



P.O. Box 1749
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 3A5 Canada

Halifax Regional Council
March 27, 2018

TO: Mayor Savage and Members of Halifax Regional Council

Original Signed by 

SUBMITTED BY: Jacques Dubé, Chief Administrative Officer

DATE: March 6, 2018

SUBJECT: Afghanistan Conflict Dates on Halifax Cenotaph

ORIGIN

October 3, 2017 Regional Council Motion:

Moved by Deputy Mayor Mason and seconded by Councillor Karsten that Halifax Regional Council request a staff report regarding feasibility and options, in consultation with the Canadian Legion, Canadian Forces and Veterans Affairs, for placing the dates for the Afghanistan conflict on the front of the Halifax Cenotaph, including the potential to allow space for additional dates should circumstances require it in the future.
Motion Put and Passed.

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Halifax Regional Municipality Charter, Section 79 (1) The Council may expend money required by the Municipality for, ... (ai) public grounds, squares, halls, museums, parks, tourist information centres and community centres;

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that Halifax Regional Council:

1. Decline to add new dates to the front of the Cenotaph in order to protect the heritage value of the memorial;
2. Direct that any future war commemorations be incised at the rear of the Cenotaph in keeping with the status quo protocol established with the World War II and Korea inscriptions and continued in 2015 with the Afghanistan inscription; and
3. Acknowledge that the commemorative bronze text on the front of the Cenotaph, "In Honour of those who served. In memory of those who fell", honours all those who serve in any capacity and at any time.

BACKGROUND

Halifax Cenotaph

The Cenotaph in Grand Parade was constructed as a World War I memorial through the efforts of the War Memorial Committee. The Committee consisted of members of several Halifax Societies and City of Halifax Aldermen. The Cenotaph was designed by Massey Rhind and was unveiled in 1929. Funding for the construction was derived from citizen donations, Committee fund-raising efforts and a grant from the City of Halifax. The granite is Nova Scotian and the original elements are all cast bronze. The central sculptural figure can be considered the focus of the front of the Cenotaph (Attachment 1).

Since 1929, the Cenotaph in Grand Parade has served as Halifax's main war memorial. The City of Halifax and now, Halifax Regional Municipality, has been the steward and owner. The location, governance and maintenance of the Cenotaph has been the responsibility of the municipality. In cases where a memorial is considered to have significant heritage value, such as the Halifax Cenotaph, *the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places*, can be used as a guiding document for ensuring that commemorative interventions are careful and balanced and that the heritage value of the memorial is protected. It should be noted that these guidelines were used as the foundation for the 2009 restoration project, funded in part through Veteran's Affairs.

The Veteran's Affairs National Inventory of Memorials lists 873 war memorials in Nova Scotia, with 204 located in Halifax Regional Municipality. These range from books of remembrance and honour rolls to buildings to cairns and cenotaphs, and most have a unique owner or steward. Many of these were created in response to World War I. With every subsequent war and conflict, the stewards of the memorials have approached new commemorations in a variety of ways and on an ad hoc basis. There has not been a National protocol or standard for commemorative interventions, mainly due to this wide range of ownership and stewardship of memorials.

In 2011, the Canadian Government announced that they would be adding dates of the Afghanistan Conflict and the South African War to the National War Memorial in Ottawa. This decision was met with some backlash from the Royal Canadian Legion (RCL) and other stakeholders, partly as there were still troops deployed in Afghanistan in 2011. In 2014, the two conflict dates were added to the National War Memorial. Additionally, the text: "In Service to Canada" was added to the front of the memorial arch base in both official languages. The text seems to follow the advice from the RCL that new commemorations should take into account all those who served, regardless of a lack of active duty in a conflict. The phrase, "In Service to Canada" reflects the language used in the Seventh Book of Remembrance, located in the Peace Tower, Ottawa. (The 1929 bronze text of the Grand Parade Cenotaph closely mirrors the inclusive commemorative statement: "In honour of those who served. In memory of those who fell.")

DISCUSSION

The Cenotaph in Grand Parade includes commemorations to a number of conflicts. The details of each are as follows:

World War I:

The original elements of the 1929 Cenotaph pertain to World War I and are listed in the manner they appear on the monument below:

Front: Bronze Coat of Arms of Nova Scotia; Bronze figure "Motherhood" with shield depicting Coat of Arms of City of Halifax; Bronze text: IN HONOUR OF THOSE WHO SERVED IN MEMORY OF THOSE WHO FELL; Bronze conflict dates: 1914 1918

Rear: Bronze Coat of Arms of Canada; Bronze text: IN THE CITY ARCHIVES ARE TREASURED THE NAMES OF THIRTEEN HUNDRED AND SIXTY MEN AND WOMEN WHOSE SACRIFICE IS PERPETUATED BY THIS MEMORIAL

Top: Large laurel wreath

West Side: Bronze text: SOMME VIMY YPRES HILL 70 PASSCHENDAELE; Bronze laurel wreath

East Side: Bronze text: AMIENS ARRAS CANAL DU NORD CAMBRAI; Bronze laurel wreath

World War II:

After World War II, the Cenotaph was rededicated and several inscriptions were added. Instead of adding bronze text, the World War II inscriptions were incised in the granite in a font similar to the 1929 bronze text. The rededication/inscription date is not known.

The World War II inscriptions include:

Front: Incised conflict dates: 1939 1945 (located beneath the WWI dates)

Rear: Incised text above Bronze Coat of Arms: BATTLE OF BRITAIN SICILY LANDINGS GOTHIC LINE FALAISE GAP BATTLE OF THE ATLANTIC ORTONA NORMANDY LANDING BATTLE OF SCHELDT BATTLE OF RHINELAND THE RHINE CROSSING;

Incised text below bronze text: ALSO IN MEMORY OF THOSE WHO DIED IN THE SECOND WORLD WAR.

Korean War:

After the Korean War, an inscription was incised on the rear of the Cenotaph below the World War II inscription, following the protocol established with the World War II inscription. The rededication/inscription date is not known. The Korean War inscription reads: AND IN KOREA 1950-1953

The Cenotaph was not altered again until 1985. The matter of adding dates of the Korean War to the front of the Cenotaph was raised in Halifax City Council when the Korean Veterans Association requested that Council add the Korean War conflict dates to the front of the Cenotaph. Council minutes from that meeting state:

"A short discussion ensued with regard to who was had authority over the monument and it was MOVED by Deputy Mayor O'Malley, seconded by Alderman Nolan that City Council take the necessary steps to make the appropriate inscription on the cenotaph providing that there was no impediment to the City taking such action."

On July 1986, the Council minutes state:

"Responding to a question from Alderman O'Malley, Mr. P. S. Connell, Director of Engineering and Works, advised that the requested dates would be added to the cenotaph in commemoration of the Korean Conflict within the next several weeks in time for the scheduled veterans' reunion."

As a result, bronze dates (1950 – 1953) were added to the front façade, beneath the World War II inscription in 1986.

Afghanistan:

In 2015, a motion of Regional Council directed staff to investigate adding appropriate Afghanistan commemoration to the Cenotaph. Staff engaged the services of a consultant to prepare a scope of work for the commemoration. The recommendations of the consultant were informed by discussions with the federal Department of Veteran's Affairs (Commemoration Branch, Ottawa). The resulting scope of work recommended that the inscription be placed on the rear of the cenotaph, following the established protocol

of inscribing the conflict name and dates. The assessment stated that while conflict dates could be added to the front, they could be visually distracting, as they would be quite close to the main sculptural figure. As a result, The Afghanistan Conflict inscription was added to the rear and reads: AND IN AFGHANISTAN 2001 – 2014.

Recommended Protocol

In developing this report, staff contacted the Nova Scotia Legion, Department of National Defence Heritage and History Directorate and Veteran's Affairs to seek information on processes for commemorations. Veteran's Affairs stated that the approach on commemorations was dependent on the memorial and ownership and suggested that the National War Memorial and Official Books of Remembrance protocol in the Peace Tower could be considered the exemplar of commemorative interventions. Those protocols include commemorating the most significant, recognized conflicts and wars and using the language "In Service to Canada" as an all-encompassing commemoration for those who have served outside of the major wars and conflicts. However, those protocols do not provide guidance on specific method of the commemoration. The Nova Scotia Legion echoed the Veteran's Affairs statement that there is no general protocol for adding new commemorations.

In revisiting the approach undertaken in 2015, staff have held renewed conversations with veterans groups and relevant governmental agencies, and have conducted national scans to better understand protocol related to this type of commemoration. No new information or precedent has emerged from that research that would alter staff's 2015 assessment and the resulting protocol implemented at that time.

There are three approaches that HRM can consider with respect to the placement of the dates related to Afghanistan on the front of the Cenotaph:

1. Status Quo: No additional Changes
2. Add Dates to the Front of the Cenotaph
3. Add Dates to the West or East Façades

Status Quo: No Additional Changes

In 2015, staff recommended that the optimal commemoration for the Afghanistan War was to add an inscription below the other commemorative inscriptions on the rear façade and to not add dates to the front façade. The rationale was that the inscription on the rear followed the protocol established with prior commemorations, while protecting the heritage value of the front façade by not making further interventions. It was felt that the addition of the Afghanistan dates to the front of the Cenotaph would encroach on the central sculptural figure, "Motherhood" and could detract from that main sculptural element and original intent. The protocol also outlined that if future commemorations were required, then inscriptions would follow the protocol on the rear façade, where there is ample room.

Add Dates to the Front of the Cenotaph

This would entail having the 2001 – 2014 cast or cut in bronze, in a similar font and size to the WWI and Korea dates and installing them below the Korea dates. For contextual purposes, Attachment 2 shows what the Cenotaph would look like with the proposed dates incised on it. While there is space to accommodate these dates, they would encroach the central figure, thereby detracting from the main sculptural figure and negatively impact the heritage value of the memorial. As well, they would be the last dates that could be added to the front façade due to lack of space.

Add Dates to the West or East Façades

This would entail having the 2001 – 2014 dates cast or cut in bronze and installing them on one of the sides, below the original World War I bronze text depicting battles. There is risk that the new dates could be construed as pertaining to the World War I battles and not the Afghanistan conflict. Adding bronze dates to one of the side façades would allow room for the addition of future commemorative dates if required.

Based on the protocol undertaken in 2015 and the consultations, it is recommended that the current commemoration of Afghanistan conflict be maintained and no further changes be made to the Cenotaph. Further, it is also recommended that any future commemorations be incised on the rear façades as indicated in the status quo protocol established with the World War II and Korea inscriptions and continued in 2015 with the Afghanistan inscription.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Should Regional Council approve the recommendation as outlined, there would be no financial implications. If Regional Council directs that additional dates be added to Cenotaph, the estimated cost would be \$12,000, which could be absorbed within capital account CD990003, Cultural Spaces.

RISK CONSIDERATION

There are no significant risks associated with the recommendations in this report. The risks considered rate Low. To reach this conclusion, consideration was given to financial, cultural/heritage and reputational risk.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

No community engagement was completed in preparation of this report.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS

None identified.

ALTERNATIVES

- Alternative 1: Regional Council could direct staff to add new, bronze dates for Afghanistan (2001 – 2014) to the front of the Cenotaph.
- Alternative 2: Regional Council could direct staff to add new, bronze dates for Afghanistan (2001 – 2014) to the west side of the memorial. All future conflict dates would be added to this west façade.

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 - Halifax Cenotaph Elevation Images
Attachment 2 - Context Rendering of Cenotaph Showing Potential Placement Afghanistan Dates

A copy of this report can be obtained online at halifax.ca or by contacting the Office of the Municipal Clerk at 902.490.4210.

Report Prepared by: Kellie McIvor, Cultural Asset Manager 902-490-1955

Afghanistan Conflict Dates on Halifax Cenotaph

Attachment 1 – Halifax Cenotaph Elevation Images



Front Elevation



East Elevation



Rear Elevation



West Elevation

Afghanistan Conflict Dates on Halifax Cenotaph

Attachment 2 - Context Rendering of Cenotaph Showing Potential Placement Afghanistan Dates

The 2001 and 2014 dates have been digitally added to depict the placement of the potential Afghanistan dates. The other dates have not been altered.

