



Zwicker Zareski Architecture + Planning

1 Canal Street, Dartmouth NS B2Y 2W1 | 902 266 5481 | connor@zzap.ca

May 11, 2020

Tyson Simms  
Planner III | Policy & Strategic Initiatives | Urban Plan Amendments  
Planning & Development  
Halifax Regional Municipality  
40 Alderney Drive  
Halifax, NS B3J 3A5

**Re: Case 20761 – Supplementary Design Rationale**

Tyson,

On behalf of our client, ZZap Consulting Inc. (ZZap) is pleased to submit supplementary design rationale for Case 20761 to enable the consideration of a high-density mixed-use development at 1377 and 1389 Robie Street, PID 00473009, PID 00472993, 5949, 5963, 5969, 5977, 5989, 5991 and 5993 College Street, 1452 and 1456 Carlton Street, Halifax. To support this application, the following materials are included:

- Appendix A: Site Plans
- Appendix B: Preliminary Landscape Plans
- Appendix C: Building Drawings
- Appendix D: Shadow Study
- Appendix E: Traffic Impact Study

Policy 13.3.1 of the Halifax MPS enables Halifax and West Community Council to consider a development agreement on the subject properties. There are certain criteria that council must consider when assessing such an application, and that proposed developments must adhere to. Please refer to Table 1 below, which outlines the applicable criteria that must be considered for an applicant of this nature, as well as our response as an applicant outlining how the proposed development meets the criteria.

Table 1 MPS Policy Table

POLICY	APPLICANT RESPONSE
<p><b>13.3.1</b> The Land Use By-law for Halifax Peninsula shall be amended to identify that mixed-use development may be considered by development agreement for the properties on Robie Street, College Street and Carlton Street, that are shown on Site B of Map A of this Section.</p> <p><b>(1)</b> Notwithstanding other policies of this Municipal Planning Strategy except 13.3.1(2), a development agreement, for the lands identifies as Site B on Map A of this Section, shall:</p>	
<p><b>(a)</b> permit a mixed-used (residential, commercial) building;</p>	<p>The proposed building includes a mix of residential and commercial uses</p>
<p><b>(b)</b> require that a proposal is a comprehensive plan for the development of all lands identified as Site B (Case 20761), as shown on Map A, and includes phasing of the development;</p>	<p>The proposed development is comprehensively planned through a two-phased approach.</p> <p>Phase 1 includes the alteration, relocation and registration of four separate heritage buildings to the east of the heritage line. All four existing buildings are planned to be connected through links, allowing for the adaptive reuse of these buildings into an interconnected multiple unit residential development.</p> <p>Phase 2 includes a high-density mixed-use development to the west of the heritage line outlined on Map A of the Halifax MPS</p>

<p><b>(c)</b> in accordance with the approval of substantial alterations granted by Regional Council on January 29, 2019, the properties identified as 1452 Carlton Street, 1456 Carlton Street, 5969 College Street and 5963 College Street, shall be altered, relocated and registered, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018, titled <i>Case H00456: Substantial Alterations to municipally registered heritage properties at 5969 College Street and 1452 &amp; 1456 Carlton Street, Halifax;</i></p>	<p>Properties 1452 Carlton Street, 1456 Carlton Street, 5969 College Street and 5963 College Street, are proposed to be altered, relocated and registered, as outlined in the staff report dated November 9, 2018, titled <i>Case H00456: Substantial Alterations to municipally registered heritage properties at 5969 College Street and 1452 &amp; 1456 Carlton Street, Halifax.</i></p>
<p><b>(d)</b> restrict development located west of the Heritage Line (as shown on Map A) to a maximum Floor Area Ratio of 8.0. Lot area(s) associated with 1452 Carlton Street and 1456 Carlton Street, or any lands located east of the Heritage Line (as identified on Map A), shall not be included as part of the total lot area calculation;</p>	<p>All development located to the west of the heritage line has a Floor Area Ratio of 8.0. Lot area associated with 1452 Carlton Street and 1456 Carlton Street, or any lands located east of the Heritage Line are not included as part of the total lot area calculation.</p>
<p><b>(e)</b> restrict building height to a maximum of 90 metres, excluding rooftop features;</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix C. The proposed development does not exceed the maximum height of 90 metres, excluding rooftop features.</p>
<p><b>(f)</b> notwithstanding Policy 13.3.1(1)(e), require that the development conforms with the Citadel Rampart requirements;</p>	<p>The development conforms with the Citadel Rampart requirements</p>
<p><b>(g)</b> restrict the height, coverage and setback of building rooftop features;</p>	<p>Proposed rooftop features in Phase 2 are set back from the roofs edge to mitigate their visual impact.</p>
<p><b>(h)</b> require that the proposed building podium be setback a minimum of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>i.</b> 6 metres from any registered heritage property or any property boundary facing East (Carlton Street); and</li> <li><b>ii.</b> 1.5 metres from any streetline.</li> </ul>	<p>Please refer to Appendix A</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>i.</b> The proposed building in Phase 2 is setback 6m from any registered heritage property and any property facing east (Carlton Street)</li> <li><b>ii.</b> The proposed building in Phase 2 is setback from all street lines at least 1.5m</li> </ul>
<p><b>(i)</b> require that any portion of the mixed-use development, located above the streetwall or building podium, be setback a minimum of:</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix A</p>

<p><b>i.</b> 6.5 metres from the edge of the building podium facing East (Carlton Street); and</p> <p><b>ii.</b> 4.5 metres from the edge of any streetwall;</p>	<p><b>i.</b> The proposed building in Phase 2 includes a stepback of 7.6m from the edge of the building podium facing East (Carlton Street)</p> <p><b>ii.</b> The proposed building in Phase 2 includes streetwall stepbacks of 4.5m along all streets</p>
<p><b>(j)</b> require that any portion of the mixed-use development, located above the streetwall or building podium, be setback a minimum of 11.5 metres from the north property line;</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix A</p> <p>All portions of the building in Phase 2 that are located above the streetwall or podium are setback 11.5m from the north property line</p>
<p><b>(k)</b> require a minimum separation distance of 23 metres between any towers;</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix A</p> <p>The proposed building in Phase 2 includes two towers that are separated by 23.5m (77.1 ft.)</p>
<p><b>(l)</b> restrict the floor area of any tower to a maximum of 750 square metres per floor;</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix A</p> <p>The proposed building in Phase 2 includes two towers, each of which have a floorplate equal to or less than 750m<sup>2</sup> (8,072.93 ft.<sup>2</sup>)</p>
<p><b>(m)</b> restrict streetwall height to a maximum of:</p> <p><b>i.</b> 16 metres along Robie Street;</p> <p><b>ii.</b> 13 metres along College Street; and</p> <p><b>iii.</b> Notwithstanding Policy 13.3.1(1)(m)(ii), 16 metres along College Street, for a total distance of 18.5 metres travelling east from Robie Street;</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix C</p> <p><b>i.</b> Proposed max. streetwall height along Robie Street is 11m (36ft.)</p> <p><b>ii.</b> Proposed max. streetwall height on College Street is 10m (33ft.)</p> <p><b>iii.</b> Proposed max. streetwall height for a total distance of 18.5m travelling east from Robie Street is 11m (36ft.)</p>
<p><b>(n)</b> restrict building podium heights to a maximum of:</p> <p><b>(i)</b> 13 metres facing East (Carlton Street); and</p> <p><b>(ii)</b> 16 metres facing North (Spring Garden Road);</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix C</p> <p><b>i.</b> Proposed max. podium height facing east is 10m (33ft.)</p> <p><b>ii.</b> Proposed max. podium height facing north is 11m (36ft.)</p>

<b>(o)</b> require a mix of residential unit types;	Phase 1 and Phase 2 of the proposed development include a mix of bachelor, one bedroom, two bedroom and three+ bedroom residential units.
<b>(p)</b> require a landscaped buffer and fencing along the East lot line or any property boundaries which abut a registered heritage property;	The proposed development within Phase 2 has a 6m wide side yard facing the east lot line that includes a combination of hard landscaping and opaque fencing along the eastern lot line.
<b>(q)</b> require indoor and outdoor amenity space for on-site residents;	The following outdoor amenity space is provided: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Exterior garden terrace for Phase 1</li> <li>- Outdoor courtyard between the Phase 2 building and college street</li> <li>- Outdoor courtyard at the interior of Phase 2</li> </ul>
<b>(r)</b> permit ground floor commercial uses along Robie Street and College Street however, ground floor commercial uses along College Street shall only be located in close proximity (within 18.5 metres) to Robie Street;	Ground floor commercial uses are proposed along the entire Robie Street frontage (excluding residential lobby entrances).  Ground floor commercial uses along College Street are located within 18.5m of Robie Street.
<b>(s)</b> regulate streetwall massing, external building design, cladding materials, design of at-grade residential units, front yard landscaping, outdoor storage, signage, and the planting of vegetation; and	The proposed streetwalls and building podium facing east for Phase 2 includes commercial units and townhouse units with at-grade entries. The streetwall and podium include fine-scale architectural detailing through projections, recesses and material changes.
<b>(t)</b> permit indoor / underground parking.	Parking is located indoors/underground.
<b>(2)</b> In addition to meeting the requirements of Policy 13.3.1(1) a) to t) inclusive, when considering a development agreement for the property located on Robie Street, College Street and Carlton Street, Halifax, Council shall consider:	
<b>(a)</b> the planning principles of transition, pedestrian-oriented, human-scale, building design and context sensitive, as described in Section 2; and	<b>Transition:</b> The proposed building design in Phase 2 includes a 6m setback from the heritage properties to the east, and a 7.6m stepback from the eastern edge of the building podium. Therefore, the high-rise portions of the building are setback 13.6m from the heritage properties to the east, creating an appropriate transition to surrounding built forms

	<p><b>Human Scale:</b> The proposed Phase 2 development is oriented towards Robie Street and College Street through a 1.5m streetwall setback and a 3-4 storey streetwall height, creating a human scaled streetwall experience.</p> <p><b>Building Design:</b> The proposed building design for Phase 2 includes fine-scale architectural detailing through projections, recesses, and materials changes. The tower design includes modulation of building massing (i.e. smaller floorplates in the upper storeys) and recesses / projections to reduce its apparent scale.</p> <p><b>Context Sensitive:</b> The proposed building in Phase 2 includes a variety of built form setbacks, stepbacks, projections, recesses and materials to ensure the siting of the building and design of the building are compatible with and do not adversely impact its surrounding context.</p>
<p><b>(b)</b> the provision of appropriate changes in building size and massing, to create appropriate transitions to surrounding built forms.</p>	<p>The proposed building design in Phase 2 includes a 6m setback from the heritage properties to the east, and a 7.6m stepback from the eastern edge of the building podium. Therefore, the high-rise portions of the building are setback 13.6m from the heritage properties to the east, creating an appropriate transition to surrounding built forms.</p>
<p><b>(c)</b> the design of at-grade residential units that balance residents' privacy with the desire for attractive and transparent streetwalls;</p>	<p>The proposed streetwall and building podium facing east for Phase 2 includes townhouse units with at-grade entries. The design includes fine-scale architectural detailing through projections, recesses and materials changes. The residential entries are located slightly above the grade of the street to ensure privacy for residents.</p>

<p><b>(d)</b> that the proposed development is oriented toward Robie Street and College Street;</p>	<p>The proposed Phase 2 development is oriented towards Robie Street and College Street through a 1.5m streetwall setback, creating a human scaled streetwall experience. The development includes a small landscaped courtyard between the building and College Street to emphasize the building entrance and create variety for the pedestrian experience.</p>
<p><b>(e)</b> that the design of ground floor commercial units along Robie Street and a portion of College Street complement a commercial streetscape, through the provision of commercial units with large, transparent windows and at-grade entrances opening onto the sidewalk;</p>	<p>The proposed building in Phase 2 includes ground floor commercial units along Robie Street and a portion of College Street. The building design complements a commercial streetscape, through the provision of commercial units with large, transparent windows and at-grade entrances opening onto the sidewalk</p>
<p><b>(f)</b> that the design of driveways and garage entrances minimizes their impact on pedestrians and on the streetscape, by minimizing their size, by setting garage doors back from the street and by using screening or architectural finishes as appropriate.</p>	<p>The driveway accesses in Phase 2 are oriented to the northwest and southeast corners of the site and are designed to minimum size. The access to underground parking is recessed from the street to ensure pedestrian safety.</p>
<p><b>(g)</b> consider environmental factors, including sun/shadow and wind conditions are suitable for in the intended use of the site;</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix D</p> <p>We plan to provide a wind impact study following preliminary review and comment from HRM staff.</p>
<p><b>(h)</b> consider the implementation of controls to reduce conflict with any adjacent or nearby land use(s) by reason of traffic generation, access to and egress from the site and parking; and</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix E</p>
<p><b>(i)</b> Policy CH-16 of the Regional Municipal Planning Strategy, which provides guidance for development abutting heritage properties, and all applicable heritage policies as may be amended from time to time.</p>	<p>See Table 2</p>

In addition to the applicable policies contained within the Halifax MPS, the proposed development must also be assessed against Policy CH-16 of the Regional Municipal

Planning Strategy (RMPS). Policy CH-16 is applicable to developments abutting registered heritage properties. Please refer to Table 2 below, which outlines the Policy CH-16 criteria that must be considered for an application of this nature, as well as our response as an applicant outlining how the proposed development meets the criteria.

Table 2 RMPS Policy Table

POLICY	APPLICANT RESPONSE
<p><b>CH-16</b> For lands abutting federally, provincially or municipally registered heritage properties, HRM shall, when reviewing applications for development agreements, rezonings and amendments pursuant to secondary planning strategies, or when reviewing the provision of utilities for said lands, consider a range of design solutions and architectural expressions that are compatible with the abutting federally, provincially or municipally registered heritage properties by considering the following:</p>	<p>The subject property for this development application (PID: 00142935) is a municipality registered heritage property that has a registered heritage building.</p>
<p><b>(a)</b> the careful use of materials, colour, proportion, and the rhythm established by surface and structural elements should reinforce those same aspects of the existing buildings;</p>	<p>The proposed streetwall and building podium facing east for Phase 2 includes fine-scale architectural detailing through projections, recesses and material changes that reinforce similar aspects of the abutting heritage resources.</p>
<p><b>(b)</b> ensuring that new development is visually compatible with yet distinguishable from the abutting registered heritage property. To accomplish this, an appropriate balance must be struck between mere imitation of the abutting building and pointed contrast, thus complementing the abutting registered heritage property in a manner that respects its heritage value;</p>	<p>For Phase 2 - The proposed streetwall massing, external building design along College Street and along the building podium facing east, cladding materials, design of at-grade residential units and front/side yard landscaping complements the abutting registered heritage properties in a manner that respects its heritage value.</p> <p>The scale, proportion, and design of the streetwall and podium of the Phase 2 building is similar to that of the abutting heritage resources, however it is not an imitation. The Phase 2 building includes more modern interpretation of the scale, proportion and rhythm of the abutting heritage resources, creating compatibility and contrast.</p>

<p><b>(c)</b> ensuring that new developments respect the building scale, massing, proportions, profile and building character of abutting federally, provincially or municipally registered heritage structures by ensuring that they:</p> <p><b>(i)</b> incorporate fine-scaled architectural detailing and human-scaled building elements.</p> <p><b>(ii)</b> reinforce, the structural rhythm (i.e., expression of floor lines, structural bays, etc.) of abutting federally, provincially or municipally registered heritage properties; and</p> <p><b>(iii)</b> any additional building height proposed above the pedestrian realm mitigate its impact upon the pedestrian realm and abutting registered heritage properties by incorporating design solutions, such as stepbacks from the street wall and abutting registered heritage properties, modulation of building massing, and other methods of massing articulation using horizontal or vertical recesses or projections, datum lines, and changes in material, texture or colour to help reduce its apparent scale;</p>	<p><b>(i)</b> the proposed streetwall and building podium facing east for Phase 2 includes townhouse units with at-grade entries. The streetwall and podium include fine-scale architectural detailing through projections, recesses and material changes.</p> <p><b>(ii)</b> the proposed streetwall and podium for Phase 2 that abuts the registered heritage properties to the east is compatible in terms of scale, height and proportion to the structural rhythm and bays of the heritage buildings.</p> <p><b>(iii)</b> for Phase 2, the proposed tower above the streetwall/podium is stepped back significantly from the street (4.5m) and from the podium edge (7.6m). The tower design also includes modulation of building massing (i.e. smaller floorplates in the upper storeys) and recesses / projections to reduce its apparent scale.</p>
<p><b>(d)</b> the siting of new developments such that their footprints respect the existing development pattern by:</p> <p><b>(i)</b> physically orienting new structures to the street in a similar fashion to existing federally, provincially or municipally registered heritage structures to preserve a consistent street wall; and</p>	<p><b>(i)</b> for Phase 2, the proposed podium levels of the building are oriented towards College street to create a human scaled streetwall experience that is compatible and consistent with abutting heritage resources.</p>

<p><b>(ii)</b> respecting the existing front and side yard setbacks of the street or heritage conservation district including permitting exceptions to the front yard requirements of the applicable land use by-laws where existing front yard requirements would detract from the heritage values of the streetscape;</p>	<p><b>(ii)</b> the front yard setback of the proposed building in Phase 2 along College Street (1.5m) is compatible with the front yards of abutting heritage resources that are also within proximity to College Street. The side yard of the Phase 2 building (6m) provides adequate separation distance to ensure appropriate transition between the abutting heritage resources and the new development.</p>
<p><b>(e)</b> not unreasonably creating shadowing effects on public spaces and heritage resources;</p>	<p>Please refer to Appendix D</p> <p>The proposed Phase 2 building does not unreasonably create shadowing effects on public spaces or heritage resources</p>
<p><b>(f)</b> complementing historic fabric and open space qualities of the existing streetscape;</p>	<p>Properties 1452 Carlton Street, 1456 Carlton Street, 5969 College Street and 5963 College Street, are proposed to be altered, relocated and registered, as outlined in the staff report dated November 9, 2018, titled <i>Case H00456: Substantial Alterations to municipally registered heritage properties at 5969 College Street and 1452 &amp; 1456 Carlton Street, Halifax.</i></p> <p>These alterations allow for the restoration of the subject heritage buildings and help to maintain qualities of the existing Carlton and College Streetscapes.</p>
<p><b>(g)</b> minimizing the loss of landscaped open space;</p>	<p>Phases 2 is designed to increase the amount of landscaped open space within the subject properties beyond what exists today.</p>
<p><b>(h)</b> ensuring that parking facilities (surface lots, residential garages, stand-alone parking and parking components as part of larger developments) are compatible with abutting federally, provincially or municipally registered heritage structures;</p>	<p>All parking within Phase 2 is located underground, ensuring compatibility with abutting heritage resources.</p>

<p><b>(i)</b> placing utility equipment and devices such as metering equipment, transformer boxes, power lines, and conduit equipment boxes in locations which do not detract from the visual building character or architectural integrity of the heritage resource;</p>	<p>Such equipment within the proposed development will be strategically located as to not detract from the visual character or architectural integrity of the surrounding heritage resources.</p>
<p><b>(j)</b> having the proposal meet the heritage considerations of the appropriate Secondary Planning Strategy, as well as any applicable urban design guidelines; and</p>	<p>The objective of the Heritage Policies under the Halifax MPS is "The preservation and enhancement of areas, sites, structures, streetscapes and conditions in Halifax which reflect the City's past historically and/or architecturally." The policy criteria speak to preserving heritage properties through heritage designation, and ensuring development that will impact heritage resources is sensitive and complementary.</p> <p>The anticipated impact of the proposed development in Phase 2 on the heritage context is limited. The proposed design enables the protection of abutting heritage properties by including appropriate separation between any proposed development, appropriate scaled streetwall massing, compatible external building design and compatible building materials.</p>
<p><b>(k)</b> any applicable matter as set out in Policy G-14 of this Plan.</p>	<p>Policy G-14 (pertaining to Regional Plan amendments requiring subsequent amendments to other planning documents for consistency), does not apply in this case.</p>

Closing

Should you have any questions, comments, or concerns with regards to this supplementary design rationale, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Sincerely,

*Connor Wallace*

Connor Wallace, MCIP, LPP  
Urban Planner  
ZZap Consulting Inc.  
connor@zzap.ca  
902-266-5481