose character we have been discussing, the evidence of two discredited underkeepers, one of whom had to be dismissed by the City and the other sent in his resignation to simply forestall the action of the Committee and the evidence of the two ex-convicts; that is the kind of evidence you have against Walter Grant. The evidence should be regarded with a great deal of suspicion on account of the witnesses against him and also the fact that some witnesses were interested in putting it on him. When we come to the evidence against Mr. Brewer I think there is a complete chain there without a single break. First we start out with the evidence of Yeadon in which he says that Brewer told him that he would like to have connection with Mary Murphy; then we have the evidence of Mrs. Grant who states that on the night of the 21st January she saw this man Brewer coming out of the womens corridor; it was a very easy matter for

984

APR 21 1914

for him to get in; he had the key of the corridor, and the governor was away; it was a very easy matter for him to get in if he wanted to.

This evidence of Mrs. Grant is corroborated by three female prisoners at the institution. Some comment has been made of the character of these witnesses and possibly that evidence may be a little open to suspicion, but I submit independently of the evidence of these three women, we have a clear and emphatic evidence of Mrs. Grant given with every possible detail, that he was seen coming out of the corridor on the night of the 21st January and she had special reason why she remembers it because it was the night she was confined and she was up while her husband was getting the nurse for her. What is Brewer's explanation? How does he meet the evidence? He said, I was not in the institution at all, I was in the gate house while the governor was away, with Mr. Crust a prisoner. What was he doing in the gate house while he was away? It was the only night while he was employed there that he stayed there. Why there on that particular occasion except to try and prove an alibi; that is to say he was not in the institution at the time Mrs Grant says she saw him coming out of the corridor. That is the only explanation he gives of that circumstance. But we have further evidence against Mr. Brewer on that point; we have the evidence of Mrs. Grant who says that Mac Donald came home from town one night and told her he had heard in town that Brewer had gone away because he might be blamed for the Murphy incident. That evidence is strongly corroborated by Mr. J.J. Power, called here today. He states there was a suit brought by Brewer against Dr. Hawkins for libel in which he, Power, was acting for the defence; that the case was ready for trial at the November sitting and it went over until April sittings; at the April sittings (they opened on the 14th April) Brewer hurriedly departed from Halifax leaving his case, which was dismissed when called for trial and he had judgment for costs of the action taken against him which he was subsequently compelled to pay. This date, April 14th, would be just about the time that ~~xxxxxxxxxxxx~~ word of this girl's condition would have leaked out from the institution. Mrs Grant says she first heard of it on the 1st April. It would be some little time before the news would leak out and I submit there is no other evidence here to show why Brewer went to the United States and remained two or three months at a time when he had an important suit coming on and which resulted, as a matter of fact, in the suit being given against him and judgment recovered, where he might have recovered himself had he been here. I have commented on the character of the evidence given against Walter Grant; I also want to mention that given against Mr. Brewer to show the difference between the different witnesses; the first witness against Brewer was Yeadon; he is well

APR 21 1914

known as a reliable faithful underkeeper at the institution; the next evidence is that of Mrs. Grant and Mrs Grant's evidence I submit bears all the ear-marksof being true and I do not see any reason for any doubt whatever being cast upon her evidence. The next evidence by Mr. Power; also the further evidence of Grant as to this man having gone to the United States fearing he would be blamed for this incident. I submit there is a complete chain of evidence against Brewer which has not been met in any particular. That is the man I say who is responsible for the trouble at this institution ; a man placed there over the protest of the governor without any power on his part to refuse to take this particular man. That is about all I have to say about this case. In the first place, I think the evidence given against Walter Grant is exceedingly weak, and the evidence given by men in whom no reliance can be placed. The other evidence is corroborated by other witnesses in good standing, and I would ask you gentlemen, if you are going to make any finding on this particular point (I understood from the discussion that was before I spoke it is not the intention of the Committee to make any specific finding,)but I agree with the expressions of some members of the Committee this is a matter to be investigated by the courts. It is all right for the Committee to investigate the administrative side, but this is a criminal matter and the evidence in that case should be given under oath in accordance with the rules of evidence.

Mr. Scanlan; Mr. Davison has made a very able defence and we will study it very carefully but in his remarks there he mentioned Brewer's name as being linked up with this girl but in none of the evidence of this girl, or in her affidavit, has she mentioned Brewer as having had connection with her. She makes a statement that Walter Grant has had; also that two men outside of the prison did, whom she originally blamed as the father of the child, but in no part of her evidence or in any statement, has she blamed Brewer as being the father of the child, or ~~be~~ having had connection with her. If she had made a statement at the prison when she saw it had occurred while confined at the prison that it was Brewer there would be some evidence.

The following statement by Mr. Wier was put in by Mr. Harris;

I was called in by Mrs Grant when Brown and Travis were present on May 11th. I asked what I could do and said they must do what is right. Brown was afraid of publicity. "When my friend Scanlan telephoned me I felt that everybody in town knew of it and looked me as if I were guilty". I said, "Any publicity would come from somebody else not from me." Mrs. Grant spoke about the girl and they answered her by suggesting that they were in a position to look after her. I have had a talk with Miss Mac Donald at the Infant's Home. She is a friend of mine and it will cost me \$115.

APR 21 1914

4

to have her looked after there. I am so afraid about this matter that I have consulted my lawyer. Had worried over it and lost sleep. His lawyer advised him that others were responsible and they could not make him responsible or make him marry the girl. I said that this was not a matter of law but of conscience and said that the time was coming very soon when somebody would have to put up some money and they said they would put up the money and asked to whom they would pay the money. That would have to be settled later. Brown said there were others willing to help.

987

CITY PRISON INVESTIGATION.

City Hall.

Friday, April 24, 1914.

The Board of Control met at 4pm.

Present;- Controller Harris, Acting Chairman;
Controllers Scanlan, and Hoben; and Deputy Mayor Powell.

(L.F.M.)

Thomas Brown Called;

I am acquainted with Mary Murphy; went to see her because I knew her before she went to the City Prison. She had been in the Monastery of the Good Shepherd but escaped from there. She told me she was a Catholic and I told her to go back to the Monastery. She promised to do so, this was before she went to the City prison. She did not go back to the Monastery and was taken back there. I heard she was in the Police Station and went there to see if I could get her away. The next I heard she was in the City prison; This was somewhere about January 1913. I went to the Prison to see her about the end of January or the first part of February; I saw Mr. Scanlan. I made there or four visits to the City prison altogether. The second visit was about a week after the first one. On the third visit I was informed Mary was in trouble; this was April, May or June. A friend of mine telephoned me and told me she was in trouble and he thought I had better go and see her. I said it was none of my funeral but he said you had better go and so I went. It was Controller Scanlan who told me she was in trouble. I saw her at the prison. Mrs. Grant and the girl and Mr. Travis were there at the time. Mrs. Grant asked me if I had any objection to Mr. Wier being present. I did not know Mr. Wier but said I had no objection to him coming in. Mrs. Grant told me that Mary had confessed everything. The girl was looking down towards the floor; I told her to look up and to tell everything; to tell the whole truth. So far as I remember she did not say anything in reply. Said nothing at all. Mr. Wier was talking to her and I have been trying to think what he said but I cannot remember. If you ask me questions about it I may be able to tell you what was said. I never saw Miss Mac Donald of the Infants Home about Mary. I know Miss Mac Donald but I never spoke to her about the Murphy girl. I don't remember asking Mrs. Grant how much a confinement case would cost. Mrs. Grant did ask what we were going to do about it. She said the girl was free, or almost free - that the ticket of leave papers were made out.

(R.E.)

It was on a Sunday Mr. Wier was present. I got no information at any time from Mrs. Grant as to the cost of a confinement; no sum of money was mentioned. I never consulted a lawyer. I remember Mr. Wier saying it was not a matter of law but of conscience. The only way I promised to help the girl if she was let out was to send her home but I would not have anything to do with the child racket. I would help her as a friend and I made that clear right there. I don't see why I should say there were others to help. I was advised not to call

APR 24 1914

any more; there was some trouble in the prison or something of that kind. We called on the following Wednesday, we had promised to bring chocolates etc and we brought them and Mrs. Grant began to tell us something about her son being mixed up and she said the idea of her son being mixed up in a case like that, and she asked me if I was going to pay anything and I don't know just what I said. Mrs. Grant mentioned her son first; she took it for granted as far as I remember that we knew. She said somebody was blaming her son; she mentioned Mr. Mac Donald but I had never heard of him before. She asked me how much I was going to pay in connection with the affair. I didn't like the way she asked and I asked her how much she was going to pay. We had a few lively words and I don't just remember what Mrs. Grant said. She called at the store and told me the time was about up; that didn't seem very long after. I have no idea when it was. Mrs. Grant said June; that may be correct; a good while before Mary left the prison. I think that Mrs. Grant told me she had been down to see some one on Tower Road at the Salvation Army and she told me how much it would cost and asked me if I would be willing to pay. I didn't know what to do about it; I didn't want to get mixed up and told her I would let her know later. I did not feel under any responsibility to pay anything at the time. She said, let her know at 6 o'clock; but I never telephoned her or have not seen Mrs. Grant since. I was to telephone her if I was willing. No one told me any particular person was the father of the child. I never told anybody else to blame it on somebody. The reason I asked Mrs. Grant how much she was going to pay was because I was a little piqued at the way she spoke; I had heard that there was some trouble in the prison, that Mrs. Grant's son was implicated; I did not know whether it was right or who told me. Mrs. Grant also told me that time would tell; I remember that distinctly. Travis was present when I had these interviews with Mrs. Grant. We went together on every occasion. He was not with me when Mrs. Grant called at the store. She called to tell me this girl was ready to go away and if I would pay the expenses; I think at that time she was expected to go to the home on Tower Road. ~~It~~ I took it for that. The charge was \$100; I am not sure. That was the last conversation I had about it with Mrs. Grant. I do not know that Mary Murphy ever accused me.

Mr. Harris; You spoke about this Sunday; Mrs. Grant said something about papers at Ottawa. ~~Max~~ I think you must be confusing two interviews because there was no application at that time - on May 11th. there was no application for release from prison. Do you think ticket of leave papers were referred to by Mrs. Grant at the May interview?

Mr. Brown; The Sunday we were there they were mentioned.

Mrs. Grant; The day you came; the first Sunday you saw me, you were told Mary was in this condition; the first Sunday you saw her. A. Yes, that is right I was told.

Mrs. Grant; You said there were many others as well as yourself; I made no remark. Mary said, Well, I have not received money from any of you. You said to Mary, No, Mary (you called her Susie) you didn't but you saw me on one occasion give Mrs. Coles \$13.

APR 24 1914

A. I don't remember saying anything of the kind. If I did, it is not true.

Mrs. Grant; You said, you remember me giving Mrs. Coles \$13 at one time. Mary said, Well, that was not me.

A. One day I was up there and this woman gave me \$13 to keep for her and I gave it back to her.

Mrs. Grant; You said, but you knew it was for Mrs. Coles, the proprietress. A. I am sure I did not say that.

Mrs. Grant; You said, as far as making you do, nobody could make you because so many others as well as yourself. A. I don't remember.

Mrs. Grant; You say I mentioned money matters to you at the door; never did I. On the Wednesday you came up and wanted to see Mary and I said, No you wont, I don't care for Controller Scanlan or any of them. A. I remember that.

Mrs. Grant; I said you would not see her, and you said, Well, perhaps it is better not for all concerned. I said, I know what you are coming at. You said, That is about your son. I said, You will see, time will tell and we'll know all about it. You pleaded with me in the room on the Sunday and at the door I should go to your store and let you know. A. I didn't do any such thing.

Mrs. Grant; You pleaded with me; you said you would ~~not pay anything in connection with that affair if your name got out, but if your name didn't get out you would pay all expenses and lots of others willing to help, and willing to pay Miss Mac Donald \$115.~~ pay nothing at all in connection with that affair if your name got out, but if your name didn't get out you would pay all expenses and lots of others willing to help, and willing to pay Miss Mac Donald \$115.

A. I don't remember it.

John Travis, called.

APR 24 1914

Q. You have heard what Mr. Brown has said; do you differ in any respect? A. No, about the same, I guess. I was not present when Mrs. Grant called at Brown's store. I knew Mary about a month before she went to the prison. We dropped in Mrs. Coles three times. After she went to the prison I remember the two Sundays we were not admitted. I remember the occasion when Mr. Wier was present and another when Mr. Wier and Mrs. Grant were present. I think it was in February.

Mr. Harris; The diary of the prison does not show that. It happens to be May 11th; I am only pointing that out.

Mr. Travis; I do not remember Mr. Wier being called in and suggesting that this is not a matter of law but of conscience. I never consulted a lawyer about my position in the matter. I do not remember Mr. Wier saying time was coming when somebody would have to pay some money. I do not remember either Brown or myself saying that we would put up something. They were not in the room ten minutes and didn't say many words. I do not remember Brown saying the others would help; I cannot throw any further light on the situation. Mary was in the room when Mr. Wier was there. I was there all the time Mrs. Grant was talking to Mr. Brown. When Brown and I took up candy Mrs. Grant came to the door. Mr. Grant was not there. Mrs. Grant and we two; the three of us. I did not have anything to say to Mrs.

Grant; Brown did all the talking. I confirm what Brown says, the best part of it. I did not wait until it was finished; I went outside. The girl was upstairs looking over the door with a big child I don't know whose it was. I have answered a letter she wrote from Montreal. I have torn the letter up. She asked me for money to go home. I sent all the money I could afford, \$15. I don't remember the contents of the letter. She told me she was going to a hospital in Montreal; I don't know where she was when she wrote the letter; somewhere in Montreal. I do not know the address, I had to write to Mrs. Virtue, Montreal. She told me she was going to a hospital very soon; in a couple of months time; I am not sure whether that was in September or August; in the fall some time. She mentioned Walter Grant's name in the letter. She did not say anything that happened between them. She just said he used to be with her once in a while. She did not say he had got her into the trouble. I cannot remember all the words. I thought then that he had something to do with her. There was only just what she told me in the letter, he was with her up there.

Controller Hoben; Did you tell her to blame that on Walter Grant or not to? A. No.

Q. Did you advise her not to make any communication about him. A. I never said a word since I last saw her. Q. Did you ask her to shield Walter Grant. A. I told her in a letter if Walter Grant had anything to do with her to keep it quiet and say nothing. I thought Mrs. Grant was the cause of getting her away and I did not want to see him getting into trouble. I sent the money and she did not get it. We did not send it for their use but for her passage home.

APR 24 1914

She wanted it for the passage home and Mrs. Virtue wrote and told me she had spent it on clothes for her. I did not expect anybody to see the letter I wrote. As a matter of fact I did not expect any one but her to get the letter.

(Letter read)

Q. When U wrote that letter were you endeavouring sincerely to shield him from having his name brought it ? A. I did not want to see him mixed up in the trouble any more than myself. I don't know him.

Mr. Hoben; I say frankly the letter looks that way.

Mr. Travis; She never answered that letter; I got a letter from Mrs. Virtue about the 15th; I wrote a letter a good while after and asked about the \$15.

Mr. Harris; Mrs. Virtue wrote December 17th, reply to your letter in December; A. That was in reply to a letter I wrote asking if she got the money. The address was on the letter Mary wrote. She told me to write in care of Mrs. Virtue. Mrs. Virtue did not acknowledge it. It was a good while after that I wrote and asked her if it was received. I sent the money On September 3rd and I did not get any acknowledgment until December 17th.

Mrs. Grant to Mr. Travis.

Q. Did you ever write to Mary in Rockhead ? A. No

Q. Are you quite sure ? A. I am positive.

Q. Was there any talk or is this not a fact, that you asked Mary what she did with certain things you gave her. Did you ever ask her about anything she had belonging to you ? A. She had a pair of Scapula that belonged to me. She did not ask me if I had anything of hers. I had a medal; I did not show it to her.

Mr. Davison; When you were writing that letter to her she had not given you any information to the effect that Walter Grant was the father ?

Q. She only mentioned in the letter ~~being~~ his being with her. She did not mention about anybody getting her into trouble. There was nothing to show who was to blame.

Q. Are you quite sure you did not write a letter to Mary soon after she went to the institution; a couple of days after ? A. I wrote nothing to her in the city prison. I wrote one letter to Montreal and one to Mrs. Virtue, asking about the money. Those are the only two letters I wrote in connection with her.

Mrs. Grant; She was four days in the institution when she got a letter. She told me it was signed Johnny ~~xx~~ and Tom sent love to her.

Mr. Davison; Did you ever hear the conversation between Mr. Wier and Mary ; A. I did not follow the conversation; I was not interested in it. I remember Mr. Wier saying that Mary made a confession but he did not say what the confession was.

Q. What about the conversations ? Just what Mrs Grant said outside the door. The only conversation we had with Mrs. Grant was the Sunday we were in there We went up there and we were only in the room once inside the prison, the day Mr. Wier was there. The next conversation was at the door when we were not allowed in; that was between Brown and Mrs. Grant.

APR 24 1914

Controller Scanlan; In conversation with that girl at the City Prison did she ever lead you to believe that if she got out she wanted to get away from Halifax and that she did not want to go into a Catholic Institution. ? A. No.

Q. Directly or indirectly she never intimated to you that she did not want anything more to do with Cathlic Institutions ? A. No, not to me.

Q. You say you gave her a pair of Scapulas; how did you learn that these were taken away from her.?

A. She said in the letter from Montreal; she said she would not be allowed to have them or she would have to go to the Salvation Army; she said in the letter she had to do everything they did and go where they went.

Q. You are sure that letter has been destroyed ?

A. It was burnt long ago. I don't know whether before I answered it or not. I kept it in my pocket until it was mouldy.

Q. My reasons for asking these questions are to bring out Mr. Wier's reply to my original question at the Board of Control; why he sent her to a Presbyterian institution. As far as I am concerned it shows a lot of light.

Mr. Powell; There was a young man you are acquainted with on the D.A.R. What is his name ? A. Mulcahy ? I don't know his first name. I don't think he is in the City. He went to Bermuda or somewhere.

(The question Mr. Powell desired to put in regard to Mulcahy was ruled out of order).

Mrs. Grant; The Sunday you were at the prison, did you not ask me, Mr. Brown, if you could not take Mary for a drive if you were to bring a hack for her ? I said, not it is impossible I could not do it, and you said, Could you not come with us ?

Mr. Brown; I don't remember saying that.

Mr. Davison; You say you don't remember such a statement when you were leaving the institution. You said you would like her to go and she said she would like; you won't say that remark was not made ?

Mr. Brown; I don't remember it. I would not say it was not made. It would be a funny remark to make, to let a prisoner go for a drive.

Mr. Travis; I am sure it was not said; as far as I am concerned.

Mr. Davison; You don't remember her calling you "Johnny" as you were leaving ? A. ~~She~~ She just said Good-bye; I don't know whether she called me "Johnny" or "John". I remember her saying "Johnny" or "John" when she said Good-bye.

Mr. Davison; (to Mr. Wier) You remember the Sunday afternoon in question when these two gentlemen were in the prison. A. I do.

Q. You remember the conversation between Mrs. Grant and Brown ? A. In part I do. Mrs. Grant asked me if I would go across the corridor, two gentlemen were there; I went with her and these two gentlemen were in the room with Mary and Mrs. Grant. I asked, what can I do for you; I addressed it to nobody. Mrs. Grant explained about Mary being there and the Murphy case and there was some discussion between them; I could not say what the words of the discussion were but my impression was the girl being pregnant had to be taken care of and my impression was these two were there in that connection.

993

APR 24 1914

I think I made a remark, and yet it might have been other words, I said it is not a matter of law but of conscience; I remember saying to Brown distinctly you will consider it and do what is right in it; and I remember Brown saying he was not alone in the matter, he would see the money was raised; during the conversation the amount was stated as \$115. I left them all in the room but just as I was leaving, Mary, with a smile on her face spoke to Travis, mentioning his name and saying I wish I was going out with you, Johnny; or I would like to be going out with you Johnny. And he naturally replied, I wish you were, or words to that effect. I don't think he called her by name. It was just the most casual remark that anybody would make. The absurdity struck me because, of course, she was a prisoner. I never knew anything about this going for a drive. The girl said she wished she was going out.

To Mr. Powell; by Mr. Wier; Q. He mentioned the \$115 and brought the question up; A. That was between Mrs. Grant, myself and Brown. Q. He brought up money himself. A. I would not want to say positively about that; I did not know and I asked, and I am not sure whether Mrs. Grant or he said \$115.
Controller Scablan; I think the calling of these two gentlemen was a move in the right direction.
Controller Harris; After hearing Mr. Wier do you remember anything more that would corroborate or contradict him? Mr. Travis; I do not remember anything except that she made a confession.
Mr. Wier; They said they had consulted a solicitor and were advised they were not liable and there were others implicated. Mr. Brown; I never saw a solicitor. Q. Did you ever have an interview with Mr. Grant about this? A. We never had an interview.
Controller Hoben; When you went up the first Sunday? A. Mr. Grant was not present when we interviewed the girl.

Mr. Grant recalled;

Controller Harris; Is there a ~~xxxxxx~~ barbed wire on the top of the fence near the gate?
A. On the front gate, No. Q. Has there been?
A. Not along the top of the gate. There has not been for some years. Not since 1913 when I went as governor. Q. In February 1912? A. No.
I consider Mr. Wier a useful man there in his capacity. I have no objections to his being continued; he has done good work. I cannot enumerate his services; he helps the prisoners.
Q. Should he have the assistance of a clergyman?
A. There has been assistance lately. the Parish Priest of St. Joseph's has been there on several occasions. I have no recommendations to make in regard to the religious side of prison methods. Ministers of various bodies come there but Mr. Wier is there in the interests of all concerned. I do not know what his religion is.

994

Board of Control Chambers,

City Hall,

April 29th, 1914.

The Board of Control met this morning at 11.30 o'clock. Present His Worship the Mayor, and Controllers Harris, Hoben, Scanlan and O'Connor.

Cunard Street Widening
Dr. A. G. Hawkins appeared before the Board in connection with the encroachment by his house at the corner of Cunard and Gottingen Streets, and asked for a further extension of time. He called Mr. H. E. Gates, his architect, who informed the Board that plans for alterations to the building are now completed, and that specifications for the alterations will be out to tender tomorrow. It will require seven or eight days to get the tenders in. He saw no reason why demolition of the obstruction should not be begun within ten days.

Moved by Controller O'Connor, seconded by Controller Hoben that Dr. Hawkins be requested to enter into a bond in the sum of \$300 to commence within a fortnight from today the removal of the obstruction, and to carry on the said work expeditiously, and for any failure, to forfeit the sum of \$300, the City Solicitor to be instructed to prepare the said bond today, and to have the same signed by Dr. Hawkins.

Dr. Hawkins informs the Board that he will sign such a bond. The motion is passed.

Cook & Daw Water Bill - Construction
Robert Daw appeared before the Board requesting a rebate in a water bill rendered Robert Cook, a

*Solicitor
Engineer*

995

April 29th, 1914.

*Eng. Hoben
Engineer
Clerk's works.*

partner of his, \$7.35, for building repair work. Mr. Daw said that he and Mr. Cook were willing to pay one-third of the amount billed for. Referred to Controller Hoben, the City Engineer and the Clerk of Works for report.

Council

Sidewalks

Read report City Engineer re permanent sidewalks, Sackville, Salter and Jacob Streets. Approved.

Gottingen Street Sidewalk

Engineer

Alderman Riordon appeared before the Board, stating that the sidewalk ordered some time ago for the east side of Gottingen Street from Gerrish to North Street had not yet been constructed. The City Engineer informed the Board that there are still some seven or eight sidewalks on the Order Book ahead of the Gottingen Street sidewalk, but that that work will be overtaken this year.

Cornwallis Street

Engineer

Alderman Riordon also calls attention to the dangerous condition of Cornwallis Street, from Brunswick Street to Lockman Street. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Duffus Street

Engineer

Dr. Hawkins informed the Board that Duffus Street had been gutted out by surface water. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Ocean Terminals - Road diversion Fairview

Council

Read report City Engineer re road diversion at Fairview. Approved.

Fleming Park

Council

Read report City Engineer re Fleming Park. Approved.

Works Department - Horses

Council

Read report City Engineer recommending that he be authorized to purchase two working horses. Approved

Kane and Creighton Streets Light

April 29th, 1914.

Engineer

Alderman Parker submits a petition for the installation of a light at the corner of Kane and North Creighton Streets. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Street Sprinkling by Fire Dept - Works Dept to Pay.

Controller Scanlan informed the Board that there is a watering cart at the West Street Fire Station, which the Fire Department has hitherto used for street sprinkling. Since the placing in commission of a motor fire engine, the horses formerly used in the sprinkling cart have been sold, and now the Department has no horses for the service. Having gone carefully into the matter, he was prepared to recommend, notwithstanding that the Fire Department would not, excepting in the winter time, need them, that two horses be purchased out of the Fire Department appropriation, and used during the summer for street sprinkling, provided the Internal Health Department would pay the Fire Department \$20 per horse per month, the cost of maintenance only. Controller Hoben stated that no provision had been made in the Internal Health appropriation for this service. His Worship the Mayor suggested that the matter be deferred until Friday's meeting.

Controller Hoben asked permission to retire from the meeting.

Controller Scanlan consented that the matter be deferred until Friday's meeting.

King's Place.
Read report City Engineer re King's Place.

Approved.

Water Rates & Construction Co.

Read letter Mclean, Paton, Burchell and Halston,

Council

April 29th, 1914.

on behalf of the Nova Scotia Construction Company, complaining of excessive charges for water supply in the construction of the new railway pier at Cunard's Wharf. Referred to the City Engineer for report, with instructions to notify Messrs. Maclean and associates when his report is ready for presentation to the Board.

Engineer

Ocean Terminals - Pleasant St. Diversion

Council

Read report City Engineer re temporary diversion of Pleasant Street. Approved.

Refund of Liquor License Deposit

Council

Read application Ellen Meagher for refund of liquor license deposit. Ordered to be recommended to the Council for a refund of \$3.00.

Ocean Terminals - Fire Apparatus Young Ave & Bower W.

*Engineer
Solicitor*

Controller Scanlan calls attention of the Board to the fact that it is impossible at the present time for fire apparatus to pass through Bower Road or Young Avenue in case of fire. Referred to the City Engineer and the City Solicitor for report.

City Medical Officer

Read application Dr. W. F. Smith for position of City Medical Officer. Filed.

The Board discussed the matter of temporarily appointing a person to fulfil the duties of Medical Officer. His Worship the Mayor suggested that pending the appointment of a City Medical Officer, the Controller in charge of each Department should be at liberty in case of emergency, to employ necessary medical attendance

*Members
Council and
Officials*

The City Clerk is instructed to write to the members of the City Council and the City Officials requesting them to attend the funeral of the late Dr. Trenaman, City Medical Officer, at 3.30 o'clock tomorrow afternoon,

998

Old Exhibition Lots.

April 29th, 1914.

Engineer
Read extract from minutes of meeting of the City Council, April 22nd, in re subdivision of building lots Old Exhibition Property. Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Tenders for Printing, Stationery &c

Read report City Clerk re tenders for advertising, blank books, and stationery, as follows:-

April 28th, 1914.

The Board of Control,
Gentlemen:-

In compliance with the request of the Board, I have interviewed the daily newspapers in the City in an endeavor to secure from them tenders for the City's advertising, based upon the total amount of advertising done by the City yearly,

For the past three years I have totalled the amount of the City's advertising, and found it to have been approximately as follows:-
1911-12, 223 in., 1912-13, 193 in., 1913-14, 254 in.

The Chronicle, Echo, Herald and Mail inform me that for that amount of advertising they could not offer the City a rate lower than it has been their custom to tender for, and that they would therefore submit no tenders for the proposed scheme.

Council
The Acadian Recorder informs me that their tender is based upon the long established custom of doing the City's advertising at lower than commercial rates, and that if any new tender were submitted it would probably be a much higher rate than the present tender.

I have compared the tenders of T. C. Allen & Co. and A. & W. MacKinlay for blank books, and found the tender of A. & W. MacKinlay lower than that of T. C. Allen & Co. I have also compared the tenders of the Soulis Typewriter Co. Ltd. and T. C. Allen & Co. for stationery supplies, and found the tender of T. C. Allen & Co. to be 75¢ lower than that of the Soulis Typewriter Co.

L. Fred Monaghan,

City Clerk.

999

April 29th, 1914.

Approved.

Gottingen and Stanley Streets Lights

Alderman Parker asked that a light be installed on Gottingen Street at the corner of Stanley Street Referred to the City Engineer for report.

Engineer

Purity of Water Supply - H & S W Ry.

Controller Harris stated that whilst on a train of the Halifax and Southwestern Railway yesterday, he had taken occasion to observe that the doors of the water closets on the passenger cars are not locked, as required, while passing the lakes from which the City draws its water supply, and that he had found the same actually in use there. The Conductor on the train, whose name is Allen, of Lunenburg, informed him that he had never received instructions to have the doors locked.

Council

Moved by Controller Harris, seconded by Controller O'Connor that the City Clerk call the attention of the Provincial Health Board to this matter, with the request that the regulations respecting the locking of doors be enforced. Motion passed.

Dilapidated Buildings Campbell Rd - J C Ry.

The City Clerk is instructed to notify Mr. Gutelius, General Manager of Government Railways, that the two dilapidated buildings on Campbell Road, to which the Board previously called the attention of the Department, had not yet been demolished, and asking that the matter be attended to.

J P Gutelius

Salaries and Duties of City Official

Controller O'Connor submits the following resolution:-

1000

April 29th, 1914.

Council

That the matter of the appointment, qualification, classification, maximum and minimum salaries, yearly increases, promotion and duties of permanent and temporary officials and employees of the City and the adequacy of the present staff, be referred to a special committee of the City Council consisting of three Controllers and four Aldermen, the committee to meet if possible to formulate a report upon which any necessary legislation can be applied for during the present legislative session.

Moved by Controller O'Connor, seconded by Controller Harris, and passed.

The Board adjourned.

J. M. J.
Mayor.

L. F. D. Donovan
City Clerk.

1001.